FINAL REPORT

PROJECT TITLE: Evaluation of the Firelight Foundation Initiative to End Child Marriage in Shinyanga Region, Tanzania

SUBMITTED TO

FIREFLIGHT FOUNDATION

BY

THE AFRICHILD CENTRE

November 2018

Disclaimer by Firelight:

Firelight reviewed the report and removed sensitive statements that are confidential and any statements that cannot be validated. Furthermore, the views and opinions expressed in this report are those of the consultants and do not necessarily reflect or represent the views and opinions held by Firelight.
FOREWORD

Firelight Foundation (FF) has since 2015 been working with twelve community based organizations (CBOs) to end child marriage in Shinyanga Region, Tanzania. Child marriage in Shinyanga was estimated to be 59 percent at the start of the Firelight Foundation Initiative. The problem of child marriage in Shinyanga was largely associated with negative social cultural norm practices and poverty. Child marriage negatively affects the health, development and participation of the girl child threatening the attainment of her life potentials and sustainable development goals (SDGs).

Firelight Foundation has been engaged in strengthening the capacities of existing Community Based Organizations (CBOs) to effectively and efficiently prevent and respond to child marriage, sexual exploitation and abuse prevalent in communities. The CBOs have created awareness on child rights and the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies. Parents have been equipped with skills in good parenting and children acquired life-skills to protect themselves. Children who were victims of early marriage were rescued by the CBOs and sent back to school. Additionally, FF has networked CBOs with government child protection structures and supported them with grants to reach out to the communities to fight child marriage. The goal of these efforts was to enable children to “realize the fulfillment of their rights and potential within a safe, caring and protective environment”.

FF commissioned AfriChild to conduct a process evaluation of the Initiative to assess and document implementation progress, achievements, challenges, and emerging unmet child protection needs that should be addressed in the next phase. AfriChild is delighted to present the evaluation findings in this report. AfriChild greatly appreciates the opportunity given to her to participate and contribute to Firelight Foundation’s program to end child marriage in Shinyanga.

This evaluation constitutes a scientific review of FF’s activities, approaches, service delivery and their likely effects at community level. The evaluation was done following appropriate scientific processes, design, methods and ethics. The evaluation exercise involved participation of CBO staff and board members, local government staff, child protection teams, community members and children in and out of school.

The evidence presented in this report can, therefore, be relied upon to guide strategic rethinking of program design and delivery approaches in the coming phase. The report provides evidence on all the evaluation questions. The findings are presented in a step by step logical manner enabling conclusions and action points to emerge.

Significant progress was attained in many areas which Firelight Foundation and her partner CBOs engaged in. The capacity building of CBOs improved their organizational capacities to manage themselves and offer quality child protection services. Some improved their status from a CBO status to a non-governmental organizations with ability to obtain funding from other external donors and to serve in larger service catchment areas. These developments are attributable to the technical and financial support provided by FF. I take this opportunity to congratulate FF and her partners and particularly the lead partners who did the capacity building for the work well done!!
We recommend that all stakeholders should continue to address the problem of child marriage and eliminate it from Shinyanga. There is need to effectively address other determinants of child marriage such as poverty, the mind sets and economic reasoning driving child marriage. There is need to consolidate current achievements and scale up the program to more wards, villages, parents and schools. In particular, stakeholders should target other population groups including men and boys and out of school youths who were not effectively reached during the first phase of the Initiative. Additionally, Firelight should support CBOs to effectively document and share knowledge with each other in the next phase.

At this juncture, I wish to acknowledge with thanks AfriChild research team; Professor Rosalind G.N. Lubanga who led the Shinyanga Evaluation Team and her companion Mr. Mathew Amollo, Manager-Research. Thank you for a job well done.

It's my hope that all stakeholders will find this report usable for planning and programming. We look forward for continued collaboration with Firelight Foundation and her partners in the future.

Joyce Wanican - Executive Director, AfriChild.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER ONE: BACKGROUND TO THE EVALUATION</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. 0 Introduction</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. 1 Background on the Foundation and Initiative</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 About Shinyanga Region</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Child marriage in Shinyanga Region</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Sustainable Development Goals and Child Marriages</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Policy and legal environment for child protection in Tanzania</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.1 The Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania and The Marriages Act</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.2 The Child Act, (2009, 2011)</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.3 The Tanzania National Education Act 1978, and Child Marriage</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.4 The National Action Plan to End Violence against Women and children</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Overall Purpose of the Progress Evaluation</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Evaluation objectives</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 Evaluation Scope</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9. Key concepts in the Initiative and some definitions</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 Organization of the report</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER TWO: EVALUATION METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Evaluation design</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Evaluation criteria</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Evaluation participants</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Sampling procedures</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Data collection Methods</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Key evaluation Areas and questions</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Implementation strategy</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 Ethical Considerations</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 Data management, analysis and report writing</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10 Limitations</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER THREE: THE FIRELIGHT FOUNDATION PROGRAM

3.0 Introduction

3.1 Program goal and objectives (core outcomes)

3.2 Program theory

3.2.1 The child protection problem addressed by the Initiative

3.2.3 Program theory – the thinking that guided implementation

3.2.2 Assumptions Firelight Foundation and partners worked with

3.3 The Program Structure

3.3.1 The Firelight Foundation Staff

3.3.2 Lead partners

3.3.3 Community Based Organizations

3.3.3.1 The Governance boards of the CBOs

3.3.3.2 The volunteers – community based facilitators, community based mobilisers, and Secret informers

3.3.3.3 Agape Knowledge School

3.4 Some observations by the Evaluation Team

3.5 CBO geographical operational areas

3.6 Financing of CBO Activities

3.6.1 FF granting models and their conditions

3.6.2 Planning, budgeting, and adequacy of grants received by partners

3.6.3 CBO partner satisfaction with the granting models

3.6.4 Other granting/grantee challenges

3.7 Relationships between lead partners and CBOs

CHAPTER FOUR

PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION: CAPACITY BUILDING

4.0 Introduction

4.1 Capacity building of CBOs: Activities undertaken in relation to Program theory

4.2 Activities undertaken in preparation for capacity building

4.3 Planned and implemented capacity building activities

4.3 Activities undertaken in relation to Firelight Foundation desired competences
4.4 Processes of capacity building

4.4.1 Curriculum used in capacity building of FF Partner CBOs

4.4.2 Methods of training and training manuals used

4.4.3 Duration /dose of training by ICS

4.2.4 Trainers and their capacities

4.5 Achievements in capacity building

4.5.1 Persons trained

4.5.2 Reported organizational benefits from capacity building

4.5.2.1 Organizational growth and development

4.5.2.2 Ability of CBOs to obtain funding from several donors

4.5.2.3 CBO board members know their role and responsibilities and are supporting the CBOs

4.5.2.4 Improved staff confidence and ability to intervene at many levels

4.5.2.5 Improved parenting skills by CBO staff and parents

4.5.2.6 Development of CBO staff professionalism

4.5.2.7 ICS being a reference maker for other CBOs

4.6 Challenges in capacity building

4.7 Gaps in capacity building

4.8 Monitoring and evaluation of CBO capacity building

4.9 Best practices and lessons learnt in relation to capacity building

CHAPTER FIVE

PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION: DIRECT AND INDIRECT SERVICE DELIVERY

5.0 Introduction

5.1 Preliminary activities undertaken to guide planning and programming: Community dialogues

5.2 Interventions undertaken to end child marriage

5.3 Preventive services

5.3.1 Preventive activities with communities

5.3.1.1 Awareness creation of communities about child rights and the dangers of child marriages and teenage pregnancies

5.3.1.2 Preventive activities with families - Skilful Parenting

5.3.1.3 Preventive activities with families - Economic empowerment of poor families

5.4 Other observations made by the Evaluation Team on the preventive strategy in the communities
5.5 Preventive activities with children in schools ................................................................. 80
5.5.1 Issues school children were sensitized on and manuals used ............................... 80
5.5.2 Schools targeted by the Program ........................................................................ 81
5.5.3 The structures and approaches used to provide IEC to school children.............. 82
5.5.4 Training duration and dosage in schools ............................................................... 83
5.5.5 Monitoring and reporting of School Club activities ........................................... 84
5.5.6 Outcomes from the school based IEC interventions ........................................... 84
5.6 Other observations by the Evaluation Team on the school sub-program ............... 86
5.7 Response/ treatment of victims of child marriage .................................................... 87
5.7.1 The process of rescuing girls planned for marriage .............................................. 88
5.7.2 Resettlement and rehabilitation process ............................................................... 88
5.7.3 Response to child marriage and social justice ....................................................... 89
5.7.4 Reporting of sexual abuses and other child rights violations ......................... 89
5.7.5 Challenges of the response /treatment program of child marriage victims ......... 89
5.8 Some observations by the Evaluation Team on the Response sub-program ........... 89
5.9 Linkages with government child protection service delivery structures ............... 90
5.9.1 Working “with” government departments ......................................................... 91
5.9.2 Working “on” or strengthening government child protection structures .......... 91
5.9.3 Common child protection cases managed by CPCs .......................................... 93
5.9.4 Reported achievements from working with and on government child protection structures ..... 93
5.9.5 Some observation by the Evaluation Team .......................................................... 94
5.10 Advocacy .................................................................................................................. 94
5.10.1 Lobbying work done .......................................................................................... 94
5.10.2 Some observations by the Evaluation Team ....................................................... 95
5.11 Community participation in the FF initiative and experiences ......................... 95
5.11.1 Community members as service consumers ..................................................... 95
5.10.2 Community members as service providers ....................................................... 96
5.10.3 Community members as information providers ............................................... 96
5.10.3 Community participation and the reporting of child rights violations ............. 98
5.10.4 Challenges to effective community participation in the FF Initiative to end child marriage ..... 99
5.10.5 Monitoring of service delivery activities .......................................................... 100
5.10.6 Some observations done by the evaluation team .............................................. 100
CHAPTER SIX

OVERALL ACHIEVEMENTS, CHALLENGES, AND UNMET NEEDS

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Overall Achievements

6.2.1 Reduced child marriage and pregnancies

6.2.2 Increased sensitivity to child marriage problems and child abuse

6.2.3 Improved organizational development of the FF CBO partners

6.2.4 All CBOs implemented most of their planned activities

6.2.5 Increased and more effective community participation in program activities

6.2.6 There were concrete observable outputs from the implementation of the Initiative

6.2.7 FF CBO Partners have been able to influence policies and laws through advocacy work

6.3 Best practices and lessons learnt

6.4 Implementation Challenges

6.5 Emerging child protection needs

6.5.1 Emerging Child Protection Challenges and existing opportunities

6.5.1.1 Child marriage and pregnancy

6.5.1.2 Child Labour

6.5.1.3 Poor quality education - a risk factor for early marriage

6.5.1.4 Poverty

6.5.1.5 Sexual abuse of children

6.5.1.6 Gender based violence

6.5.1.7 Marital breakdowns and abandonment of children

6.5.1.8 Other child rights abuses

6.5.1.9 Unemployment of youths and need for vocational training

6.5.1.10 Water

6.5.2 Emerging issues in capacity building

6.5.3 Emerging issues in Direct and indirect service provision

6.5.3.1 Causes of child marriage not satisfactorily addressed

6.5.3.2 Population groups not satisfactorily reached by the Initiative

6.5.3.3 Issues not satisfactorily addressed during the awareness creation in communities

6.5.3.4 Service delivery structures – the use of government staff

6.5.3.5 Poor school infrastructures
6.5.3.6 Corruption by the public and police during the management of victims of child marriage.... 113
6.5.3.7 Development of communication technology and systems to enhance reporting of child abuse cases ........................................................................................................................................................................113
6.5.4 Program Processes ........................................................................................................................................................................................................113
6.5.5 Organizational and management issues ..................................................................................................................................................................................114
6.5.5.1 Villages and wards not yet reached with services by the CBOs ................................................................. 114
6.5.5.2 Other management issues ........................................................................................................................................................................................................114
CHAPTER SEVEN ........................................................................................................................................................................................................115
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ................................................................................................................................. 115
7.1 Evaluation Conclusions ................................................................................................................................................................................................115
7.1.1 Strengths of the program ................................................................................................................................................................................................115
7.1.2 Areas not well done ................................................................................................................................................................................................115
7.2 Evaluation Recommendations .................................................................................................................................................................................................116
References .................................................................................................................................................................................................................................118
INVESTING IN CHILDREN AND THEIR SOCIETIES (ICS) ............................................................................................................................... 121
AGAPE .................................................................................................................................................................................................................................123
TABLE OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Matrix 1: Selected “minimum performance wards” for community level interviews ...........................................30
Matrix 2: Selected “maximum performance wards” for community level interviews ...........................................31
Matrix 3: Key evaluation questions ..................................................................................................................33
Matrix 4: Characteristics of Firelight Foundation CBO Partners in Shinyanga Region, Tanzania ............ Error!
Bookmarks not defined.
Matrix 5: Goals and Objectives of the Firelight Foundation Partner CBOs .........................................................42
Table 1: Percentage coverage of geographical areas served by Firelight Foundation supported CBOs as of
August 2018 ..................................................................................................................................................47
Matrix 6: Competences addressed during the capacity building of CBOs .......................................................57
Matrix 7: Reported outputs from the capacity building sub-program ..................................................................62
Table 2: School coverage with preventive services to end child marriage by Firelight Foundation CBO
Partners ............................................................................................................................................................82
Table 3: The number of Child Protection Committees CBOs worked with at village level as by August 2018

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: Project Theory of Change for Firelight Foundation Initiative

APPENDIX B: Planned and implemented capacity building activities by the lead partners (as from 2015-2018)

APPENDIX C: Modules of ICS Skilful Parenting Program
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Evaluation Team wishes to express their gratitude first to the CBO staff and their board members who provided the necessary information for this evaluation without which this report would not have been produced. The staff spent whole days with the team answering questions and distilling information from documents. Some mobilized communities for the team to meet to verify reports. All CBO staff spent complete days participating in workshops to plan the exercise, verify the field reports, and validate the findings. All the children, community members, leaders, members of savings and loan groups who participated in this exercise are highly appreciated.

The team is indebted to the regional, district and municipality officials who supported the evaluation exercise by attending the verification and validation workshops. The Regional community development officer prepared a paper on the national action plan to end violence against women and children which helped the team to clearly understand the provisions of that important policy. The presence of the government officials did not only legitimatize the meetings and affirm ownership of the proceedings, but it assured the team that indeed the FF partner CBOs truly linked themselves with the government child protection departments.

Special thanks go to the staff of Investing in Children and their Societies (ICS) and particularly the Country Director (Mr. Kudely Sokoine), Programs Manager (Sabrina Majikata) and Finance officer (Mr. Telly Msongoleh) for doing the technical and non-technical tasks of the evaluation including organizing, transporting, mobilizing, coordinating, and supporting the evaluation team and exercise. ICS organized and actually transported the evaluation team from and to airports as well as within Shinyanga to collect data in their vehicle. It was also ICS which organised the Team’s accommodation. ICS mobilized the CBOs and government officials for the exercise as well as the three workshops thus enhancing participation and ownership of the exercise and its outputs by all stakeholders. ICS, you are not only a great capacity builder but also a great mobiliser and coordinator. Thanks. We thank the driver of ICS, Daudi for his humility and stamina to work for long hours without complaining and for driving the team safely to all evaluation locations.

Last but not least, the team is grateful to the Director of Evaluation and Learning at the FF headquarters, Dr. Sadaf Shallwani for her guidance during the many Skype meetings conducted prior the evaluation. The evaluation would not have taken off if she had not provided guidance and leadership. The team is indebted to Mrs. Tomaida Banda for the technical guidance and support given along the entire evaluation process from articulating the evaluation questions to conceptualization, write up of the inception report, development of data collection tools and actual data collection. We also thank Ronald Kimambo for the technical guidance and important monitoring and evaluation questions raised to effectively guide this evaluation. Thank you. God bless you all.

November, 2018
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CBO</td>
<td>Community Based Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHIDEP</td>
<td>Children on disability development program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPC</td>
<td>Child Protection Committees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAC</td>
<td>Development Assistance Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECD</td>
<td>Early childhood development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FF</td>
<td>Firelight Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focused Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICS</td>
<td>Investing in Children and their societies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEC</td>
<td>Information education and communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAP-VAWC</td>
<td>National Action Plan to end Violence against Women and Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODT</td>
<td>Organizational development tool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPE</td>
<td>Organization for People Empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWWCO</td>
<td>Promising World for Women and Children Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDGs</td>
<td>Sustainable development goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRHR</td>
<td>Sexuality and reproductive health and rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAI</td>
<td>Thubutu Africa Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDHS</td>
<td>Tanzania Demographic Health Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRCS</td>
<td>Tanzania Red Cross Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVMC</td>
<td>The Voice of the Marginalized Communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UPE</td>
<td>Universal Primary Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEADO</td>
<td>Women Elderly Advocacy Development Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWL</td>
<td>Young Women Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>Young Women Christian Association</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report presents findings of the progress evaluation of the Firelight Foundation (FF) Initiative to end child marriage in Shinyanga Region, Tanzania. The evaluation was undertaken in July 2018 by AfriChild, a child research Centre based in Kampala Uganda. The FF Initiative had been running for 4 years (since 2015) involving twelve community based organisations (CBOs) operating in Shinyanga.

The program aimed at reducing child marriage which stood at 59 percent at the start of the FF Initiative. The Initiative was supported by Firelight Foundation technically and financially through provision of annual grants. The Initiative had two arms to it: the capacity building arm and the service delivery arm. Capacity building was the core activity because FF believed that ending child marriage would occur through strengthening the capacities of existing community based organisations. The CBOs would in turn effectively and efficiently respond to child marriage, sexual exploitation and abuse in the communities they interfaced with. For the last four years, Firelight Foundation built CBO organizational and child protection capacity, networked them with government child protection structures, and supported them with grants to enable them reach out to the communities to fight child marriage. The goal of these efforts was to enable children to “realize the fulfillment of their rights and potential within a safe, caring and protective environment”.

The service delivery arm involved two strategies - a preventive and a rescue or treatment strategy. The CBOs created awareness in communities about the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies, equipped parents with skills for good parenting children; and sensitized people about child rights; taught children in schools about issue of sexual and reproductive health and rights. The service delivery arm aimed at holistically addressing the root causes of child marriage in the child, the families and communities as well as the child protection systems of government; thus each of these social systems were the targets for change.

The aims of this evaluation were: a) documenting the progress made by the Firelight Foundation CBO partners in implementing planned activities to end child marriage in Shinyanga; b) assess the changes at the community, CBO and lead partner level that can be attributed to Firelight Foundation support; c) identify indicators for monitoring, evaluation and learning framework for tracking under the next phase of FF’s Initiative in Shinyanga.

The process evaluation used a comparative retrospective design to explore community and organizational changes that might have occurred as a result of exposure to FF and partner interventions. Evaluation participants were asked to reflect on the conditions before and after exposure to FF and partner CBOs to determine changes. Qualitative methods were used to collect the information. These included document reviews, interviews with CBO staff and board members, and focus group discussions with community members – school children, child protection committee members and adults both men and women. All CBOs were visited and interviewed. Three workshops were conducted with various stakeholders one of which involved government officials including social welfare and community development officers, regional officers and child protection committee members. Initial findings were disseminated and validated in a third workshop which again involved all stakeholders.
Some of the key findings are: - there was progress in the implementation of the planned activities by all CBOs. All activities were implemented in accordance with the program theory and plans. Capacity building which was undertaken by Investing in Children and their Societies (ICS) and Agape was well done. Capacity building which addressed organizational management and child protection competences met critical operational needs of CBOs and was very well appreciated by all CBOs. It also had great impacts on the growth and development of CBOs. For example some acquired a status of NGO which increased their opportunities to seek and obtain funding from other donors. The training also professionalized many of the CBOs thus improving the quality of services offered by them.

Direct service delivery was undertaken in 67 wards out of the existing total 88 and 238 villages out of the existing 473 villages. These communities received awareness creation about the dangers of child marriage, and pregnancies, child rights. Some saving and credit groups received training in skillful parenting. Community awareness sessions addressed one important cause of child marriage – socio-cultural norms and traditions. Communities and parents who attended training sessions especially skillful parenting appreciated the knowledge and skills received.

Children from poor families received scholastic materials to enable them keep in school and avoid child marriage; while other poor families were provided with income generating activities such as goats and chicken to enable them keep their children in school. The poverty alleviation intervention also included provision of vocational training to children from poor families and helping people to form saving and credit groups to access government loans. The rescue sub program involved rescuing girls who had been married or were being planned to be sent off to husbands. These were accommodated in Agape’s hostel at the Knowledge School based at Chibe. They were counseled, and reconciled to their families. Some were sent back to primary or vocational school, while others continued with secondary school at the Knowledge School.

The CBOs worked with a total of 54 secondary schools, 133 primary schools and 220 school clubs. Within the schools children were taught about child rights, and dangers of child marriage and pregnancies. Some few schools received education on sexual and reproductive health and rights. Children were trained as trainers for fellow peers in school clubs created by the CBOs.

Major challenges and drawbacks in the design and implementation were:- (a) the non-uniformity of intervention packages which in turn affected the uniformity of outcomes. For example, no two pupils in the region received the same package of services. This was associated with individualized non-coordinated CBO planning which disregarded the common goal which all were striving to achieve. This means that there is need to develop a minimum package of services given to each population group. (b) major causes of child marriage like poverty, SRHR, people’s mind sets and reasoning behind child marriage were not satisfactorily addressed c) some population groups such as boys in schools and men were not satisfactorily included in the program; d) although the number of wards covered were impressive, a large number of the wards and villages were not reached due to their vastness; e) inadequate financial resources limiting scaling up the interventions; f) action systems such as the teachers, social welfare officers, the police, traditional leaders were not satisfactorily reached; g) while
organizational development assessments of CBOs and community dialogues (to ascertain social systems to target interventions) were done at the beginnings of the program, no baseline was done for the social service delivery arm; h) while the rescue strategy is important to manage victims and survivors of child marriage, it has got many flows that threatens the wellbeing of the mothers and their children; i) the social justice aspects of the rescue arm was too weak and befallen with many challenges including police corruption; j) the knowledge, learning and sharing activity was not adequately addressed; k) there are still gaps in the capacity building sub-program which needs to be filled in during the next phase; l) non-standardized granting conditions; m) program outcomes not effectively monitored.

Other unmet needs include: - child pregnancy is still a problem in the rural areas while child pregnancies is still common in the urban areas. Other unmet needs are: child labour, poor quality education, poverty, sexual abuse of children, gender based violence, marital breakdown and abandonment of children, physical and emotional abuses of children, unemployment of youths and need for vocational training, and water shortages in semi-arid locations of the region. Capacity building gaps include:- advocacy and lobbying, networking and engaging especially at national level, research, documentation of successful stories, gender and power relations, inequality; case management systems and referrals, social and emotional support for vulnerable children, sustainability, tracking data on the safety of children, life skills, fundraising, behavioral change, monitoring and evaluation, reporting and reporting systems etc.

Key recommendations are:

The FF needs to operationalize the outcome relating to knowledge development, learning and sharing and design intervention activities for CBOs to implement in the next phase.

   i. FF and partner CBOs must undertake a baseline for the service delivery arm before the next phase to inform the design of future activities
   ii. Standardize tools for monitoring program activities
   iii. Coordinate sharing amongst CBOs
   iv. Do a training needs assessment among teachers in both primary and secondary as well as the police and social welfare officers on competences relating to child protection practice issues and values.

2. Design a coordinated program with standardized packages (minimum packages) for different population groups implemented by a consortium of CBOs based on their strengths.

3. Capacity building needs to continue but consciously addressing identified gaps.

4. Granting and sub-granting conditions need to be standardized and streamlined

5. Consolidate current efforts of partners and scale up effective approaches to address root causes of child abuse and neglect.

6. Integrate gender based violence into child protection as required by the new national plan of action.
7. Give priority to training actions systems of teachers, police and social-welfare officers for enhanced participation in the program.

8. Scale up interventions into unserved geographical locations and population groups.

9. Develop interventions to address causal factors of child marriage especially poverty and other behavioral determinants of child marriage that were inadequately addressed in the first phase.

10. Revisit and refine the rescue strategy of managing survivors of child marriage addressing its weaknesses while upholding its strengths.
CHAPTER ONE: BACKGROUND TO THE EVALUATION

1.0 Introduction
This report presents the findings of the evaluation exercise done to assess the progress, achievements, and challenges of implementing Firelight Foundation’s Initiative to end child marriage in Shinyanga Region, Tanzania. The Initiative has been running for four years; since 2015, being implemented by twelve community based organizations (CBOs), two of which are lead partners or community granters.

1.1 Background on the Foundation and Initiative
Firelight Foundation (FF) is a grants meeting organization which started as a private charity in the United States of America in 1998 to work with children, families, and communities. FF believes that each child deserves to grow up in a family environment. With its core values of “community centredness”, “child participation” and “community ownership”, FF believes that child protection problems can best be handled by the communities themselves with the support and facilitation of community based organizations. By principle, FF works with CBOs which are already in existence but which have not had an opportunity to obtain funding from any other donor. The typical CBOs targeted by Firelight Foundation are the small, indigenous and not-for-profit ones.

The main goal of FF is to develop their capacity to bring about community wide change. Firelight Foundation works with the assumption that CBOs are able to learn new knowledge and skill, and are better able to organize themselves to provide quality services at community level. Once the CBOs’ organizational capacities are built then the CBOs would be able to effectively respond to the issues of child protection in their communities and effect change. It is the CBOs which must interface with the communities. This philosophy has been adapted by FF through its long work experience of working with CBOs in several East and South African countries. The second goal was financial resource mobilization and granting to the partner CBOs.

There was no document describing how the Initiative was conceived but interviews with Firelight staff indicated that this was a result of the learning done during Firelight’s interventions in other African countries. It learnt from existing literature and demographic health surveys that child marriage was big problem in Africa and was greatest in Shinyanga Tanzania where the prevalence was 59 percent in 2015. A scoping study was done of existing CBOs which were working on child protection problems in Shinyanga from which FF identified CBOs it could partner with to respond to the problem. Calls were made on the internet asking the CBOs already aligned to child protection issues to apply to partner with FF to fight child marriage in the region. Those that responded automatically became partners. Interviews were also conducted with Shinyanga Regional Commissioners and social welfare departments to identify strategies to address the problem. Literature was reviewed to understand the causes, dynamics, and consequences of child marriage in Shinyanga.

1.2 About Shinyanga Region
Shinyanga is one of the 31 regions of Tanzania located to the north west of Tanzania and lying in the Lake Victoria basin. It is divided into three districts of Kahama, Kishapu and Shinyanga. The districts are divided into 6 local government authorities which are: Kahama Town Council, Shinyanga

Shinyanga has a total population of 1,534,808 people of whom 750,841 are males and 783,967 are females. It has a population growth rate of 2.1; 261,732 households with an average size of 5.9 people; and 2.6 sleeping rooms. Of these households, 178,778 (68%) are male headed while 80,203 (31%) are female headed. Agriculture is the main source of livelihood, contributing about 75% to the Shinyanga Regional economy and employing about 90 percent of the working population. Other economic activities include mining, livestock, trading, industry and transportation. Among persons aged 10 years and above, 64% are employed, 2.4% unemployed; 11.8% engage in home domestic work; 18.4% are full time students, and 3.3 are unable to do any work. Approximately 36% of the population live below poverty line [2].

Shinyanga is among the relatively least human developed regions in Tanzania. Since 1977, Tanzania has been providing free universal primary education (UPE) to all children. Because of its high UPE enrollment, Tanzania got a UN award for high enrollment in 1983. However, from 1990, UPE enrollment started declining. Government introduced measures to correct the problem. One of the regions highly affected with poor school enrollment was Shinyanga. School enrollment in primary schools is 67.9% with high dropout rates of girls from primary and secondary schools estimated at 500 per year. Use of any methods of family planning is low at 24.1% compared to the national contraceptive prevalence rate of 38.1%; while skilled deliveries are at 35% [3].

1.3 Child marriage in Shinyanga Region

Child marriage is defined as a formal or informal union entered into by an individual before reaching the age of 18 years. Child marriage may be forced, or it may result from elopement of the girl with a man/boy; after getting a pregnancy, and being out of school [4]. Child marriage is big problem in Africa with an incidence of 70%, the highest incidence globally. In Tanzania, Child marriage and sexual abuses affect girls more than boys and are more common in the rural than the urban areas[5].

In Shinyanga Region, child marriage was estimated at 59% at the start of FF Initiative; being ranked number one in the whole of Tanzania. This was followed by its neighbor Tabora at 58 percent, Mara 55 percent, and Dodoma 51 percent [3]. Tanzania Demographic and Health Survey (TDHS) further showed that 36% of girls between 20 and 24 years old had married before the age of 18. Child marriage is most common in rural areas, although it also occurs in towns and cities, with large differences across regions. The problem is, however, indicated to be reducing generally to 7% by 15 years and to 37% before 18 years[6].

Child marriage in Tanzania is driven by poverty and the payment of dowry, child labor, adolescent pregnancy, child abuse and neglect, as well as limited access to education and employment opportunities for women and girls[7]. In Shinyanga, it is estimated that 78-89 percent of all children experience deprivation in 3 or more poverty dimensions notably protection, housing, water and sanitation. Fifty percent of children aged 0-17 years are deprived of education and information. At
national level, 3 out of 10 children in Tanzania experience deprivation poverty; while 3 out of 10 live in households below the poverty line [8].

In Shinyanga the role of cultural norms, beliefs and traditions are very strong and great determinants of child marriage. Child marriage is a practice historically embedded in the culture of the Sukuma people, an ethnic group which predominantly occupies the region. It’s believed that a girl aged 10 and 11 years is ripe for marriage [7]. When a girl reaches 14 years and she is not married then she is considered to be “too old” to get married. It is feared that if such a girl gets pregnant outside wedlock, she does not only bring shame to the family but she also fetches less cows in bride price than a younger girl. For example, a girl aged about 13 years may fetch about 50 heads of cattle while a girls aged 18 may fetch 15-20 heads of cattle. Girls are, therefore, perceived as a source of wealth. Girls are alleged to impoverish the family when kept in schools for long because at the end they will still leave the biological family and go on to be of more benefit to their husbands. Parents do not want to invest in girls’ education because the more a parent invests the less he expects back. The Sukuma do not adore education for girls because it keeps girls in school for long, making them grow old. When a girl child completes standard /primary seven it is feared she will look big and attract more men that will impregnate her. Subsequently, parents choose to educate only boys. If a girl is sent to school she is not required to go beyond Standard (Primary) Seven. Child labor and female genital mutilation are also pathways to child marriage [7].

The challenges of child marriage are not unique to Shinyanga region. Globally, the drivers of child marriage include: poverty, gender inequality, not being in school, insecurity and famine, cultural traditions, religious and social pressures, conflict and forced migrations, among others. Inadequate correct and comprehensive information on sexual and reproductive health and on issues such as how a girl gets pregnant and how to protect oneself against sexual abuses is also a known risk factor. Poor reporting or late reporting of sexual abuse is also another factor [4].

Early marriages have many negative consequences including health problems, dropping out of school with resultant inability for the girl to maximize her potential; increased exposure to sexual and reproductive health risks, and domestic violence by husbands and extended family members. Pregnant girls aged 15-19 years are twice as likely to die in child birth as women in their 20s. Also girls aged below 15 years are 5 times more likely to die during child birth because their pelvis and birth canal are not fully developed. Giving birth before age 15 years has an 88% risk of developing fistula. Child brides face a higher risk of contracting HIV because they marry older men with more sexual experience. Girls who marry before 18 years are more likely to experience domestic violence than their peers who marry later. Also child brides show signs of sexual abuse and post-traumatic stress such as feelings of hopelessness, helplessness, and severe depression (ICRW). Human Rights Watch indicates that “gaps in the child protection system, the lack of protection for victims of child marriage, and the many obstacles girls and women face in obtaining redress compel them to endure the devastating and long-lasting consequences of child marriage”.
1.4 Sustainable Development Goals and Child Marriages
Child marriage is a global challenge affecting mostly the poorest countries and households. Each year 15 million girls are married as children, perpetuating vicious cycles of poverty, inequality and insecurity which sustain the practice and act as an obstacle to global development [6]. It’s believed that between year 2000 and 2015, child marriage undermined the achievement of six of the eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) 2015-2030 recognize the critical relationship between child marriages and global development. A closer look at goals 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 8, 10 and 16 indicates the intricate relationship between child marriage and development. For instance child marriage is linked to higher household poverty and perpetuates cycles of poverty across generations. Child marriage affects the poor, rural and disadvantaged populations disproportionately, and creates cycles of poverty that reinforce inequality and violence. Women who marry when still children are less likely to complete their education and participate in the workforce, which undermines their economic growth. Child marriage hinders progress towards ending modern forms of slavery and child exploitation.

Child marriage leads to a range of harmful health consequences, including higher rates of maternal and infant mortality and morbidity. Child brides and their children are more likely to suffer hunger and be malnourished thus undermining the attainment of Zero Hunger. Ending child marriage will help achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls [9].

1.5 Policy and legal environment for child protection in Tanzania

1.5.1 The Constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania and The Marriages Act
Tanzania’s Marriage Act of 1971 Section 13 (1) on minimum Age indicates that, “No person shall marry who, being male has not attained the apparent age of eighteen years, or being female, has not attained the apparent age of fifteen years”. This is contrary to the constitutional provisions of 18 years for one to be of legal age. Further, Article 13(1) of the Constitution of Tanzania states that, “All persons are equal before the law and are entitled, without any discrimination, to protection and equality before the law”. In Tanzania the legal age for marriage is 18 years, though this has been over powered by cultural and legal dictates.

Although the contradiction in laws was contested in courts of law by social activists, and the courts ruled that the marriage Act of 1971 should be nullified, this court ruling had not been effected by the time of this evaluation. The government of Tanzania appealed against the ruling on the basis that nullification needed to follow the right procedures and processes of engaging the parliament and other stakeholders such as religious, local leaders, and traditional leaders who initially participated in its enactment. The amendments were supposed to have been completed by April 2018[9] but they had not by the time of this evaluation. Nonetheless, the government pronounced that in such matters of conflict “the best interests of the child” must be upheld. Subsequently, the CBOs were using the definition of a child as being up to 18 years as contained in the Child Protection Act 2009.
1.5.2 The Child Act, (2009, 2011)
This legislation provides for reform and consolidation of laws relating to children, to stipulate rights of the child and to promote, protect and maintain the welfare of a child with a view to giving effect to international and regional conventions on the rights of the child; to provide for affiliation, foster care, adoption and custody of the child; to further regulate employment and apprenticeship; to make provisions with respect to a child in conflict with law and to provide for related matters. The Act also stipulates the rights of the child, the responsibilities of parents and other institutions in protecting children and ensuring that children enjoy their rights including the right to decision making\(^1\).

According to this law, “a person below the age of eighteen years shall be known as a child”. Part II (a) clause 2 indicates, “The best interest of a child shall be the primary consideration in all actions concerning a child whether undertaken by public or private social welfare institutions, courts or administrative bodies”. In relation to Child marriage and child sexual exploitation, Part VIII section 83.- (1-4)”A child shall not be engaged in any work or trade that exposes the child to activities of sexual nature, whether paid for or not. It further states that, “it shall be unlawful for any person to use - (a) inducement or coercion in the encouragement of a child to engage in any sexual activity; (b) children in prostitution or other unlawful sexual practices; and (c) children in pornographic performances or materials. Any person who contravenes the provisions of this section commits an offence and shall on conviction be liable to a fine of not less than one million shillings and not more than five hundred million shillings or to imprisonment for a term of not less than one year and not more than twenty years or to both”.

Everyone has the duty to report cases of infringement of child rights\(^2\). The law states: “It shall be the duty of any member of the community who has evidence or information that a child’s rights are being infringed or that a parent, a guardian or relative having custody of a child who is able to, but refuses or neglects to provide the child with food, shelter, right to play or leisure, clothing, medical care and education, to report the matter to the local government authority of the area”.

The law repeals the Affiliation Act, The Adoption Act, The Day Care Centres Act, The Children and Young Persons Act, The Children Home (Regulation) Act [10, 11]. This Act also makes numerous consequential amendments to the Marriage Act, Cap. 29; the Employment and Labour Relations Act; the Penal Code; and the Criminal Procedure Act.

1.5.3 The Tanzania National Education Act 1978, and Child Marriage
This act, which was amended on 20th May 2016, indicates under CAP. 353 section 22 60 that;
(1) It shall be unlawful under any circumstance for:
(a) any person to marry a primary or secondary school girl or a school boy; or
(b) a primary or secondary school boy to marry any person.
(2) Any person who contravenes any provision of subsection (1) commits an offence and shall, on conviction, be liable to imprisonment for a term of thirty years.
(3) Any person who impregnates a primary school or a secondary school girl commits an offence and shall, on conviction, be liable to imprisonment for a term of thirty years.

\(^1\)The law of the Child Act, 2009, Part II, 9 Clause 11
\(^2\) The law of the Child Act, 2009 Part VIII section 95 clause (1)
(4) Any person who aids, abates, or solicits a primary or secondary school girl or a school boy to marry while pursuing primary or secondary education commits an offence and shall, on conviction, be liable to a fine of not less than five million shillings or to imprisonment for a term of five years or to both.

(5) Every Head of School shall keep record and submit to the Commissioner or his representative a detailed quarterly report of cases of marriages and pregnancies under subsection (1), (3) or (4) and legal actions taken against the offenders.

This amendment reinforces government and civil society’s efforts to end Child marriage that observed to cause high school drop-out rates that lead to many children missing their life-long developmental opportunities when they marry when still minors [12]. However, there are still legal loop holes that limit the full implementation of this ACT especially provisions under the Tanzania’s Law of Marriage Act of 1971 Section 13 (1) on minimum Age indicates that, “No person shall marry who, being male has not attained the apparent age of eighteen years, or being female, has not attained the apparent age of fifteen years”[13].

1.5.4 The National Action Plan to End Violence against Women and children

The NAP-VAWC is a national framework guiding interventions aimed at preventing and responding to violence against children and women in Tanzania. This is in line with the attainment of sustainable development goals 2030 and African Union commission’s agenda 2063 vision of a world where all children grow and live free from violence [9]. It represents a strategic shift in thinking from interventions that are issue based to building systems that not only prevent violence against women and children in all its forms, but also respond to the needs of victims/survivors. This shift requires not only a high level of coordination and cooperation among all duty bearers, but also entails taking concrete steps toward bridging the public and private spheres and reaching communities, families, and individuals – including children – and reshaping perceptions of violence as well as gender roles between men and women[14].

As this new policy shift takes shape, it will see all implementers oriented on the design and implementation of programs aimed at protecting children and women and ensuring that violence is addressed at a continuum starting from childhood up to adulthood. This requires coordinated efforts amongst key government departments responsible for child protection, that is, Ministry of Health, Community Development, Gender and Children; police, justice, education, local governments, and civil society organizations. The social welfare officers who are key in child protection are required to take necessary steps to ensure that the child is not subjected to harm, receive referrals, carry out investigations, safeguard children by referring the cases to court, and providing counseling to the children and the family.

1.6 Overall Purpose of the Progress Evaluation

This evaluation constitutes a scientific review and documentation of FF’s activities, approaches, service delivery and their likely effects at community level. It was anticipated that undertaking this scientific exercise would inform strategic re-thinking by the Foundation on program design and
delivery approaches in the next phase. This evaluation was, therefore, a learning opportunity for Firelight Foundation and her partners to determine what has worked or not worked, why it has worked or not worked, identify challenges and threats to program implementation and potential achievements. Specifically, Firelight Foundation was interested in achieving the following:

1) Document the progress made by partners in the implementation of activities to end child marriages in Shinyanga under Firelight Foundation support.
2) Assess the changes at the community, CBO and Lead Partners’ level that can be attributable to Firelight Foundation support.
3) Identify indicators for the monitoring, learning and evaluation framework for tracking, under the next phase of Firelight Foundation Initiative in Shinyanga.

1.7 Evaluation objectives
To realize the above evaluation purposes, the consultant together with Firelight Foundation agreed that this progress evaluation would be guided by the following objectives:

a) Articulate Firelight’s, the Lead Partner’s, and CBO partners’ respective stated goals and objectives for the initiative.
b) Evaluate partners’ work to improve child protection outcomes in their communities.
c) Evaluate the Lead Partner’s work to support and build the capacity of CBO partners.
d) Provide feedback and recommendations on: Child protection needs and opportunities in the communities that warrant attention in the coming years; CBO partners’ roles and effectiveness in responding to these needs and opportunities; CBO partners’ capacity building needs in programming, organizational management, advocacy, sustainability, and engagement in systemic change; the Lead Partner’s role and effectiveness in building CBO partners’ capacities; and methods to improve the tracking of progress and evaluation of outcomes for the initiative moving forward.
e) Provide recommendations on a learning and evaluation framework as well as indicators to track in the next phase of the initiative.

1.8 Evaluation Scope
The evaluation concerns of the Firelight Foundation and her partners could best be categorized as “implementation evaluation” or “process evaluation”. It was a process evaluation because of its concern with verifying what the program was, actual work done, how it was done, and whether or not it delivered interventions as intended to the target beneficiaries. The evaluation involved assessments of program performance in the domains of “service utilization” and “program organization”.

With regard to “service utilization”, the evaluation exercise was concerned with the extent to which the intended target population received the intended services. An assessment was done of issues relating to levels of participation by the target and actions systems, coverage, amount of services given and/or received (also called dosage), perceived quality and utilization of services by the target population for social change, and satisfaction with services obtained.
Assessment of “program organization” required comparing the plan of action to end child marriage with what was actually done, especially with regard to providing services. Assessment of program organization, therefore, had two arms to it: the plan or design of the program and the actual execution of implementation tasks using certain resources and coming up with certain outputs. Understanding the design involved each CBO articulating its goals and outcomes/objectives, assumptions and expectations, and annual planned activities. It is these that were compared with the actual activities and outputs obtained.

Assessment of program organization involved also scrutinizing the CBO functions and resources (inputs) used and whether these were consistent with program design specifications and appropriate standards. The term “function” refers to how the CBOs undertook the problem solving processes; that is, tasks of problem identification and definition, assessment, planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. Functions also covered how the CBOs networked and coordinated with each other and other government child protection departments, child protection committees and other non-government organizations. It also refers to how CBO governing boards worked with implementing staff. The term resources referred to funding, staffing, facilities levels and quality; their adequacy; and how effectively and efficiently they were used to produce whatever outputs each CBO produced.

1.9. Key concepts in the Initiative and some definitions

a) Child marriage
Child marriage refers to a civil, traditional, religious or informal union where either the bride or groom, or both, are under the age of 18 [11, 15]. UNICEF and other development partners expand this definition as a marriage of either a girl or a boy before the age of 18; or cohabitation – when a man or a woman lives ‘in union’ with a child, as if married. Child marriage is internationally recognized as a violation of the child’s human rights[16]. Such a marriage arrangement can either be official or unofficial [17]. In Tanzanian Constitution, any individual either male or female below 18 years is classified as a child [18]. Therefore, any marriage that involves a child of any gender whether by consent or force, official or unofficial is still considered illegal under the constitution. Though there are contradictions with other legal instruments, the constitution remains the supreme document on such matters[13] and[12].

b) Child protection
Child protection refers to preventing and responding to violence, exploitation and abuse against children including commercial sexual exploitation, trafficking, child labour and harmful traditional practices, such as female genital mutilation and child marriage[19, 20]. Child protection involves the ability to meet the needs and rights of all children (girls and boys; able bodied and disabled) by families, communities and the state[21]. This has also been broadened to look at laws, policies, regulations, and services needed to prevent and mitigate challenges faced by children across all social sectors including social welfare, education, health, security and justice. It involves the protection of children from violence, exploitation, abuse and neglect. Existing Literature indicates that violations of the child’s right to protection take place in every country[6]. Child abuse is a violation of children’s rights and
threaten their survival and development as well as their ability to maximize their potential as adolescents and adults. Prevention efforts normally support the child and strengthen families and other gate keepers to undertake their caring responsibilities better [20].

Under the Firelight Foundation Initiative, child protection was operationalized as involving the identification and harnessing positive factors around the child to assist that child reach his or her potential. It involves identifying and removing negative factors that harm the child by different stakeholders including children themselves, parents, communities and child protection institutions at different levels of governance. Child protection involved empowering the child with the right information on harms and his/her rights to safeguard oneself. Child protection involved working with the parents, the children, the child protection systems and structures in the community. According to the Tanzanian child protection guidelines on working with children, the child protection teams are a core team in child protection. Child protection committees exist from village, ward, district and regional levels to national level.

c) Vulnerability
Vulnerability may vary from context to context. The Oxford Dictionary defines “vulnerability” as the inability of a system to withstand the effects of a hostile environment. The concept of vulnerability links the relationship that people have with their environment to the social forces, the institutions and the cultural values that sustain and contest them. A vulnerable person like a child may not have adequate strengths or resources such as cognitive or social skills, power or even material resources to stand against most stressors and shocks in their social environments.

Child labour is one manifestation of vulnerability. Orphan hood, poverty, being out of school, inadequate knowledge and enforcement of children’s rights, poor parenting styles, and peer influence are known drivers that increase the vulnerability of children. Poverty of families forces children to engage in child labour when they should be schooling. Child labour denies children of their childhood and is greatly associated with exploitation by employers and all forms of abuses- physical, emotional, sexual. Child labour denies the child of his/her childhood, social development and rights. Child labour leads to keeping out of school; a gateway to child marriage.

d) Community Based Organizations (CBOs)
Community based organizations are social groups based at the community level, largely non-profit of varied sizes and formality [22]. Community based organizations normally result from community organization processes by which a community identifies its needs or problems, orders (ranks) these needs or objectives, develops the will to work on these needs or objectives, finds resources to deal with the needs and develop cooperative and collaborative attitudes and practices in the community to resolve the problems. Because they are initiated and led by the community, “they have good insights into the needs and assets of their community”. CBOs are reported to have potential to provide high quality services for vulnerable children in resource limited settings; and are associated with greater psycho-social well-being of children from poor families. This definition is not different from the way
Firelight Foundation views community based organizations as small, indigenous organizations working at community level to improve the lives of residents [23].

To this effect Firelight Foundation is working with 12 CBOs namely: Agape AIDS Control Program (AGAPE), Organization of People Empowerment (OPE), Women Elderly Advocacy Development Organization (WEADO), Promising World for Women and Children Organization (PWWCO), Children on Disability Development Program (CHIDEP), Young Women Leadership (YWL), Young Women Christian Association (YWCA), MKOMBOZI, Thubutu Africa Initiative (TAI), RAFIKI Social Development Organization (SDO), The Voice of Marginalized Communities (TVMC) and 1 Lead partner Investing in Children and their Societies (ICS) in Shinyanga, Tanzania to end child marriages.

e) Capacity building
Capacity building, also called organizational development or institutional building is an investment in the effectiveness and future sustainability of a CBO [24]. It may involve building intra-organizational and extra-organizational capacity [22]. It is the action of building effectiveness and the result of increased attention to effectiveness. The action of “building” capacity imply that a CBO has at the start some internal resources or abilities at its disposal (present abilities) as well as potential or future capacity that can be strengthened or learnt. [25]. Capacities can change, be enhanced, maintained or deteriorate. Capacity building can occur at the individual/personal level, organizational, and societal levels. At personal level, capacity building would establish conditions that will allow individuals to engage in the process of learning and adapting to change.

Capacity building of institutions like CBOs would mean modernizing them by supporting them to form sound policies, organizational structures, effective methods of management – monitoring and evaluation, community mobilization and engagement, and revenue control. By this definition, all change agents in the Firelight Foundation Initiative, including Firelight itself engaged in capacity building activities at different levels in different things with learning outcomes being cascaded to different levels of social organization. The sources of learning were ICS and AGAPE for the CBOs. The CBOs were change agents in the communities addressing all sorts of child protection issues.

f) Violence against Children
This was defined as the intentional use of physical force or power, threatened or actual, against a child, by an individual or group that either results in or has a high likelihood of resulting in actual or potential harm to the child’s health, survival, development or dignity [26].

g) Violence against Women
All acts perpetrated against women which cause or could cause them physical, sexual, psychological, and economic harm, including the threat to take such acts; or to undertake the imposition of arbitrary restrictions on or deprivation of fundamental freedoms in private or public life in peace time and during situations of armed conflicts or of war [27].
1.10 Organization of the report
This report is organized in seven chapters. The first looks at the introduction to the project, the second chapter is the methodology; the third one describes the FF Initiative or program; the fourth chapter discusses the capacity building sub-program; the fifth discusses the service delivery sub-program; while the sixth discusses the achievements, challenges, and unmet needs. The final chapter 7 provides the conclusions and recommendations.
CHAPTER TWO: EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

2.1 Evaluation design
The process evaluation utilized a comparative retrospective design to explore community and organizational changes that might have occurred as a result of exposure to Firelight Foundation interventions. This methodology enabled participants to reflect on conditions before and after exposure to project interventions within the past 4 years. This methodology was a best fit for this process evaluation since there was no baseline data collected at the start of the project. A mixed methods approach involving both quantitative and qualitative techniques was used to collect the required information. To facilitate organizational learning during this process evaluation, the evaluation team adopted the appreciative inquiry approach to understand what changes have occurred as a result of the project and possible explanations for change or non-change from the perspective of the stakeholders.

2.2 Evaluation criteria
The evaluators adopted The Development Assistance Committee (DAC) guidelines to provide a framework for the evaluation. DAC principles for evaluation of development assistance emphasize the following as key criteria for any evaluation: relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability.

The five criteria were contextualized in this evaluation as indicated below;

a) Relevance: in examining relevance of Firelight Foundation project interventions in ending child marriages in Shinyanga, the evaluators focused on the extent to which interventions were suited to the priorities and policies of the target groups. The following questions were considered during analysis of relevance:

- To what extent are the objectives of the program still valid?
- Are the activities and outputs of the program consistent with the overall goal and the attainment of its objectives?
- Are the activities and outputs of the program consistent with the intended impacts and effects?

b) Effectiveness: this was defined as a measure of the extent to which the project attained its objectives. Key evaluation questions included:

- To what extent were the objectives achieved / are likely to be achieved?
- What were the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the objectives?

c) Efficiency: this was used to measure how well the project utilized resources to achieve desired outputs and outcomes. The focus was on “time efficiency” and to some extent “finances” for project inputs. The following key questions were considered by the evaluation team:

- Were activities cost-efficient?
- Were objectives achieved on time?
- Was the program or project implemented in the most efficient way compared to alternatives?
d) Likely impact: The Evaluation Team was concerned with ascertaining the positive and negative changes produced by Firelight Foundation Initiative; the intended and unintended, and changes produced directly and indirectly. To avert earlier project design challenges, the team re-calibrated the project theory of change to establish the planned pathways of change and the intended change from project interventions. The purpose of doing this was to establish effect on the social, economic, environmental and other development indicators (in line with ending child marriage Initiative) and also the positive and negative impact of external factors, such as changes in legal and policy framework and financial conditions of CBOs.

The evaluation team sought to analyze the project based on the following questions:

- What has happened as a result of the program or project?
- What real difference has the activity made to the beneficiaries?
- How many people have been affected?


e) Sustainability: the evaluators were concerned with measuring whether the benefits of the Initiative were likely to continue after donor funding had been withdrawn.

The following questions guided evaluators’ analysis of sustainability:

- To what extent will the benefits of project continue after donor funding ceases?
- What were the major factors which influenced the achievement or non-achievement of sustainability of the program or project? For example, what were the roles of finance, stakeholder involvement, ownership, environmental factors, and gender dimension?

2.3 Evaluation participants

The study population was composed of 12 CBOs, two Child protection committees (1 in Kidia and 1 Ibinzamata); four focused group discussions with school children (2 with Mwantini Primary school in Mwawaza ward and 2 with Buchambi Primary school); four focus group discussions with secondary school children (2 from Ngokolo Secondary school and 2 from Town secondary school), four FGDs with out of school children conducted in Ibinzamata ward and Ngokolo ward. The FGDs with children in and out of school were organized by gender. In each school that was visited, the evaluation team interviewed a student/pupil leader and a school patron and matron.

A study tour was made at Agape Knowledge School while community interviews with adult males and females were conducted in four wards of Ngokolo, Buchambi, Mwawaza and Mondo. A focus group consisted of between 12 and 25 people.

2.4 Sampling procedures

To assess the progress made by the Initiative in Shinyanga Region, and identify explanatory factors for the status quo, the Evaluation Team thought it prudent to divide the program wards into two broad groups – those perceived by the CBOs to have made “maximum progress” and those that had made “minimum progress” in reducing child marriage practices and rates. This was done during an orientation workshop involving all the 12 CBOs that was conducted in Shinyanga Town.
Having established that the 12 CBOs were implementing the ending child marriage initiative in 38 wards, the evaluators tasked the team to define progress and identify wards where they had witnessed maximum and minimal progress. Using this criteria, a total of 6 wards (16% of project area) were selected purposively; 3/6 wards were considered Minimal and 3/6 Maximum progress areas. The measurements of minimum and maximum progress were determined by the partners. The selection of the three wards out of many with similar characteristics were selected purposively using reported performance assessment by each CBO.

The CBOs then nominated 3 participants to randomly select 3 wards out of 12 wards that were listed under the minimal progress criteria. Each representative had only one chance to pick a CBO. It is these wards that participated in the community level interviews with community leaders, families, heads of households, and out of school youths. The schools (Primary and secondary schools) were randomly selected from the participating wards. This process was replicated for selection of wards and participants for maximal progress wards. The evaluation team was able to conduct community level interviews amongst six CBOs based on the criteria of minimal progress and maximum progress.

The table below shows the CBOs and wards where community level interviews were conducted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CBO</th>
<th>WARD</th>
<th>Type of interviews</th>
<th>Reason for conducting the interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.YWCA</td>
<td>KAMBARAGE</td>
<td>FGD with Secondary school children (girls and boys)</td>
<td>Interviews with these category of respondents in communities that CBOs indicated minimal progress in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In-depth interviews with teachers</td>
<td>attaining progress outcomes would enable the evaluation team to identify level of progress and reasons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In-depth interviews with student leaders</td>
<td>for minimal progress. The focus in this category was interventions that were implemented at secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>school level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.TAI</td>
<td>MONDO</td>
<td>FGDs with community members</td>
<td>Low education levels and socio cultural practices were seen as the greatest barriers to attainment of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FGDs with Primary school children</td>
<td>project outcomes. Interviews with the school children and teachers would provide more context specific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>information to unearth the influence of these on the efforts to stop child marriages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.WEADO</td>
<td>IBINZAMATA</td>
<td>FGDs with Child protection committees</td>
<td>Child protection committees are legal government structures for prevention and response to child rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FGDs with Out of school boys and girls</td>
<td>violations at community level. The evaluation team sought to establish the work of this structure,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>their capacity, awareness of the laws and coordination with other institutions in child protection.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>We also sought to establish why the CPC in this ward was seen to be less effective in handling child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>violation issues.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.5 Data collection Methods
The evaluation team utilized three main techniques to collect data.

- **Document reviews**: A review of national policies like The Marriage Act, Plan of action to end Violence against women and children, Educational Act and policies, project documents like quarterly and annual project reports, community dialogue reports, ODT reports; CBOs documents such as their constitutions and annual reports was conducted.
- **Interviews**: These included: face to face individual interviews with teachers, community leaders and beneficiaries; group interviews with CBO staff and board members; and focus group discussions with children in school - both in primary and secondary school; and out of school. The individual interviews and focus group discussions were each conducted by a team of two people – the moderator who was also one of the evaluators and an English – Swahili translator. All discussions were audio taped and later translated in English and transcribed.
- **Workshops**: Three workshops were conducted with stakeholders. These consisted of orientation, stakeholder, and validation workshops.
  1. **Orientation workshop**: this was conducted with all CBO partners (10 CBOs), 1 Community Grant Maker, 1 Lead Partner and Firelight Foundation staff before starting data collection. The workshop was led by the AfriChild evaluation team. The
The aim of this workshop was to orient CBOs on the evaluation and to plan field logistics and mobilization of communities and other participants for in-depth interviews.

### ii. Stakeholders’ workshop
This was organized with key project implementing partners at district and regional level, local government staff and leaders. This workshop attracted 24 NGO officials, 16 Firelight Foundation CBO partners and 8 government officials. These participants provided perspectives to the preliminary findings from community interviews on the issues of child marriage. Specifically, the stakeholders’ workshop was meant to be used as a platform to:

a. Concretize the findings relating to the progress made, appropriateness of choice of intervention strategies and approaches used by Firelight partner initiatives.

b. Use stakeholders’ observations of outcomes from the Firelight Foundation and partner Initiatives in Shinyanga in the last 1-4 years to identify indicators of success or progress for use in the development of monitoring and evaluation framework for future activities.

c. Assess the current/existing child protection issues that are worth addressing in the future, geographical areas most affected and desired outcomes.

d. Identify existing state and non-state interventions and gaps in existing child protection challenges that are worth addressing in the future by Firelight and partners.

e. Identify strengths and weaknesses of stakeholders including the families, communities, and institutions that constitute opportunities for child protection responses in the future.

### iii. Validation workshop
This was organized collaboratively with the Firelight Foundation implementing partners in Shinyanga. The purpose of the validation workshop was to share key findings with stakeholders especially the evaluation participants to identify areas of consensus, areas of discomfort, findings that needed more discussion and clarity. This workshop did not only allow for sharing of information but enabled double-looped learning between the evaluation team and the evaluation participants. The evaluation team was also able to obtain more information to improve on the draft report. This workshop was attended by 10 Firelight Foundation CBO partners, 2 staff from Agape, 5 staff from ICS, 20 government officials, 2 FF staff, and 3 staff from AfriChild.

#### 2.6 Key evaluation Areas and questions
The Process evaluation broadly attempted to look at the following six areas of the Initiative with some guiding questions.
### Matrix 3: Key evaluation questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Area</th>
<th>Key question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The program description</td>
<td>What was the project about? What was the problem being addressed? Where was this to be implemented?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program organization</td>
<td>What is the desired goal for the project?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is there a clear theory of how the desired goals and key outcomes were to be achieved?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What were the project assumptions along the results chain?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are necessary program functions (problem solving process, planning implementation, monitoring, evaluation, termination) being performed adequately?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approaches</td>
<td>What pathways are in place to bring about desired change?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is staffing sufficient in numbers and competences for the functions that must be performed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Does the program coordinate effectively with the other programs and agencies with which it must interact?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation</td>
<td>Are members of the target population aware of the program?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are those receiving the services the intended targets?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is performance at some program sites or locales significantly better or poorer than at others?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To what extent are project interventions utilized by target beneficiaries?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are participants satisfied with the services received?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dosage</td>
<td>Are they receiving the proper amount, type and quality of services?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What is the distribution of service beneficiaries?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are there sections of the community that have been excluded?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are resources used effectively and efficiently?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>Is the project in compliance with requirements of funding agencies and higher-level administration?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is the project in compliance with applicable professional and legal standards?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Adapted from Ross et al (2004)].

#### 2.7 Implementation strategy

This assignment was undertaken collaboratively by AfriChild, Firelight Foundation, implementing partners and local/regional government authorities. Two staff were dedicated by AfriChild Centre to implement this evaluation alongside 4 staff from Firelight Foundation (One programme officer, 1 Monitoring and evaluation officer and 2 data collectors). The data collectors who were conversant in the local language - Kiswahilli and English were identified with the help of Firelight Foundation and her Lead Partner, ICS. Fluency of the local language was key for translations and transcriptions of the discussions. The translators ensured that all audio recordings were transcribed verbatim and data backed up with the evaluation team members. At the end of each daily exercise, the evaluation team held debrief sessions to highlight emerging issues or areas needing further follow up during subsequent interviews. These meetings were also key in planning of the activities for the next day.

The evaluation team interviewed staff and board members in all the CBOs before they moved to the next CBO. A total of 6 CBO were randomly selected to mobilize community members and schools for participation in the evaluation. After interviewing each CBO staff then the evaluation team was taken to the communities to do the focus groups discussions with community members and schools. The team spent one day with each CBO that mobilized communities.
The data collection exercise was preceded by the orientation workshop. The stakeholders’ workshop was conducted soon after data collection. The validation workshop was done after data analysis and draft report writing. The deliberations of the validation workshop helped to improve the draft report.

2.8 Ethical Considerations
The evaluation team adhered to the following ethical considerations to protect participants of this process evaluation.

Clearance from district and regional offices to conduct the evaluation: Before the evaluation was conducted, Firelight Foundation together with the lead partner, ICS sought permission from the regional administration to conduct this process evaluation. Permission to participate in the evaluation was sought from all organizations that participated in this evaluation. No organization or her individuals were coerced to either participate or give information required for this evaluation.

Informed consent was obtained from all adults in the communities who participated in the evaluation. The purpose was to ensure that participants had all the necessary information to choose to participate or not and to provide meaningful feedback during the evaluation exercise. Since the primary beneficiaries of the project were children, the evaluation team had to ensure that ascent of all participants below the age of 18 years was obtained. This was accompanied by permission from the parent/guardian/custodian for the team to interact with a minor. This was done in line with ethics for protection of human subjects and the principle of ‘Do no harm’.

2.9 Data management, analysis and report writing
The evaluation generated both quantitative and qualitative data. Primary quantitative data was comprised of demographic characteristics of respondents while the other statistical data was obtained from secondary sources like Demographic health survey reports and education reports. Qualitative data was generated from interviews with staff and board members, discussions with community members, discussions with children and interviews with school teachers and other key stakeholders. Most interviews were conducted in Swahili with the help of a translator.

Qualitative data was audio recorded, translated and transcribed by a team of translators who were knowledgeable of the local language and Kiswahili as well as English. The transcripts from each interview were proof read by both transcribers and AfriChild Staff to ensure coherence and completeness.

Completed transcripts were printed in hard copies and filed under lock and key at AfriChild Centre, Kampala. During analysis phase, a two days analysis and report writing workshop was organized to generate the common themes and report format. The evaluation team used both thematic and content analysis techniques while exploring the qualitative data. Thematic analysis was used to establish emerging broad areas in the data sets by sub-groupings while content analysis was useful in exploring relationships, causalities or non-causalities in the findings.
2.10 Limitations
Evaluation design: The comparative retrospective design that was adopted had limitations of accurately measuring project outcomes and attributing changes to Firelight Foundation initiatives. This was because some people were not around when the project was starting or they had forgotten the conditions at the start of the project. It’s more accurate to attribute change and causalities if there is baseline data. It is possible that this evaluation may either under report or over report achievements of the Firelight Foundation interventions.

Length of implementation: The differences in implementation periods amongst CBOs affected exposure of beneficiaries to project interventions. This also affected the scale of achievements at organizational level.

Another limitation related to the reporting style of the implemented activities. Although all the CBOs used the reporting format developed by FF, there were a lot of variations in the way they recorded the referent time period of the report. Some CBOs used the calendar year (2017) while others used the financial year style of time referencing (2016/2017). Some CBOs kept changing the style of reporting time. Comparisons of achievements between time periods became very difficult for all CBOs. There was limited data on outcomes of the program.
CHAPTER THREE: THE FIRELIGHT FOUNDATION PROGRAM

3.0 Introduction
This Chapter describes the program. It articulates Firelight Foundation’s, the Lead Partners’ and CBO partner stated goals and objectives for the Initiative. It presents findings relating to the program theory which articulates how FF and her partners envisaged to achieve the goals and objectives of the program.

3.1 Program goal and objectives (core outcomes)
The goal of the Firelight Foundation Initiative in Shinyanga was to end child marriage so as to enable children to “realize the fulfillment of their rights and potential within a safe, caring and protective environment” [23] The ending of child marriage was to be attained through capacity building of existing community based organization already working in the field of child protection in the region. The FF Initiative worked with a total of 12 CBOs one of which had the responsibility to do capacity building of the rest.

The FF Initiative worked with 3 objectives or core outcomes notably:-

i. To provide community based organizations (CBOs) with resources, competences and linkages to effectively facilitate the fulfillment of children’s rights at the community level;
ii. To enable children, families, communities and local government institutions create a protective environment where children’s rights were actualized
iii. Document and share knowledge about the actions CBOs were taking in child protection and children’s rights; the changes resulting from those actions, and the best ways to build CBO’s capacity in those areas[23]

Firelight Foundation’s tendency to depend on CBOs “to navigate the space between international child rights and local culture” arose out of its long experience of working with CBOs. FF believes that CBOs have a lot of potential to sensitize children about their rights; strengthen families, community members, and local leaders to respect, protect, and fulfill those rights because they stay in the communities and they understand the cultural norms and traditions of their people. Being alike in many ways with the local people they are more likely to be effective disciples on child protection issues than outsiders to the communities.

3.2 Program theory

3.2.1 The child protection problem addressed by the Initiative
The major child protection problem that the FF Initiate targeted to end in Shinyanga Region was child marriage, sexual exploitation and abuse. At the start of the program, it was estimated that 59 percent of the girls were married off before they reached 18 years of age.
The problem of child marriage was conceptualized by the program as having roots at the child level, the family, community and institutional levels. At the child level, children were perceived to be ignorant of their rights, and of themselves. They were powerless to say no to forced child marriages, lacked vision for their lives, and could not articulate their life goals. Children also had limited life skills to enhance their safety and security. Children had inadequate correct and comprehensive information on sexual and reproductive health and on issues such as how a girl gets pregnant and how to protect oneself against sexual abuses. At family level, there were inappropriate values and norms, illiteracy and ignorance of child rights, poverty, and unequal power relations. At community level, there were inappropriate cultural norms, ignorance of child rights, and illiteracy. Poor reporting or late reporting of sexual abuse was also a common problem cutting across the different social systems. Most child protection institutions at local level had limited knowledge of their responsibilities to protect the rights of children, lacked linkage in their work and had inadequate competences to manage and refer child abuse cases.

3.2.3 Program theory – the thinking that guided implementation
Firelight Foundation thought that ending child marriage would occur through strengthening the capacities of existing community based organisations. The Initiative worked with the major assumption that once CBOs were strengthened then they would be able to effectively and efficiently respond to child marriage, sexual exploitation, and abuse.

FF identified the following competences to be important for strengthening CBOs: (i) organisational capacity in child protection, including effective child protection policies, case management systems and referral systems; (ii) skills and approaches for building community capacity; (iii) ability to introduce new programs in social and emotions support for vulnerable populations such as the adolescent girls or children with disability; (iv) improvement in organisational management; and (v) sustainability. FF was also interested in improving the way CBOs linked and networked with relevant government departments. The linkage competences that each CBO was required to attain were: (i) advocacy for child rights and child protection at district and national levels; (ii) CBOs and informal community structures having strong referral networks; and (iii) CBOs collaborate with government to track data on safety of children.

The targeted CBOs were to be trained in organisational management issues and technical child protection issues. Capacity building was to be a continuous activity that utilised shared partner practice experiences and learning and translated them into direct and indirect services for child protection at community level.

The FF Initiative to end child marriage in Shinyanga for the Phase 2015-2018 was largely a capacity building program of CBOs. The CBOs were in turn to translate competences into services for children, families and communities to end child marriage practices.
The program was to address the factors that cause and sustain the problem of child marriage and abuses in the “person-situation and environment” of the child. In other words, the interventions had to address the issues within the child such as powerlessness, ignorance of their rights and puberty demands that may attract girls and boys into early sex and marriage. It had also to address the social-cultural-economic environment of the child in which the problem of child marriage and abuses were equally rooted. It was considered that the most effective way of transforming communities for child protection was to holistically address the critical causal factors of child marriage particularly the social cultural norms and traditions, as well as poverty and deficiencies in the child that increase her/his vulnerability to child marriage and pregnancies.

Subsequently, to uproot the problem of child marriage, the Program also needed to work with different target populations – the families, the communities, the children themselves of different ages and gender. The Initiative takes on a holistic approach whereby all actors and systems that are responsible to act on the different dimensions and levels of the problem - including mobilisation, influencing cultural norms, attitudes, and child protection practices, policy making, laws and byelaw enactment, behavioural change, advocacy, and actual child care and needs meeting were targeted for capacity building. Thus, the Initiative was designed to work with different actions systems notably the local government child protection systems from the villages, wards, region and national levels. Examples of these were the social welfare and community development officers at different geographical administration levels, from the wards to districts and regional levels; child protection committees, ward development councils, school teachers – patrons and matrons; police, and community leaders such as ward and village executives.

The latter needed to be strengthened and their interventions enhanced for improved child protection, and/ or made to work in a concerted effort with the partner CBOs. Use of the principle of a holistic approach also involved engaging in the preventive and rescue activities; that is, treatment of victims of abuse, empowering them, and resettling them.

The program theory that guided implementation of the FF Initiative is presented in the diagram in the appendix. The program theory describes the state of affairs that could realistically be attained as a result of program actions. The program theory represent the program as it was intended, linking expected outcomes to CBO functions and resources. The desired social goal of the Initiative was to “strengthen community based structures to protect child rights including protection from child marriage, sexual exploitation and other abuses”.

Core outcomes were four namely : a) capacity of CBOs developed to respond to child marriages; b) families create a protective environment for actualisation of children’s rights; c) strengthened linkages with local and government structures; and d) knowledge and evidence for child protection work. The Initiative was concerned with drawing learning from the choice of strategies and approaches or methods used, the processes, achievements and failures for future use.

The trained CBOS were in turn expected to train target and actions systems as well as children for the attainment of the core outcomes and desired social goals. The bottom of the theory diagram are the
triggers necessitating both capacity building and ending child marriage. These were to be assessed before these deficiencies could be effectively addressed.

The evaluation assessed whether the program theory was implemented as planned and how they went about the implementation, (the process), achievements and challenges. As part of the learning, the evaluation looked at the best practices and innovative approaches that could be adopted in the next phase.

3.2.2 Assumptions Firelight Foundation and partners worked with

Some of the assumptions the FF Initiative worked with were:- a) CBOs would be motivated to work in a more formalised manner; b) the trainers have adequate capacity to design training curriculum, training manuals, and deliver training sessions to adult learners from the CBOs; c) the CBOs are motivated to participate in the trainings; d) CBOs are able to translate learnings into practice at community levels; e) communities are mobilised and motivated to participate in project activities and f) communities are able to put into practices what they have learnt; and g) the support provided by FF to partners is adequate. Many of these issues are assessed and reported on later on this report.

3.3 The Program Structure

The Initiative had two arms to it: the capacity building arm and the service delivery one. The most important of the two was the capacity building sub program. The capacity building program was implemented by two CBOs namely Investing in Children and their Societies (ICS) and Agape. These were also called “lead partners” and/or “community granters”. These two CBOs were the sub – granters of FF grants to the CBOs. From 2015 to 2017 the capacity building was undertaken by these 2 lead partners. However, at the beginning of 2017, the capacity building program was centralized and allocated to ICS, which is also the overseer of the entire program. All the 12 CBOs including the lead partner undertake service delivery activities at the community level.

All CBOs use full time staff and volunteers to take services to the communities. Due to funding constraints and a high CBO staff attrition rates, and the need to sustain the community driven activities, FF introduced a sub structure of volunteers called “community facilitators” in all the 12 CBOs. These are residents in the communities who have been trained to undertake certain CBO activities in the villages and wards - some of the lower local government administrative units. Other CBOs like Agape also have crafted their own unique service delivery structures at the grassroots such as the community mobilisers who mobilise community members to start saving and loan groups to fight poverty.

The CBOs work with various district and ward level government departments and officials. At district level they work with :- community development, police gender and children desks, health departments, social welfare departments, planning departments, district commissioners, education departments and district executive directors. At ward level, they work with ward executives, community development officers, ward education coordinators, and health Centres. Others are the police, local leaders e.g. chairmen of villages, primary and secondary schools.

The Initiative is supervised by two Firelight Foundation staff members- the Program Officer, and the Learning and Evaluation Officer. The sub-sections that follow describe the responsibilities of the partners in the Initiative.
3.3.1 The Firelight Foundation Staff
The FF staffing model in Africa was reported to have changed; to a state of using program officers to provide technical aspects of programs. Thus, the Shinyanga program is overseen by two technical staff - a Program Officer and a Learning and Evaluation Officer. Both are non-residents of Shinyanga as they also oversee other FF programs in other countries of Africa. The Program Officer resides in Zimbabwe while the Learning and Evaluation Officer stays in Dar-es-Salaam. The Program Officer monitors the implementation of the program through quarterly visits to the project area which lasts between one and two weeks. During this time she conducts meetings with individual CBOS, conducts collective meetings with all the CBOS and visits the operational communities. The Program Officer receives and compiles the quarterly reports and annual reports from the CBOS for FF office in the US. The Program Officer, and Learning and Evaluation Officer both participate in annual planning meetings with the CBOS where they do not only train but also guide planning, implementation, budgeting, accountability while reminding them about FF policies and values.

3.3.2 Lead partners
ICS and Agape are the lead partners and community granters. Agape as a community granter is responsible for granting to three CBOS namely: WEADO, CHIDEP and YWCA. ICS is a granter to four CBOS namely: TVMC, PWWCO, MKOMBOZI, and YWL. Five CBOS namely ICS, Agape, TAI, OPE and RAFIKI Social Development Organization obtain their funds directly from FF. Until 2017, the two lead partners were responsible for undertaking the core activity of capacity building of CBOS. Capacity building has since been centralized under one lead partner- ICS. Centralization of CBO training ensures standardization of quality and products. Agape continued with community granting to the three CBOS.

The Initiative was reportedly anchored on ICS as a lead partner playing the coordinating role, capacity building role and providing on-site mentorship and monitoring to all the CBOS. The two lead partners also participate in the provision of direct and indirect services to communities for child protection. Most CBOS manage other donor funded projects besides that funded by the FF.

Despite the size of NGOs like Agape, OPE, RAFIKI, and TAI and the fact that they report directly to FF, they are still capacitated by ICS. Agape is also trained by ICS. The position of a lead partner was useful given the status of the CBOS. At the start of the FF partnership with CBOS, some CBOS had not yet registered with government and operated unprofessionally. Many did not like to be structured and work formally and professionally. However, with time they have come to realize the importance of the granting conditions.

3.3.3 Community Based Organizations
With the exception of Mkombozi and YWL, the remaining CBOS are non-government organisations (NGOs) registered at national level. This means that they can work in any other part(s) of the country other than the community they were founded. Only one organisation, ICS, is an international organisation with other offices in Kenya. Even if they are all NGOs, they vary in size - in terms of human resources and the number of projects they manage, the financial resources they command and
competences and professionalization of their staff. The CBOs had been in existence for between 12 years and 3 years. Six of the CBOs had been in partnership with FF for 2 years.

The duration of operations of the CBOs varied depending on when it got into partnership with FF. The shortest period of participation in the initiative to end child marriage was 10 months while the longest period was 4 years; the majority of the CBOs were in the partnership for 2 years.

Regardless of the time period a CBO had been a partner in the Initiative, it was still evaluated on whether they were able to implement what they planned to do in the year. On the other hand, each CBO has its own offices, constitution and governing board. The number of board members are between 7 and 25 people. Most of the board members are literate and some highly trained professionals.

3.3.3.1 The Governance boards of the CBOs
All the CBOs had management boards made up of up to 25 people with a majority having 8 people. Most of the governance boards were supposed to be renewed every three years but most had not been changed.

The responsibilities of the members of governance boards included: Make or pass policies; approve annual activity plans based on the ability of staff to impact the community, obtain reports and ensure activities are in line with purpose and mission of the NGO; oversee projects to ensure planned activities were effectively implemented; give guidance on challenges; undertake supervisory visits in community; hire and fire staff; ensure funds are spent correctly; mobilize resources; monitor organizational activities and performance. Most boards met once quarterly except when there were emergency issues to handle. Finance committees participate in budgeting.

3.3.3.2 The volunteers – community based facilitators, community based mobilisers, and Secret informers
All CBOs with the exception of one worked with volunteers. The cross cutting category of volunteers were the “community facilitators”. This cadre of staff was adapted by FF after observing high attrition rates of staff from CBOs who left after they had been trained. These left CBOs whenever CBOs run out of funds or had their grants delayed. To reduce on this inefficiency in the use of program resources, each CBO was asked to identify volunteers resident in their operational communities to undergo training and go back to offer services in their communities.

Community facilitators helped to mobilise parents and teach them skilful parenting modules. These were collectively trained by ICS on skilful parenting after which they were deployed by the CBOs in their respective operational communities. By August 2018 the Initiative had a total of 82 community facilitators. Five of these were trained in year 2015; 23 in 2016, and 54 between 2017 and 2018.

“Community based mobilisers” is another structure used largely by Agape. These are volunteers who were recruited to mobilise women in communities to form or join saving and credit groups to enable them access government loans for economic development. Economic development is relevant to ending child marriage because poverty is one established cause of child marriage in Tanzania.
The “secret informers” – this is a structure created by Agape. It was made up of community based volunteers recruited to look out for families which were planning to marry off their girls at a tender age. They secretly informed Agape, which in turn rescued the girl with the help of the police. Each village had between 2 to 4 informers, both men and women. These volunteered by themselves to be informers after attending films showed by Agape on the dangers of child marriage in their communities. These secret informers or whistle blowers commonly used telephones to inform AGAPE staff about a planned child marriage in their villages.

3.3.3.3 Agape Knowledge School
The Agape Knowledge School based at Chibe is part of the FF Initiative to end child marriage in the sense that all rescued girls from early marriages and other forms of abuse are accommodated in its hostel. It is at this Centre where girls rescued from early marriages obtain psychosocial support, rehabilitation, reunification, and reconciliation with their families; continue with their studies, and court processes. At the time of this evaluation, the school housed about 50 girls, seven of them were pregnant. The school provides secondary education from senior one to senior 4. Girls who do not want to continue with secondary education or those who have as yet to complete primary school education reside in its hostel where they commute from to go to vocational training centers and primary schools, respectively, in the surrounding communities. Although the school structures were built by another sponsor, the school is managed by Agape with the support from volunteer parents.

3. 4 CBO stated goals and objectives
All CBOs worked with more or less the same goal: to “end” child marriage and pregnancies. Some used the word “Stop” child marriage while others planned to “reduce” child marriage. The specific objectives CBOs worked with to guide their planning and programming are presented in the matrix below.

Matrix 5: Goals and Objectives of the Firelight Foundation Partner CBOs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CBO</th>
<th>Intervention objective /outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MKOMBOZI</td>
<td>1. To modify parents’ discriminative attitudes towards girls that lead to reduced access and use of societal opportunities such as education, and social development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. To empower parents, children, teachers and community leaders to identify and address risk factors leading to sexual abuses and child pregnancies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. To increase children’s knowledge of their rights and responsibilities in homes, schools and community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. To equip fathers and their families with financial budgeting knowledge and skills, for improved management and control of family resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. To reduce dropout rates of vulnerable girls and boys from primary schools in Shinyanga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Encourage reporting of child abuse cases or planned child marriages to police, child protection committees and CBO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAFIKI SDO</td>
<td>This is an organization which first worked on child labour in the gold mines of Kahama for 2 years April 2015-July 2017. Joined others to work on ending child marriage in July 2017. GOAL: ENDING CHILD LABOUR IN 3 FF SUPPORTED WARDS OF KAHAMA GOLD MINES Outcomes/Objectives : -</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. **REDUCE** the number of children (12-17 years) seeking work in gold mines in the 3 FF supported wards of Kahama
2. Promote children’s rights among parents and children and other actions systems in the 3 FF supported wards of Kahama.
3. Rescue and resettle children previously working in mines to vocational schools
4. Influence the enforcement of the child protection act of 2009 by all government agencies.
5. Ensure employers in the gold mines fenced the mines and equipped working children with protective gears for safety.
6. Advocate for increased budgets of services and support to vulnerable children by the local governments.

**GOAL:** TO END CHILD MARRIAGE IN 3 WARDS IN KAHAMA SUPPORTED BY FF

*Objectives / Outcomes*

1. Awareness creation of the dangers of child marriages and pregnancies to communities of Kahama.
2. Strengthen child protection committees at village level to enable them take a lead in child protection
3. Improve family wellbeing through provision of improved parenting skills.

**GOAL:** TO REDUCE CHILD MARRIAGE and PREGNANCIES

*Outcomes/ objectives:*

1. Increase awareness of sexual and reproductive health issues in schools
2. Increase awareness of sexual and reproductive health and rights to out of school mothers
3. Improve skillful parenting and life skills for out of school children and entire communities
4. Strengthen economic capacity of young mothers

**CHIDEP**

**GOAL:** TO END CHILD MARRIAGES AND PREGNANCIES

*Outcomes/ objectives:

1. Increase primary and secondary students’ knowledge of the effects of child marriage and pregnancies on their lives
2. Develop students’ life skills on how to protect themselves against unwanted pregnancies and child marriage
3. Increase awareness of communities regarding the dangers of child pregnancies
4. Improve parenting skills of both men and women in 3 wards of Shinyanga Municipality – Ndala, Ngokolo, and Old Shinyanga
5. Strengthen school clubs (those concerned with social development issues of children) and child protection committees
6. To pursue issues of child pregnancy with the police and hospital to make sure the girl gets social justice and support.

**The Voice of Marginalized Communities (TVMC)**

**GOAL:** END CHILD MARRIAGE AND PREGNANCY

*Outcomes/ objectives:

1. Rescue school girls planned for marriages by parents
2. Follow up girls impregnated while in school to make sure the justice law and order sector prosecutes, convicts, and sentences culprits.
3. Awareness creation of communities and school systems about the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies and the need to report child rights violators.
4. Resettle pregnant and young mothers in viable economic activities
### Women Elderly Advocacy Development Organization (WEADO)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goal: End child marriage and girl pregnancy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcomes /objectives</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Improve attitudes and behaviours of parents towards girl children and their rights including right to education and maximization of potentials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Reduce the number of girls marrying before they reached the age of 18 years in Tinde Ward, Shinyanga Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Increase reporting of children planned for marriage before the age of 18 in communities and other child abuse cases to police, social welfare offices, child protection committees and WEADO.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Increase the awareness of the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies to school teachers and adolescent children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Increase the number of girls that complete school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Improve CBO understanding of the spaces children and adults consider unsafe in the targeted operational areas through community mapping</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Promising World for women and Children Organization (PWWCO)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goal: End child marriage and pregnancies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcomes /objectives:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Organize women into viable economic groups able to access government loans for their economic and social development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Improve parenting skills and child protection at family level for attainment of children’s rights and maximization of potentials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Increase self-awareness of primary school girls’ (from standard /primary 4 to 7) sexuality and reproductive health and rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Strengthen life skills of girls in the areas of developing self-esteem and self-care, abstinence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Create school clubs and use club members act as peer educators on sexual and reproductive health and self-identity to colleagues</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Organization of People Empowerment (OPE)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goal: End child marriage and pregnancies to ensure girls accomplish their life goals and dreams.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcomes/Objectives:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Change parents’ perceptions of seeing girls as a source of wealth and education as being meant for boys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. A community which values education for both boys and girls in Kishapu Municipal Council for attainment of their life goals and maximization of their potentials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Empower poor families with income generating activities to reduce temptations to marry off girls below 18 years in Kishapu Municipal Council.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Strengthen child protection committees to be enable them enforce the Child Protection Act.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Advocate and lobby district /municipal councils to increase the funding of the child protection service delivery systems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Equip children out of school with vocational skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Empower school going children with knowledge of the sexual and reproductive health for self-protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Return children who had dropped out of school because of marriage or pregnancy back to school</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The objectives that all the CBOS used to guide their planning and programming were in line with the program theory. They thought that to reduce child marriage, they had to address the causal factors within the child, the family, the communities and community child protection service delivery structures of government. All the 12 CBOS addressed the causal factors within the child and families. They addressed the parents’ poor knowledge of children’s rights, the discriminatory and negative attitudes towards girl child’s education; and poor parenting skills. In relation to communities, all CBOS addressed the limited awareness of communities to the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies; and encouraged reporting of planned child marriages to relevant authorities.
Nine CBOs had objectives to strengthen the performance of child protection structures to enable them take a lead in child protection issues or to get into alliance with the CBO to work on child marriage problems together. Three CBOs had an advocacy objective to influence local governments to enact laws to prevent child marriages, require parents to keep children in school and to ensure they allocated adequate funds for child protection services and service delivery structures. Two CBOs had objectives to mobilize women into savings and loan groups to fight poverty; a phenomenon reportedly associated with child marriage. Two CBOs had objectives to economically empower out of school youths and single teenage mothers. Two CBO wanted to influence existing bylaws and resource allocation for child protection.

All CBOs thought that one strategic path for reducing child marriage was to keep the girl child in school. To achieve this the CBOs addressed the factors within the child that were responsible for the child dropping out of the school. These included limited knowledge of the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies, child rights, life skills including self-esteem and self-care, sexual and reproductive health and rights, and institutions to report child abuse. Other drivers of child marriage lying within the child included lack of knowledge of themselves and their rights; knowledge of the body changes and needs during puberty, powerlessness and voicelessness, and inability to demand for their rights.

Two CBOs addressed issues of sexual and reproductive health and rights for teenagers. Three CBOs had objectives to do with rescuing girls that had been earmarked for early marriage, resettling them and pursuing social justice for them and with them. These included Agape, TVMC and OPE.

3.4 Some observations by the Evaluation Team
From the foregoing analysis, the Evaluation Team was able to make the following observations:-

a) The CBOs’ decision to handle causal factors of child marriage from the perspective of community, family, and the child, was in tandem with the program theory and is commendable.

b) All CBOs associated the social cultural practices of child marriages to “limited community awareness of the dangers of child marriage and pregnancy”. The assumption was that once CBOs improved people’s knowledge about the dangers of child marriage then that should bring out the necessary transformation in attitudes and behaviours towards girl children and reduce the vice of child marriage. This was a good starting point for transforming family and community social cultural practices. However, according to communication and behavioral change scientists, provision of factual information about a problem or disease does not by itself lead to individual behavioral change[29]. This is issues is further discussed in chapter 5.

c) While all the CBOs discouraged child marriage and teenage pregnancies, they also promoted alternative acceptable practices of encouraging parents to keep girl children in schools and providing skillful parenting to enable parents to be better responsible parents. This was commendable.

d) Although all CBOs were working under the same Initiative attempting to attain the same goal, few CBOs universally addressed the common determinants (besides that relating to social cultural norms and practices) of child marriage practices such as poverty, sexual and
reproductive health and rights, byelaws, advocacy. Each CBO chose her own intervention strategies disregarding their contribution to the overall program goal. This meant that few communities, families and children had all their causal factors of child marriage problem comprehensively addressed. This created gaps and non-standardization of anticipated outcomes/products; threatening the likely impact of the Initiative on the problem. The non-comprehensive address of the causal factors by each CBO actor was partly due to individualized CBO problem definition, and planning, as well as minimal coordination of plans. CBOs perceived themselves as independent entities and not contributing to the same goal and mission.

c) Only one CBO, Agape, had an objective addressing documentation, research, and learning; yet this was one major outcome of the FF initiative. Possible explanations could be inability of CBOs to interpret what the outcome was about and its rationale; or lack of capacity to tackle this program objective. It is also possible that CBOs had very many activities to implement in a very short time (1-2 years on average). This further implies that perhaps FF was a little ambitious to require CBOs also to implement this activity. FF may need to prioritize activities taking into account available implementation time to partners. Whatever the reason, there may be need to operationalize this objective and develop capacities of CBOs to implement it in the future.

f) The linkage goal in the program theory was not also well addressed. Some included it in their objectives while others did not.

3.5 CBO geographical operational areas
The Firelight Foundation Initiative to end child marriage in Shinyanga Region was implemented in 2 districts of Shinyanga Rural and Kishapu; 1 municipal council of Shinyanga, and 1 town council of Kahama. Kahama rural district was not reached. The matrix below shows the number and percentage coverage of the wards and villages reached by the program. The Initiative covered a total of 67 wards and 238 villages. These constituted 76% and 50% ward and village coverage respectively.

Table 1: Percentage coverage of geographical areas served by Firelight Foundation supported CBOs as by August 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CBO</th>
<th>District/ Municipal council</th>
<th>Total wards existing in district/ municipality</th>
<th>Number of operational wards (%)</th>
<th>Total villages/streets in operational wards</th>
<th>Number of villages served (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OPE</td>
<td>Kishapu district</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6 (24%)</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>28 (22.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWL</td>
<td>Shinyanga Municipal</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2 (12%)</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>4 streets (5.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVMC</td>
<td>Shinyanga Municipal</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4 (23.5%)</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>18 (25%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAI</td>
<td>Shinyanga Rural &amp; Kishapu district</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>3 (11.5%)</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>5 (4.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>2 (8%)</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>2 (2.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>Shinyanga Municipal</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2 (11.8%)</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>2 (2.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICS</td>
<td>Shinyanga Municipal</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4 (23.5%)</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>8 (11.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shinyanga Rural</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>12 (46.2%)</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>31 (24.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kahama Town Council</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10 (50%)</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>55 (71.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAFIKI</td>
<td>Kahama Town Council</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3 (15%)</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>3 (3.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shinyanga Municipal</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGAPE</td>
<td>Shinyanga Municipality</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shinyanga Rural</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHIDEP</td>
<td>Shinyanga Municipal</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shinyanga Rural</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MKOMB</td>
<td>Shinyanga Rural</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OZI</td>
<td>Shinyanga Municipal</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2 districts; 1 municipality, and 1 town council</td>
<td>88 wards</td>
<td>67 wards</td>
<td>473 villages*</td>
<td>238 villages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% coverage</td>
<td>76.1%</td>
<td>50.3%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: the existing number of villages per district and municipality were counted once.

The smaller percentage of the villages (50%) reached indicates that the CBOs did not cover all the villages in each of the operational wards. There was too much spread of CBOs and fragmentation of service delivery across the wards and villages. This was confirmed to be true during the validation workshop. The expectation of the local government after deploying the CBOs was that each CBO would be able to cover all the villages in the wards they were allocated. However, this was not possible given that Tanzanian villages are very big. It was explained that ‘you can spend a whole day with a land cruiser moving in one village without completing it’ (Executive Director - ICS). A ward has about 6 villages and a village has 4 sub-locations. Even when a CBO is allocated wards or villages it cannot cover the entire ward or village because of their vastness. The current fragmentation of service delivery structuring was most likely costly, inefficient, adversely affecting the impact of the program.

Another observation from the table above is the high coverage of urban areas and especially Shinyanga Municipality where CBOs covered almost 100 of the wards and 72 per cent of the streets. Smaller CBOs like YWL, CHIDEP, WEADO, and PWWCO operated largely in the urban communities of Shinyanga Municipality. Big organizations like ICS and Agape, RAFIKI, and OPE worked in both the urban and rural districts of Shinyanga. TAI worked purely in the rural districts of Kishapu and Shinyanga. Mkombozi the smallest CBO also operated in the rural areas as this is where it is located and was founded. The reader is, however, cautioned that impressive geographical coverage do not mean population reach and coverage with services. This issue is followed up later when discussing service population coverage issues. About 32 per cent (18/51) of the wards in the rural districts of Shinyanga and Kishapu were reached by the FF partner CBOs. These findings have implications for the next phase of the initiative.

*The CBOs covered quite impressive numbers of wards and villages in the region. However, they spread too much leaving many wards, villages and people unreached with services. This means that the next phase will need to reach out to fill the geographical gaps with services if the Initiative is to make the desired social impacts.*
3.6 Financing of CBO Activities

3.6.1 FF granting models and their conditions

The Initiative operates with grants provided by FF. The granting uses two models: the direct granting and sub-granting or community granting. At the time of this evaluation, FF directly disbursed funds to five CBOs namely Agape, ICS, RAFIKI, TAI and OPE. Sub-granting was done by the lead partners - ICS and Agape. Agape sub-granted to three CBOs namely: WEADO, CHIDEP, and YWCA; while ICS sub-granted to four CBOs namely: YWL, TVMC, PWWCO, and Mkombozi.

The sub-granting models were justified with the following words:

*If there were no lead partners and the CBOs were getting money directly from FF, there would be trouble because basing on our experience, …if they are getting money directly from FF and no one is looking at them, when the money comes in, what they do is they write cheques, they sign, they go to the bank, they take the money and start spending it without any documentation and work. A good example was one CBO (former grantee-partner) which closed its offices for 2 months and was not undertaking any activity in the community and yet it had drawn all the quarterly grant from the bank and used it without any activity (Executive Director, ICS).*

The CBOs to which each granting model was applied differed along the level of organisational development such as size, existence of professionalized staff, and experience in managing donor funded projects. CBOs with professional staff, experienced in managing donor funded projects, abilities in writing project proposals, and managing reporting and accountability, reported and obtained funds directly from FF in the USA. Actually the FF Program Officer clarified that all the CBOs that sent in their initial project proposals directly to FF reported to FF. CBOs with limited capacities to write project proposals and manage resources and accountabilities obtained their funds through the lead partners. This implies that the lead partners have the responsibilities to help the CBOs where they are weakest such as writing a proposal and to oversee their activities including budgeting and accountabilities to FF.

The CBOs that obtained funds directly from FF obtained their funds annually while those which obtained their funding from the lead partners obtained theirs on a quarterly basis upon meeting certain accountability conditions. Although FF released the grants to ICS and Agape annually, the lead partners released this money to CBOs quarterly.

The conditions for release of funds from Agape and ICS were: - reporting and provision of proper supportive documents and verification. By these standards, the CBOs that obtained funding from lead partners underwent more scrutiny in the form of monitoring than the CBOs that obtained funding direct from FF. Their accountabilities were verified at the grassroots with actual activities undertaken in the communities. The grant is supposed to be spent in accordance with the budget lines. The next payment to the CBO was made after receipt of the CBO activity reports for the quarter. This was commendable as it assured efficient use of the grants. However, the CBOs’ that obtained their grants directly from FF did not go through the rigorous verification of their activities since the FF Financial management experts did not visit the CBOs to look at the financial reports.
At the time of this evaluation, the schedules for release of community granted funds had been changed from quarterly releases to monthly for the CBOs sub-granted by ICS. This shift from quarterly to monthly releases was to help manage risks that were associated with identifying issues and addressing them in a timely manner. Agape sub-granted CBOs were, however, still receiving funding on a quarterly basis.

### 3.6.2 Planning, budgeting, and adequacy of grants received by partners

The process of obtaining money from FF and the community granters involved annual planning and budgeting on an individual basis by CBOs. FF indicated the amount she was granting for the phase through the lead partner. The lead partner informed the CBOs under her that FF had released a certain amount of money; and they were told to prioritize their activities and make sure that budgets fell within the granted money. The CBO submitted her activities and a budget to the lead partner who in turn released the money. The activities undertaken for the new phase were determined by learning from the last phase.

CBOs planned and budgeted individually; and the finances granted to each varied in amount. The grants ranged from US $10,000-20,000 annually for the CBOs that obtained funding directly from FF headquarters. CBOs that obtained their grants from Lead Partners got an average of US$10,000. However, there were some exceptions when some CBOs could be given more money than others in the same group. For example, in financial year 2017/2018, TAI requested and obtained more funding to enable it graduate from being a sub-grantee, to getting grants directly from FF. TAI had to recruit more professional staff and so her grant was slightly higher.

Generally, most CBOs reported that the funding they obtained from FF was inadequate. For example, one CBO reported that one of the 4 staff members was not paid an allowance. Also the allowances they got were very low. The staff got Tanzanian Shillings 81,000/= while the chairman got 101,500/=. Three other villages requested to participate in the initiative but the CBO did not have adequate funding to expand. That CBO wanted to expand its operations to ten more villages but it could not because limited funding from FF. The CBO also lacked money to handle urgent cases. This was not only a problem for only that CBO but also for many other CBOs.

For example, another CBO obtained a total of US $45,000/= out of which $15,000 was for the first year 2016/2017 and $30,000 for 2017/2018. In the first year she had budgeted and requested for 25,000 dollars but obtained less. This meant they had to reduce the scope of the planned activities, number of targeted beneficiaries and communities. The staff had to do the baseline study which they had required an expert consultant to do. This took them a lot of time because the same staff had to implement the NGO activities.
3.6.3 CBO partner satisfaction with the granting models
When the CBOs were asked to assess the levels of satisfaction with the FF granting models, their responses were best illustrated by one CBO’s experiences. Initially, that CBO obtained her funding through one of the two Lead Partners but accessing funding used to take too long and was cumbersome. She used to obtain lesser money than requested from the lead partner and usually payments delayed which affected the implementation of the planned activities. Money was obtained as the CBO was implementing the planned activities. Receipt of another batch of money depended upon that Lead Partner’s acceptance of the activity report. Payments were based on submission and acceptance of a quarterly report rather than on the approved planned activity and budget. Reviewing reports used to take as long as 3 months. The money was given in installments – quarters and yet it was known that FF had submitted the whole money for the year. Payments in installments made the community granting model unacceptable to that CBO. The lead partners were reported to have created their own conditions of releasing and managing funds. That CBO later requested FF to obtain their funding directly from the sponsor FF and it was accepted. Many of these challenges of the community granting model were also reckoned by other CBOs still operating under the community granting model.

All CBOs spent their grants in accordance with the agreed upon expenditure plan - per line item. Some highly formalized CBOs like TAI tracked different expenditures using a budget monitoring tool. Expenditures were also partly influenced by the organizational financial policies. All CBOs had developed their financial policies and with the active participation of the governance boards in financial control, FF grants were assured of efficient utilization. This is highly commendable.

3.6.4 Challenges
All CBOs reported the delays to receive their grants for the year 2017/2018. The funds were released 6 months late which made implementation of a 12 months activity plan to be squeezed into 6 months. This was a big problem particularly to CBOs that had only one source of income. Although they are encouraged to get multiple sources of funding only a few CBOs who obtained funds direct from FF had been able to achieve that. These are ICS, Agape, TAI, and RAFIKI.

CBOs also reported that they did not meet regularly to share practice experiences and challenges. They first met and got to know each other during the meeting organized in early 2017 in Mwanza. Before then, there were no formalized meetings of CBOs to share and learn from each other. Beyond the workshop meetings organized by the lead partners, there had been few meetings that ever brought the CBOs together. The few meetings that have been conducted involving some CBOs had been more informal in nature.

Only one CBO - WEADO reported having participated with five other CBOs in managing a youth forum for Shinyanga in March 2018 with FF funding. The CBOs that worked together were WEADO, YWCA, CHIDEP, YWL, PWWCO, and AGAPE. Such opportunities to work together were minimal. Failure for CBOs to regularly meet to share practice experience and continue to learn from each other threatens the attainment of one of the program outcome of building knowledge and
evidence for child protection work. It also implies presence of a leadership vacuum to coordinate and work together as “departments” to the Initiative.

*There is an observable leadership vacuum in the Initiative threatening coordination and sharing of knowledge and experiences for the attainment of a common goal.*
CHAPTER FOUR
PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION: CAPACITY BUILDING

4.0 Introduction
This Chapter presents findings relating to capacity building activities of the FF Initiative. It specifically presents findings relating to the activities undertaken by FF and CBO partners in preparation for capacity building; issues CBOs were trained on; approaches use in capacity building; the trainers and their capacities; achievements and challenges; and capacity building gaps. Findings are discussed and recommendations made.

4.1 Capacity building of CBOs: Activities undertaken in relation to Program theory
Capacity building involved several actors and processes. The actors included FF, ICS, AGAPE, and consultants. The processes involved a determination of the competences FF desired to be attained by the CBOs, undertaking an assessment of the baseline of the organizational capacity, and capacities to protect children, designing and getting together training manuals and human resources to do the training; delivery of trainings, providing individualized mentoring, problem solving and support to each CBO.

4.2 Activities undertaken in preparation for capacity building
The process of capacity building of the CBOs involved FF undertaking an organizational tour to assess the organizational development strengths and deficiencies. This was done for each of the 9 organizations before ICS became the lead partner responsible for capacity building. FF undertook a baseline assessment of the organisational capacity of the CBOs and capacity to undertake child protection activities using an organisational development tool (ODT) and child protection assessment tool (CPT). The baseline was done and repeated in the subsequent years. The report was used to design the curriculum. This was a relevant and commendable activity; in line with the program theory of assessing the weakness before they could be addressed. This baseline assessment was also appropriate for monitoring and assessing change in CBO capacities.

Baseline of the existing capacities of CBOs in organizational development capacity and child protection were done by FF and ICS at the beginning of the Program and in subsequent years. This was relevant for assessing changes in capacities later on.

The issues assessed with the ODT were: a) identity and agency – that is , clarity about why a CBO exists and how that sense of purpose guides what it does; b) child rights- the extent the CBO engages children, including participation, context and rights of the child; c) structure and function – how the CBO focuses its direction and relevancy in its programming; d) relationships – this considered the role of networking within the organisation and nature of relationships with children, community and external stakeholder; e) human resources – adequacy of staffing and effectiveness of volunteer management; f) financial resources- resource mobilisation and financial management of the organisation; g) governance, leadership and management – understanding the role and function of the
board, leaderships while exploring the existence of systems and procedures to guide efficient management of the organisation.

The child protection tool assessed 5 areas notably: a) children and organisation- that is, organisational clarity on its role to protect children, staff members’ behaviour towards children –non-violent, degrading or humiliating and listening; b) policies and procedures – the existence and completeness of an organisational child protection policy, and clear agreed child protection procedures; c) preventing harm to children – steps to prevent harm to children, including clear guidance and professional development for staff, volunteers; d) implementation – policies and procedures of implementation including detailed guidelines for staff behaviour, consequences for failing to follow guidelines, and ways concerns can be raised; f) information and communication – how children are made aware of their rights and provided information on where to go for help and advice; and g) monitoring and review- how the organisation monitors compliance with child protection procedures as well as allegations or incidents of abuse.

Overall findings from the ODT assessment indicated that 11 CBOs had an average score of 3.64 (possible range 1 to 5); and overall scores ranging from 2.73 to 4.54. With regard to child protection capacity, the overall average for the cohort was 10.82 (out of 12) with overall scores ranging from 9.67 to 12.00. The findings guided planning for capacity building in 2015. The exercise of doing the organizational capacity assessment was repeated in the second year 2016 by ICS to determine the gaps to address for the second year.

Capacity building needs identified in subsequent years were:

- a) Governance: some CBOs did not have governing boards, did not know the importance of organizational boards, and the process of creating them.
- b) Need to review CBO constitutions and the need for governance structure to be in line with the constitution.
- c) Did not understand issues of strategic planning and getting their organizations to be more focused. Some of them were aiming at doing very many things from HIV, agriculture, education, child protection etc.
- d) Program design and implementation;
- e) Leadership especially the issues relating to human resources, succession, planning and performance management. Many organizations used to experience very high staff attrition.
- f) Child protection and how to use government guidelines. Many CBOs wanted to engage in child protection but they did not exactly know what child protection involved and they did not know how to use government guidelines.
- g) Community mobilization and awareness creation strategies.

---


h) Finance – Some CBOs did not have resource management policies while others called for review of policies such as financial policies, human resource policies, procurement policies, and development of financial management tools i.e. request tools, return forms, reporting templates in terms of finance and programs.

i) Lack of knowledge of key technical child protection skills like skillful parenting

Although the CBOs participated by giving information about themselves during the FF fact finding tours of the organizations, they reported during this evaluation that they were never engaged in the identification of the training needs assessments which informed the design of the capacity building sub-program. This controversy could be due to the top–down nature of the processes used to collect information on CBO training needs. In future there is need to clearly explain the purpose for collecting information. Nonetheless, they further reported that although they did not participate in identifying the training needs, the trainings given were relevant to their operations. They also reported that the subsequent training needs assessments done in 2017 and 2018 involved them.

4.3 Planned and implemented capacity building activities

The planned and implemented capacity building activities undertaken by both ICS and AGAPE between year 2015 and mid-2018 are presented in the Appendix – Matrix B at the back of this report. The evaluation team did not obtain both the planned and implemented capacity building activities for both ICS and AGAPE for each of the four years except for year 2016. The team could, therefore, not establish the fidelity of the capacity building activities and percentage by which planned activities were implemented. However, a close look at the planned and implemented capacity building activities by ICS in 2016 indicates that most planned capacity building activities were implemented. Some activities were repeated because of the new CBOs which were transferred from AGAPE and those which were recruited into the program later. Some modules such as family budgeting were reported by some CBOs not have been covered although it had been planned for.

In summary, the CBO training addressed organizational development and management issues, child protection issues, resource management and control; and project management, networking and linkages with governments at local and national levels. The training also acquainted CBO trainees with relevant national laws and policies. One of the child protection policy given time and effort was the newly enacted National Plan of Action to End Violence against Women and Children in Tanzania (2016). The new policy requires CBOs to address violence against both children and women and not just children as has been the case. All the CBOs confirmed during the evaluations interviewed that they had obtained training in these areas.

ICS started doing capacity building with 8 CBOS namely: Agape, RAFIKI, Young Women Leadership, Mkombozi, Thubutu Africa Initiative, TVMC and the Voice of Young Mothers, Organisation of People Empowerment (OPE). The Voice of Young Mothers in Kahama defaulted and was struck off the list of partners and instead was replaced by PWWCO in 2017.

In 2016, there was expansion of partnerships. Three more CBOS were recruited to join the earlier 8 whose training had started in 2015. The new CBOs recruited were: WEADO, CHIDEP and YWCA.
The recruitment of the 3 new CBOS meant that they were at different levels of organizational capacity and performance from the 8 CBOS originally trained and supported by ICS. ICS had to start afresh on capacity building of the 3 CBOS. This is why ICS is shown in the matrix B in the appendix as repeating capacity building topics each year. It started with doing an organizational capacity assessment to determine the existing gaps in capacity. During the planning exercise for 2017, ICS made two capacity building plans; one for the older CBOS and the second for the 3 new CBOS. Later in 2017, another CBO also got on board to replace The Voice of Young Mothers which had defaulted and had been terminated.

One major observation from the above narration of the training process is ICS’s sensitivity to the individual capacities of the CBOS. ICS individualized capacity assessments and training. This is highly commendable because it attempted to pull all CBOS to the same levels of capacity as others while at the same time moving at the pace of each.

*The practice of individualizing capacity assessments of CBOS, planning and training each in accordance with its organizational development needs is highly commendable as it assures individual CBO growth while keeping the program goal in mind.*

Although AGAPE had the longest working relationship with FF, she did not start training CBOS until 2016. Agape was contracted to build the capacities of three CBOS namely WEADO, CHIDEP, and YWCA. However, in 2017/2018 the responsibility of capacity building was shifted from Agape and given to ICS. This is why in the matrix above, only one financial year of capacity building by Agape is reported on.

While the management decision to centralize capacity building improved standardization of training and skills development assuring comparable outcomes of the trained products (CBOS), the management style used by FF to communicate the decision threatened relationships between Agape and FF and relationships between the lead partners. However, the decision made by FF might have led to more efficient use of resources as it avoided duplication of effort in capacity building, through cutting out the training of the similar issues to small groups of CBOS by the two lead partners. The efficiency benefit would, however, accrue on conditions that ICS had adequate capacity in terms of staff numbers, and time to commit to training, mentoring and supporting the many CBOS allocated to her. At the time of this evaluation the FF had not yet worked out the optimal number of CBOS that a lead partner could efficiently and effectively train, mentor and support in a situation where the lead partners also participated in the service delivery arm. Interviews with the FF Program Officer indicated that FF had the prerogative to choose and use whatever number of lead partners to support the growing numbers of CBOS. This issue may need to be further followed up and appropriate decisions taken on the number of NGOs to use to do capacity building after undertaking a costing and cost benefit analysis.

*Centralization of capacity building by making one lead partner to do capacity building was relevant for standardizing the quality of the product (CBO) and ensuring more efficient use of resources. However, given that capacity building also involves individual CBO mentoring and support which are labour and time intensive, it is wondered whether ICS will continue to be effective in undertaking all those roles*
FF may need to openly and transparently discuss and assess the capability of ICS to shoulder the load including her engagement in service delivery to communities.

4.3 Activities undertaken in relation to Firelight Foundation desired competences

The evaluation also assessed the extent desired competences for FF partner CBOs were addressed by the capacity building exercise. The matrix below shows the competences addressed during the training.

**Matrix 6: Competences addressed during the capacity building of CBOs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FF required competence</th>
<th>Competence addressed</th>
<th>Competences not addressed or inadequately addressed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Increase CBOs’ organizational capacity in child protection including child protection policies, case management systems and referrals</td>
<td>Organizational capacity in child protection and policies</td>
<td>Case management systems and referrals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Increase in CBO’s skills and approaches for building community capacity</td>
<td>Community facilitators taught how to mobilize and organize parents into peer groups; Parenting skills provided to CBOs for onward transmission to parents to improve parenting skills; Local government staff trained</td>
<td>Was inadequately addressed because the scope of CBO training needs in the area of building community capacity was not defined and assessed at the start of the project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. CBO strengthened (or introduce new programs in social and emotional support for especially vulnerable populations such as adolescent girls or children with disability</td>
<td></td>
<td>This particular competence on understanding and addressing social and emotional needs of vulnerable children was not addressed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. CBOs improve in organizational management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. CBOs are more sustainable</td>
<td></td>
<td>Not addressed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The linkage competences:- a) CBOs advocate for child rights and child protection at district and national levels b) CBOs and informal community structures have strong referral networks and c) CBOs collaborate with government to track data on safety of children</td>
<td>CBOs were taught the important child protection policies and the need to collaborate with government officials and child protection policies</td>
<td>The linkage competences were inadequately addressed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Advocacy knowledge and skills were not provided to CBOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tracking data on the safety of children was also not addressed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Some competences were addressed while others were not. Some were not adequately addressed. The competences that were very well addressed were those to do with improving organizational management and organizational capacity in child protection. Competences not adequately addressed
included sustainability issues, understanding and managing the social and emotional states of vulnerable children, advocacy, tracking data on safety of children, case management and referral systems and community capacity building. Although CBOs were not trained on these areas, they were, however, practicing them. For example, Agape which was targeting victims of child marriage, was regularly managing vulnerable children in need of social and emotional support. Other CBOs like WEADO and YWL were managing teen single mothers who were equally yoked in social and emotional problems. Many organizations including Agape, YWL, OPE, RAFIKI were engaged in advocacy work during this project time but without the requisite knowledge and skills. This implies that the competence as conceived by FF at the start of the project was and is still relevant to guiding capacity building activities and still needs to be programmed for.

The evaluators observed that it was difficult to determine the extent to which some competence areas were implemented because some had not been defined or operationalized. Also some did not have baseline measurements. One good example of this is the “increase in the ability of the CBO to build community capacity”. One question that arises with this competence is, what capacities did the FF initiatives require communities to possess that communities did not have, and which CBOs had to help communities acquire?

FF may need to define some of these competences and also obtain baseline data on them.

The capacity building project ably addressed the competences to improve organizational management and organizational capacity for child protection. However, many planned competences were either not addressed at all or were inadequately addressed. All FF desired competences were relevant since CBOs were applying them (albeit through trial and error) during service delivery. The next phase needs to pick on those competences not yet addressed and those inadequately addressed.

4.4 Processes of capacity building

4.4.1 Curriculum used in capacity building of FF Partner CBOs

The curricula used by the lead partners to train CBO staff and board members were obtained from different sources including government’s child protection departments, finance departments and also those developed by the lead partners themselves. Some curricula were international customized by the lead partner to suit the levels of development and functionality of the CBOs. This was true, for example, with the material content covered on organizational development and management.

Other curriculum and particularly that of Skillful Parenting had been developed by ICS. This curriculum had been shared with the government of Tanzania, approved, and adopted by the Ministry of Health, Community Development, Children and Elderly for use in the entire country. Government had a model of skillful parenting but it was not comprehensive enough; and so, the government adopted one developed by ICS. ICS has been part of the national team which developed the skillful parenting model currently used by CBOs to train parents. The use of nationally and internationally tested out and approved curriculum was a sign of quality assurance, relevance, and effectiveness. It also meant efficiency in the use of program resources.
The evaluators did not access the curriculum for the different courses offered. However, they were able to access the curriculum of the Skillful Parenting. This particular course comprised of 8 modules namely: a) family relations; b) roles and responsibilities of a skillful parent; c) self-esteem and self-care; d) values and discipline; e) communication; f) economic strengthening; g) family budgeting covering issues of setting family goals, planning, setting priorities, allocating resources, spending resources based on priorities, saving money for their families; h) child protection tool kit. Family budgeting and the child protection kit was developed by consultants.

4.4.2 Methods of training and training manuals used
The capacity building activities involved use of several methods including workshops, individualized mentoring and support, and practical sessions to consolidate learning. Workshops involved several CBOs who were trained on selected modules together. Such trainings were conducted at the ICS or Agape offices.

The individualized level tutoring and mentoring was based on each CBO’s unique and peculiar competence needs. This training was provided on site in the offices of the CBO. The trainings given by both ICS and Agape also involved practical sessions where the trainees were required to practice out what they had learnt. Thus, a study about strategic planning was followed by a requirement by the CBO to write out a strategic plan for their organization. This was useful in consolidating what they had learnt in theory and it was an effective and efficient way of using resources while producing outputs of relevance to the CBOs. The Initiative largely used government approved training manuals, materials from departments of finance of local government, and those developed by ICS headquarters and Agape.

The child protection manual used was developed by government. When training on government policies and guidelines and child protection issues, ICS used government technical staff who used the government approved training manuals. This assured quality of content given. Government manuals did not only assure quality of content, relevance, and appropriateness to social, cultural and political context, but they were continually revised and updated. CBOs needed to use the updated manuals. This is why training covered government guidelines with CBOs. Some CBOs had the practice of developing their own manuals and using them. For example, some had developed their own training manuals for sexual and reproductive health, and had not obtained approvals from government. Being a culturally sensitive area to train in Tanzania, ICS guided them on this and linked them to Tanzania Red Cross Society (TRCS) which had already developed expertise in SRHR and was using already government approved training manuals. TRCS had also been sub-contracted by ICS to deliver some services in this area for another project under ICS. TRCS was helping the CBOs that were sensitizing school children on sexual and reproductive health issues.

*The use of government approved training materials and government technical staff in the training of CBOs is commendable as it ensured provision of acceptable, quality child protection services to the communities. The approach ensured sustainability of service provision by local governments when FF support to CBOs ceases.*
4.4.3 Duration /dose of training by ICS

Since 2015, most of the training on organizational issues lasted for between 2-3 days; three times a year. The community facilitators were trained on the first 5 modules for six days. Thereafter, they were given one and a half months, to go back to their communities to practice what they had learnt. When they returned after about 2 months they did examinations – oral, and written. They were then taken to the communities and told to train parents under observation of the ICS trainers. Depending on the performance of an individual they were given ranks – notably: “the main facilitator”, “core facilitator” and “community mobiliser”. Starting in 2017 the community facilitators were trained with staff from the CBOs. At the time of the evaluation, all community facilitators had covered 6 modules and had qualified to train parents. They were as yet left to do family budgeting.

There was differentiated rigor in the training of different courses and persons. While all the courses were accompanied by practicing of what had been learnt, the Skillful parenting was accompanied by examinations and certification. The examinations helped to consolidate learning and built confidence amongst trainees. The examinations were applied to volunteers who were recruited after CBOs experienced a lot of staff attrition. The CBO staff interviewed during the evaluation did not report that they were exposed to examinations. They, however, indicated that they were required to put into practice what they learnt in the workshops organized by both ICS and Agape. They were followed up by the trainers to ensure they were doing what they were trained to do. The rigor in training does not only standardize training, but is likely to ensure effectiveness of service delivery by the trained people and CBOs as well as easing outcome assessments. The rigor is also likely to make CBOs more professional in the way they deliver services at the grassroots.

It was not clear why the CBO staff were not exposed to examinations as the community facilitators to ensure quality provision of services at the grass roots.

4.2.4 Trainers and their capacities

Generally, the capacity building sub-program was managed by people who were competent and specialized in the relevant disciplines and occupations. Different staff in ICS taught different modules. For example, the financial management module was taught by the Finance Officer of ICS. Some modules on organizational development was managed by specialized colleagues from the ICS Kenya branch. Organizational capacity for child protection was taught by senior government staff from the departments of social welfare and community development. Likewise, the new policy to fight violence against children and women was taught by senior staff from the Ministry of Health, Community Development, Gender, Elderly, and Children. The Tanzanian Red Cross also trained some CBOS in the areas of sexual and reproductive health. In essence, the major role of ICS staff, Tanzania Branch was that of mobilization of CBOs and experts to do the training, organization and coordination of training.

The skillful parenting module was managed by a Master trainer- the ICS Program Officer. The ICS program manager, Sabrina, has been well trained and certified in skillful parenting and child safeguarding and has been leading the training of skillful parenting. The Executive Director, himself also had training in skillful parenting. Trainers of skillful parenting undergo intensive and rigorous
theoretical and practical training accompanied by examinations and certification by external experts. The ICS trainers are also trained in how to train or facilitate and training. ICS had been managing capacity building since 2010 and, therefore, had adequate work experience to manage the capacity building activity. This had been further enhanced by the constant interactions with the communities - the final targets and beneficiaries of capacity building. The communities continue to provide comments on how to improve the training modules and gaps in information which are further input in the new updated versions of training manuals particularly that of skillful parenting. This had led to continuous learning. The competences of ICS was reckoned by a CBO staff who said,

“To me, ICS has the best skills…” (Staff CBO).

*Capacity building was undertaken by highly competent people including senior government social welfare officers, consultants and ICS experts in skilling parents*

Nonetheless, ICS acknowledged that the staff did not have capacity to handle sexual and reproductive health including family planning. Parents had indicated a desire to learn sexuality issues and how to handle talks on sexuality with their adolescent children. At the time of the evaluations CBOs which were handling SRH were doing it with the help of Tanzania Red Cross. But ICS indicated that they planned to get a consultant to help them develop a training manual on SRH and early childhood development (ECD).

4.5 Achievements in capacity building

4.5.1 Persons trained
Three people were trained per CBO – executive director, program manager and project staffs and later the community facilitators. The capacity building organizations targeted different modules to different members of the CBOs. The board members were trained in areas of organizational management and leadership while the staff were trained in programming, child protection and skilful parenting. The total number of people trained per cadre per CBO could, however, not be obtained by the Evaluation Team.

4.5.2 Reported organizational benefits from capacity building
CBOs found the training very useful and beneficial. Some of the benefits included:- improvement of CBO organizational setups and identities, such as statements of missions, vision, goals and values, logos; developing constitutions and relevant policies such as human resource, financial management policies, and child protection policies. For example, RAFIKI, an NGO reported that that it did not have a strategic plan. After the training, they developed one and they were able to get sense of direction in their activities. The organization reported that it was now better organized.

Yes, also the training on resource mobilization has helped us much because now we can raise our resources; we can write up the proposals and qualify to be funded… (RAFIKI)

The matrix below highlights organizational benefits for a sample of 5 CBOs.
Matrix 7: Reported outputs from the capacity building sub-program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CBO</th>
<th>OUTPUT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PWWCO</td>
<td>Developed her child protection policy, human resource policy and financial management policy. The child protection policy was ready for use while the other two were still in draft form. Have functional board.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHIDEP</td>
<td>The training helped the CBO to put up our mission and vision for people to see; organizational structure, keeping data records, human resource policy, and financial management mechanisms e.g. requisition books and receipt books. Have functional board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAFIKI</td>
<td>Everybody in Rafiki is oriented to child rights on recruitment. All staff in Rafiki have been trained in issues of sexual and reproductive health and rights (SRHR).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEADO</td>
<td>Developed a human resource policy, finance policy and child protection policy. Strategic plan was developed awaiting board approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPE</td>
<td>Branded itself in terms of logos; put in place relevant policies which the organization did not have before such as a child protection policy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Interviews with CBO staff and board members during this evaluation July 2018.

The Lead Partners reported great progress in CBO organizational capacity and the way CBOs managed the organizations, and the Initiative to end child marriage. Their observations were supported by the CBOs themselves. ICS identified 3 broad areas where there had been progress in organizational capacity namely:-

- Organizational growth and development,
- Ability to obtain funding from donors,
- CBO board members knowing their roles and responsibilities,
- More CBO staff confidence in the way they do things,
- Increased professionalism of CBO staff, and
- ICS became a reference maker for all CBOs

Each one of these is elaborated on below:

4.5.2.1 Organizational growth and development

Some organizations were able to register with local government as CBOs, while others which had been CBOs at the start of the initiative changed to a higher status of NGOs. For example, a CBO like Mkombozi was able to register and was now known by government. TAI grew from the status of a CBO to that of an NGO. YWL started on the process of applying to become an NGO. TVMC and PWWCO had grown to the status of an NGO. RAFIKI, AGAPE and OPE were already NGOs when they joined the FF Initiative. A movement of a CBO to the level of NGO enables an organization to operate in other districts beyond where it was formed. It also has bigger chances of attracting funding from donors who prefer to work with NGOs rather than CBOs. They are able to use professionals and improve the quality of service delivery. The professionals are also most likely to be trainable. Many of them have re-focused their activities.

*If you ask Young Women Leadership, what is your focus they will tell you that they are majoring in sexual and reproductive health (Executive Director, ICS).*
4.5.2.2 Ability of CBOs to obtain funding from several donors
Some organizations which could not obtain funds have been able to write project proposals and have obtained funding. Examples are RAFIKI and TAI. The latter has been able to obtain funding from two donors while RAFIKI is currently managing three or 4 projects funded by different donors. This has been attributed to FF. They have been able to get funding because of organized and streamlined governance structures and management and implementation structures and processes which FF has built. Improved funding means improved service quantity and quality in the communities.

According to FF managers, this growth and development of CBOs into NGOs did not threaten FF’s values of attaining community transformations through community driven interventions of CBOs. Nor did FF drop those organizations that had grown in capacity to the level of NGO. Instead, *This makes FF proud because moving a group from that level to one with ability to write a proposal and obtain funding from external sources was an achievement* (FF Program Officer).

4.5.2.3 CBO board members know their role and responsibilities and are supporting the CBOs
All the CBOs had functional board members. The evaluators met some of the board members who ably described their roles and responsibilities and were knowledgeable about the activities of the CBO.

4.5.2.4 Improved staff confidence and ability to intervene at many levels
CBO staff reported they were confidently able to undertake many intervention tasks in the communities including community mobilization, advocacy; engagement with political figures and key institutions; monitoring and evaluation. They were able to respond to child protection issues and link up with government officials. They were able to sensitize communities about child abuse; child rights and standards. CBO staff reported that they never used to do many of these things before.

> Before Ronald [Firelight’s Learning and Evaluation Officer] came for M&E training, I was not aware on how to use data base, store all my documents especially from my implementation areas. But after the training, I now know how to create and use data base, excel, word, and to document them. …. “(Staff PWWCO)

> When ICS came here, they found a lot of weaknesses on finance and other issues related to administration and human resources. They advised us to change some issues; they said, change this, do that, and so on. ICS helped the organization to improve the way it managed its affairs because it identified gaps and showed them how to resolve them. ICS is handling us very well because they are always available for anything we want to know from them (Staff CBO).

> We can mobilize government leaders and any other persons to come and listen to us (Staff WEADO).

4.5.2.5 Improved parenting skills by CBO staff and parents
The information obtained especially on skillful parenting helped improve CBO staff parenting knowledge and skills and those of parents at the grassroots thanks to the support provided by FF.
I thought that as a parent I knew it all; but I came to find out that I did not know a lot about parenting. Personally it changed me a lot. The training built me to be able to teach other people because I can practice it myself (Staff CBO).

ICS is greatly acknowledged for its program of skillful parenting (CBO Managing Director).

Parents at the end line of the capacity building chain also found the training given to them by the trained CBOs very useful.

"Yah, of course, we do a lot of monitoring with them to see what is happening, with the parents and the feedback is very positive especially on preventive issues of violence against children and women, those parents who have benefited” (Executive Director, ICS).

"Yes, those who have participated in the program really like it a lot. We even get a lot of demands from the parents who are not part of the program; and we feel like why are we isolating them while they see a lot of changes?” (Executive Director ICS).

CBO staff and grass root service beneficiaries especially the parents found capacity building received very useful (Executive Director ICS).

4.5.2.6 Development of CBO staff professionalism
The rigor involved in capacity building was likely to make CBOs more professional and improve the quality of service delivery at the grassroots. The benefits from capacity building of CBOS are trickling down to communities in form of quality services.

4.5.2.7 ICS being a reference maker for other CBOs
ICS has also accrued benefits from her capacity building role. The ICS executive Director mentioned these benefits:

- ICS has become a reference maker for donors seeking information about the integrity and dependability of the CBOs in the region.
- Gained confidences to teach parents and community members,
- Obtained leadership skills
- ICS has been able to attract funding and sub-contract other CBOs like TVMC and OPE to implement projects on her behalf. An example, is the project addressing HIV/AIDs among adolescent girls and women in Kahama district funded by another US donor.

4.6 Challenges in capacity building of CBOs
This section discusses the challenges met by the trainers and trainees during the capacity building exercise. The challenges relate to the different forms of training- the cohort/workshop training and individualized mentoring and support. The challenges relate around the conduct of trainers, programming for trainings, teaching methodologies used and the products of training.

a) Poor communication and dis-respect of CBO members’ dignity
Although the training obtained from both Agape and ICS was evaluated to be “good” by the CBOs, the two organizations were reported to have poor communication skills and respect for CBO members. Some mentors from both ICS and Agape were reported to be rude and did not communicate appropriately when somebody made a mistake. Some mentors shouted at the staff of the CBOs when they made a mistake.

ICS canceled programs without notifying the trainees and providing reasons why the programmed training had been cancelled. An example was the second phase of learning skillful parenting which was planned for May 2018. Despite that the CBO programmed for it, it did not take place in May as planned. ICS did not communicate why it could not take place.

The trainers did not provide adequate time for training participants to prepare or commit time for some trainings. Training was done in a crisis like manner. The extract below highlights the point.

If you go home today, then you hear in the evening that tomorrow at 8.00 a.m. we shall be conducting a training ---Already we would have made plans for tomorrow…. People have already organized for field work…. Let them inform us before with more time in between” (CBO staff).

Another time the lead partner came to train abruptly and trained the whole day without giving us any refreshments. They did not inform us in advance to enable us mobilize resources for refreshments of that training event. We went without any refreshments for the whole day and somewhere we lost concentration because of hunger… (CBO staff).

Poor communication adversely affected the relationships between mentors and some mentees. The lead partners did not indicate that they were themselves trained before they took on the mammoth task of training adult learners and practitioners. It was, however, learnt from the FF Program Officer that there were plans to do a training needs assessment and organize training for the lead partners in all FF supported programs in Africa. Some of these weaknesses particularly “communication” needs to be addressed during the planned capacity building program of the lead partners.

The lead partners shall need to be given foundational competences and principles in social relationships and particularly communication and how to train and manage adult learners.

b) Another weakness was the delay to train CBOs on family budgeting. This reduced connectivity of content with the earlier training obtained by parents in communities.

c) Some trainings were non-participatory-

“Well, I attended for one day, but it was a kind of a facilitation methodology; it was a direct feeding, lecturing method, they were just pumping knowledge…. So you are just quiet….from morning up to lunch and you are given five minutes to ask questions. There is need for more participatory use of teaching methods and practical sessions. There was also a lot of theorizing during the training that did not match the capacity of some trainees (staff CBO).
d) High CBO staff turnover - After about 6 months 55% of the CBO staff who had been trained had left the agencies. This meant remobilization and retraining of new people. This situation threatened the sustainability, efficiency, and effectiveness of the program. FF managers solved this attrition problem by adapting the ICS model. Each CBO was required to identify community residents as volunteers to undertake training in child protection issues and skillful parenting. These volunteers who are also “community facilitators” were identified and trained together with the CBO staff.

e) Limited opportunities for CBO members to share and learn from each other – Although all CBOs had great practice experiences with potential to work as resource people for each other, this opportunity was not being harnessed. For example, while ICS was competent and had a comparative edge in organizing and delivering trainings, Agape was more competent in understanding and managing child protection challenges. To take advantage of these internal resources to the Initiative, calls for coordination and development of formal working relationships between CBOs and between lead partners.

f) There was no structure or requirement for CBOs using the same intervention strategy to continuously share experiences and learning. Most CBOs reported that the first time they ever got together was in Mwanza in 2017. A few reported relating with each other informally to share staff and transport to operational communities. This was commendable. The core outcome of building “knowledge and evidence for child protections work” depicted in the program theory may not be easily attained when people find it difficult or uncomfortable relating with each other, sharing experiences and other resources.

4.7 Gaps in capacity building
The gaps in capacity building are distilled from the foregone discussions. The “gaps” refer to aspects not adequately addressed and those not addressed at all. The gaps are borne from eight circumstances:

a) Shortfalls of the FF predetermined competences
b) Competences in project management processes
c) Consolidation of some competence areas
d) Shortfalls in the planned versus implemented capacity building activities
e) The felt and expressed knowledge and skill needs of the CBO staff at the time of this evaluation;
f) Circumstantial gaps arising out of the operational situations and changes;
g) Gaps deriving from practice/ service delivery challenges
h) Gaps arising from the government’s introduction of new policies and proposals by FF to use new technology

Below is a summary of the capacity building gaps arising out of each of the above circumstances:

a) Capacity building gaps arising from the unaddressed FF pre-determined competences
   • Case management systems and referrals
   • Skills in building community capacity
• Social and emotional support for vulnerable populations
• Advocacy
• Competences in sustainability
• The linkage competences
• Tracking data on the safety of children was also not addressed

b) Competences in project management processes
• Problem identification and definition, planning
• Research
• Project monitoring, evaluation and learning.
• Knowledge management and sharing
• Systematic documentation of success stories
• Documentations of best practices and lessons
• Data analysis
• Impact assessments of child protection responses

Many of these were not planned for during the design of the Initiative. Some of these like monitoring and evaluation were attempted by a consultant and also the FF Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning Officer. The consultant did not complete the training due to resource constraints. Generally, the topic of monitoring, evaluation and learning was not satisfactorily addressed as evident from the CBO staff’s demand for more training in this area.

c) Capacity building gaps arising out of operational circumstances and changes in the CBO status

There are circumstances during the operations of the CBO that may call for retraining of previously trained people or the training of a completely new set of staff and board members. Examples of situations calling for retraining/training new people include: staff attrition and board membership re-election, mobility of members out of the CBO operational areas, forgetfulness, etc. Some training may have been given in inadequate doses and covering a limited number of people and time. The time lag since the last training was undertaken could also call for refresher courses to remove staleness. The growth of CBOs to NGOs and recruitment of new staff call for continued capacity building of members. The new staff would need to be oriented to the way the CBO operates.

Whatever the circumstances, there is need to do continuous auditing of available knowledge and skills and fill up the missing competences with training or retraining. The annual training needs assessments done by ICS before training is, therefore, highly commendable and should be replicated in the future. Mentorship is needed to consolidate what ICS and Agape has trained CBOs on. This could be done through regular meetings and exchange visits. The NGO network body for the region called SHINGO NET was inactive and could not provide such a service.

d) Shortfalls in the planned versus implemented capacity building activities
• Family budgeting was as yet to be done by ICS.
e) CBO felt training needs - The CBO staff also expressed the following training needs:

- Life skills, sexual and reproductive health, and gender education for use in schools
- Resource mobilization, record keeping; proposal writing
- Advocacy and politics
- Fundraising, resource mobilization at local levels
- Monitoring and evaluation
- Capacity to handle child marriage, teenage pregnancy, other forms of child abuses.

The CBOs needed knowledge in technical areas of managing and controlling the problem of child marriage and pregnancy.

There may be need to provide more foundational knowledge on how behaviours form, and change and models of ending unacceptable behaviour and cultural norms

f) Gaps deriving from service delivery challenges - There were several challenges in the service delivery arm which needed to be studied, documented and shared among practitioners. For example, whistle blowers who reported parents and guardians for abuse of children in the villages indicated that their lives were in grave danger. This challenge calls for a response to protect these volunteers who work in the interests of the children. Other identifiable capacity building gaps in relation to service delivery challenges are:

- operational research, documentation, and sharing
- Sensitivity to costs, benefits and effectiveness of intervention approaches.

h) New policies and technology

The introduction of the National Plan of Action to Fight Violence Against Women and Children means that FF has to conceive of relevant competences to guide the choice and design of teaching/learning topics for CBO staff and volunteers. Below are some topics the FF Initiative may consider for curriculum:

- gender and power relations in homes,
- rights of women and children
- causes of domestic violence,
- types of violence against women and children
- Successful and best strategies to fight gender based violence in other parts of the world.
- Reporting and reporting systems
- Community empowerment to fight violence against women and children
- Justice and law and order sector structures and processes for handling severe cases of domestic violence to women and children
- Management of victims or survivors of violence
- Role and responsibilities of communities, victims, government structures to prevent and manage violence against women and children

The CBOs have to be helped to operationalize the new policy and repackage their preventive IEC messages to men, women, children and entire communities.

Introduction of new technology or better methods of work shall also call for retraining. For example some CBOs were planning to test out reporting of child abuse cases using a mobile telephone. Once this is developed and approved, it will require to be shared out to other CBOs; and monitored.

These gaps imply a need for FF to rework the new competences to be pursued in the next phase of the program.

4.8 Monitoring and evaluation of CBO capacity building
Monitoring of the capacity building activities and overall project activities were undertaken at different levels of program management. FF required CBOs to submit annual reports indicating activities /outputs, outcomes, and indicators using a universal monitoring and evaluation framework developed by FF. The monitoring and evaluation framework asked specific questions relating to whether they received training on each of the competences identified in FF program proposal. This information was regularly collected for each year since FF started relating with a CBO.

The CBOs were asked whether: a) they received support, training or mentoring in child protection and in the development of effective protection policies, case management systems, and referral systems; b) community mobilization, including strengthening linkages in communities and mobilizing around child rights; c) strengthening linkages to national networks on children’s rights; d) psychosocial programming and working with parents to enhance their capacity to support and care for their children; d) organizational management; and organizational sustainability. For each of these capacity building areas, FF asked CBOs to describe the capacity building obtained, the frequency /dosage and whether and how the training affected their strategy, approach or programming. The CBOs were asked how they applied the acquired knowledge to mobilize communities and integrate child rights and child protection into community life; and how they worked with the departments of social welfare to strengthen the case management systems and referral systems; and how they worked with families to help them understand the children’s rights, enhance parenting skills, and/or build their ability to increase household income to meet the needs and rights of children.

The practice of monitoring the application of acquired competences by CBOs was highly commendable.

The FF Program Officer also visited the Program area quarterly to monitor each CBO’s activities, to check whether they were in line with their plans and budgets and help them resolve challenges. The FF Program Officer talked with CBO staff as well as visiting the communities to obtain first-hand information on actual practices and impacts of the program. It was not clear whether the program manager used a systematically developed monitoring tool to do her observations and write her reports.
In case she does not have a monitoring tool, then she may have to develop one which is in line with the objectives of capacity building at the time.

In the course of providing support and mentoring to individual CBOs, monitoring and evaluations were also done by the lead partners. These were, however, more informal and less systematic. There was no systematically developed information collection tool that regularly collected information on certain performance indicators of the CBOs following their training.

ICS reported that it evaluated the performance of community facilitators during the process of training and certification for skillful parenting. This is also commendable.

4.9 Best practices and lessons learnt in relation to capacity building

The following were considered best practices by the evaluation team:-

- Conducting the organizational development and child protection assessments at the start of the initiative and in subsequent years.
- Centralizing the capacity building function was best practice because it would allow standardized quality training and products.
- Provision of individualized support, training and mentorship which addressed the unique organizational needs of each CBO making participation in the FF Initiative less stressful.
- The strategy to first build the organizational management and child protection competences of CBOs was prudent for effective and efficient service delivery.
- The use of government approved training manuals and staff assured quality of content and products, the trained persons.
CHAPTER FIVE
PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION: DIRECT AND INDIRECT SERVICE DELIVERY

5.0 Introduction
This Chapter presents findings relating to the provision of direct and indirect services to the communities by the FF Partner CBOs. It describes the processes and progress made in the implementation of planned activities. It distils achievements of CBO interventions to end child marriage and other child abuses highlighting enabling and constraining factors to the attainment of desired outcomes.

5.1 Preliminary activities undertaken to guide planning and programming: Community dialogues
The Initiative did not have a structured situation analysis nor a baseline. In the absence of these, FF and her partners conducted “community dialogues”. These were community based studies undertaken to determine the physical and social spaces that made the children feel insecure or unsafe and the factors within those environments that promoted their wellbeing. Determination of unsafe spaces was through community dialogues with children and adults in the operational communities. The communities and also the children identified factors that harmed children in families, communities and schools. This learning was useful for the identification of social systems to target interventions; and the existing child protection risks and opportunities for the promotion of child wellbeing within those systems.

Some of the major conclusions reached from the dialogues (which were also similar to those obtained from other parts of the world) were:

a) the home and the school contexts remained key spaces to target child protection efforts;

b) provision of basic needs and requirements in the different spaces children spent most of their time can facilitate child well-being;

c) intervention strategies aimed at economically empowering families and ensuring adequate resources within communities to support child well-being, can make a great difference; and

d) Socio-emotional climates and interpersonal relationships should be a key target area for child protection strategies.

Child marriages were mentioned by most studied groups to be harming children in families. The community dialogues were repeated each year by the CBOs to determine changes in spaces and factors affecting children’s wellbeing.

The use of community dialogues was a “best practice” as it helped to identify the social environments where child protection problems as well as wellbeing were rooted. This further helped to guide planning and especially the prioritization of spaces to work on and with to resolve the problem of

---

child marriage. It helped affirm the choice of the targeted populations and social systems - notably the children, the families, communities and child protection service delivery structures.

However, the FF and her partners did not do a situation analysis on the forms, drivers, and dynamics of child marriage and child pregnancy. Although there was a child marriage study done for the whole of Tanzania including Shinyanga, the report was not easily accessible; nor was it summarized for use by CBOs to guide planning and programming. Thus, although the CBOs knew the situation of child marriage some overlooked the key drivers of child marriage like poverty in their planning because there was no research evidence to guide them.

No baseline study was done on existing knowledge, attitudes and social cultural practices that the CBOs attempted to address and transform to end child marriage and pregnancies. No baseline was done on important indicators of the desired outcomes. For example, the Initiative did not determine the levels and quality of knowledge people including children had regarding child rights, sexual and reproductive health issues, parenting styles etc. Subsequently, this threatened the ability of the CBOs to monitor changes in knowledge and social cultural practices, and assessment of the impacts of the Initiative.

*Failure of the initiative to undertake baseline study on the indicators of change was a big weakness of the Initiative that need to be addressed in the coming phase.*

5.2 Interventions undertaken to end child marriage
The planned interventions attempted as much as possible to address the drivers of child marriage and teenage pregnancy at the level of the child, the family, community and schools. The interventions targeted largely the negative social cultural norms and practices, and minimally the poverty issues. The services provided by all the twelve CBOs took two forms - prevention and response/or treatment of victims of child marriage and abuse. The activities undertaken under each service type and achievements are described one by one below.

5.3 Preventive services
The interventions that addressed the negative social cultural practices were largely preventive in nature. Prevention is a public health concept that involves stopping bad incidents happening on population health or lives. Prevention can be primary, secondary or tertiary. Primary prevention is aimed at reducing the incidence of a disease and other departures from good health; and involves protection of health by personal and community wide effects. Secondary prevention involves measures available to individuals and populations for the early detection, and prompt and effective interventions to correct departures from good health. Tertiary prevention consists of the measures available to reduce or eliminate long term impairments and disabilities, minimize existing departures from good health[30].

By this definition, the Initiative was involved in all three forms of prevention: primary, secondary and tertiary prevention. Prevention took two forms – the direct preventive activities targeted at communities, families and children as well as more indirect preventive activities in the form of
advocacy and lobbying for more resources and enactment of relevant bye-laws by local government for improved child protection. Children in and out of school were also specifically targeted with preventive and treatment services.

5.3 Preventive activities with communities

Preventive activities undertaken with communities and families involved: a) Awareness creation about child rights and the dangers of child marriages and early pregnancies; b) provision of parenting skills (also called “skilful parenting”); and c) economic empowerment of poor vulnerable families. The following sections describe the processes by which each of these strategies were undertaken, the outcomes, best practices and challenges.

5.3.1 Awareness creation of communities about child rights and the dangers of child marriages and teenage pregnancies

Awareness creation took the form of information provision, education and communication (IEC). The CBOs worked with the assumption that people married off their young girls before they reached 18 years because they were ignorant of the dangers of child marriages and pregnancies on their children’s future health and social economic development. Several approaches were used to provide IEC on the dangers of child marriage and these included use of public rallies, radios, films, use of T-shirts, banners, leaflets, and brochures with child rights.

Community rallies emphasized the dangers of child marriage and teenage pregnancies and appealed to the public to keep their girls in schools. The CBOs also educated the public about child rights and especially the right of girls to go to school, keep in school, and complete their education. Four CBOs namely ICS, RAFIKI, TAI and TVMC reported using public gatherings to sensitize communities about the dangers of child marriage. They were assisted by ward and district leaders who gave public rallies political and cultural legitimacy. Agape and TAI reported to have used films on the dangers of child marriage in their operational communities, upon which they built community dialogue sessions.

Community members affirmed that they learnt that child abuse took several forms including marrying off a girl when still a child, not taking a child to school, teachers sending pupils to work in their gardens or fetch water instead of being in classes; and child beating. Severe beatings exerted on children by teachers were reported to reduce the child’s confidence leading to absenteeism from school and then child marriage. They learnt to report child abuses to authorities.

Community awareness campaigns started with community mobilisation using different approaches. These included: drumming, use of public speaking systems, traditional music and dances that attracted people to one place after which they were taught about the dangers of child marriage and child rights. These were considered to attract gatherings of people in one place at low cost. WEADO, CHIDEP and OPE reported providing IEC to the general public using radios particularly Radio Faraja. OPE staff reported that the approach to community sensitisation was by use of the radio whereby social welfare officers and children went on air to talk about issues that affect children. CHIDEP reported that the staff managed seven radio programs on child marriage.
A group of men (54.5%) who attended a focus discussion group conducted in Mawaza Ward, in Shinyanga Municipality during this evaluation, confirmed that they heard the messages discouraging child marriages from the radio. Some of the messages heard on the radio appealed to parents to stop the practice of marrying off girls below 18 years for purposes of accumulating wealth. Instead parents should allow their girls to complete their education “because education cannot wait but marriage can wait” (FGD of men Mawaza Shinyanga Municipality).

Four observations were made by the evaluation team about the way awareness creation activities to communities were undertaken. First, the feedback obtained from the communities indicated that films or cinemas were very effective in inducing dialogues on the issue of child marriage in families. Women and men identified interesting issues in the films and further discussed them in their homes thus consolidating learning, attitudinal and behavioral change towards child marriage. The films attracted people of different ages, gender and economic statuses, the leaders, and the led. Thus they had very wide coverage.

Secondly, although the three CBOs which used the radio had the same listenership, it could not be established whether the programs built on each other for attainment of the desired social outcomes. The evaluation team did not access the radio messages passed on to the public; but there is a possibility of duplication of effort and resources, given that the three CBOs might have communicated the same messages to the same public, at the same time periods, by change agents from the same program. In future, there may be need for the CBOs using the radio approach to plan the messages, and implement the activities together for more effective and efficient use of resources.

Third, while some CBOs were sensitive to the costs of the approaches they chose to use to mobilise communities for IEC provision, other CBOs were not. Other CBOs could not explain why they chose to use certain methods and what outcomes they expected to obtain. Sensitivities to effectiveness and efficiency issues need to be emphasized more during capacity building.

Fourth, the CBOs did not reliably collect information on the percentage of people reached. They did not also seek for feedback on the actual messages received and behaviours adopted by those people who were reached by these methods. There were no documented evidence by CBOs indicating the most cost effective and beneficial approach used in sensitizing entire communities. This was largely due to the fact that monitoring was not inbuilt in the interventions, and most CBOs did not have the capacity to do operational research and cost effective or cost benefit analysis studies. Some methods used like the T-shirts might have been more useful for publicizing the CBO rather than using it as an approach for changing attitudes and practices.

Even if CBOs were trained to do cost benefit studies to guide the choice of the most cost effective intervention approaches, they would perhaps do not develop the capability to undertake such studies unless FF undertook such studies for universal use by all CBOs.
5.3.1.2 Preventive activities with families - Skilful Parenting

Awareness creation about the dangers of child marriage and pregnancy was done with not only with entire communities but also with parents. All CBOs met the parents in their saving and credit groups in their operational geographical areas. In Tanzania, it is mandatory for every citizen to belong to an economic group for easy access to government loans. The savings and loan groups comprised of both gender with a higher proportion of the membership being women. Given this situation, CBOs tried to make sure men were equally reached by following them up in their coffee drinking joints. This was innovative and highly commendable strategy as it improved coverage reaching out to the fathers who were major decision makers in homes responsible for forcing girl children into early marriages.

Other approaches used to reach parents were training one parent in an area who was expected in turn to go back and teach her friends and neighbours. This method was used by RAFIKI. The use of this approach implied the existence of highly motivated parents; and follow ups of the trained parents by CBOs to make sure that the trained parents actually passed on the knowledge to their neighbours and that the quality of information passed on was the same as that given by the CBO. A few CBOs also expected the community facilitators to reach out to parents in their homes and do door to door training. This may be very costly to the facilitators in terms of time and effort.

The IEC provided to the families consisted of the education material given to communities as well as specific skills of how to do parenting. Again, the assumption behind this was that parents were not aware of children’s rights and how to skillfully parent children. All the CBOs undertook this activity. The CBOs used the skillful parenting model developed by ICS (on which they had obtained capacity building) and also the National Plan of Action to end Violence against Women and Children in Tanzania.

The CBOs addressed the seven modules in the ICS manual notably: family relations and their influence on child development; roles and responsibilities of a skillful parent covering the stages of development of a child and needs and the responsibilities of a skillful parent; self-esteem and self-care; values and discipline; communication; child protection, and family budgeting. A summary description of these modules is availed in the Appendix C. Other issues covered during the training of parents included risk factors and situations that made children vulnerable to sexual abuse such as sending their children to shops late at night. Parents were cautioned against giving their children too much freedom. The parents were also advised to create time to talk with their children. Skillful parenting sessions with men groups addressed issues like: fatherhood, goodness of a father, how to protect the family, how to take care of the children, and how to support children in schools. The training of parents was largely done by the trained CBO staff and the community facilitators.

Although the evaluation team did not seek for statistics on the participation of people in savings and credit groups it is apparent that not all people could belong to these groups at any one point in time. For different reasons, poor people are known to lag behind in the adoption of innovations. The people who are currently not members of the national economic groups could most likely also be the ones at risk of marrying off their girls at young ages. Agape and PWWCO had started mobilising women to form savings and loan groups implying that there were still many people who were not yet
members of the economic groups in both urban and rural areas of Shinyanga. While CBOs’ reliance on the use of existing savings and loan groups might have been convenient at the beginning, it is not adequate in reaching out all the parents who need skilful parenting training. The discussion groups conducted with mothers and fathers in the communities also indicated that there are still big gaps in coverage of parents with skilful parenting training in different communities and especially in the rural areas.

As the women in one discussion group reported:

*About YWCA, all we ask is that they should not get tired educating the people about these issues because as you see we are two groups but the surrounding community is very large, so the education should go and reach to the whole community, that way we will be able to deal with all those abuses in our community. They should cover some other groups as well” (FGD Women)*

For example, in one focus group conducted with men in Ngokolo, Shinyanga Municipality, 50% of the members of that group had participated in CHIDEP training on skilful parenting. In another discussion group conducted with women in Uchambi, Mondo ward, Kishapu District 47% of them reported having attended a skilful parenting training with TAI. The majority – 53% of the women in Mondo ward which was under TAI had not received any training in skilful parenting. The majority had not even obtained any training through the radio. Forty per cent of the women who participated in the discussion group and had obtained training from TAI reported having informed their husbands what they had learnt.

*The different methods used by CBOs to reach out to parents for skilful parenting are still deficient requiring revisiting and revision for improved inclusion and participation of all people in the rural and urban areas. Reliance on existing credit and saving groups to access skilful parenting leaves out many parents who currently do not belong to these groups. The reliance on community based facilitators calls for a lot of follow ups of what they do and the quality of messages they give out.*

Several approaches were suggested by the community members and also some CBOs regarding ways to reach out to more mothers and fathers in the communities. These included: - a) asking the village leaders to mobilise residents over weekends; b) using the religious leaders to mobilise their believers over worshipping days; and c) use of mobile telephones to send out short precise messages on parenting. The FF Program Officer reported that they had decided to adopt the use of mobiles but the Ugandan company they wanted to use closed down. The idea of using mobile applications in the program was still being pursued.

### 5.3.1.3 Preventive activities with families - Economic empowerment of poor families

Economic empowerment was undertaken to address poverty; one of the leading causes of child marriage in Shinyanga. Eight CBOs were engaged in different activities of economic empowerment of communities and especially the poor families. They were: - YWL, TVMC, OPE, PWWCO, TAI, RAFIKI, Mkombozi and Agape. Some other CBOs such as ICS, were engaged in sustainable
economic development activities but outside the FF Initiative geographical area. The eight CBOs used four strategies to fight poverty notably:

i. Provision of scholastic material support to children from poor families;
ii. Provision of seed grants (IGAs) to poor families;
iii. Provision of entrepreneurial skills for poor families;
iv. Support for vocational skills development for children from poor families; and
v. Formation of savings and credit groups in communities

Each CBO used one strategy to fight poverty. The processes of implementing each of these poverty alleviation strategies and their programmatic implications are discussed in the sections below.

i) Provision of scholastic materials to children from poor families

The need to provide scholastic materials and other basics to children from poor families was based on the understanding that although education was free in primary and secondary schools in Tanzania, absence of these materials could make a child drop out of school. Dropping out of school was one known path to child marriage. CBOs attempted to keep poor children in school to avoid child marriage. The quotation below highlights the reality.

*If a girl has no shoes, for example, she has to wear sandals something that makes her uncomfortable so she stops schooling. Lack of pads to use for menstruation can also make a girl drop out of school. Girls feel ashamed when they bleed at school and they get dirty. She fears going back to school the next day. For us girls, there is nothing that hurts like the menstrual blood to be seen by men. Girls who cannot afford to buy pads may decide to get men to marry them.* (FGD for out of school girls at Bizimanta- WEADO)

Six CBOs – Mkombozi, PWWCO, YWCA, RAFIKI, OPE and TAI provided scholastic materials such as exercise books, pens, and menstrual pads to children from poor families to keep them from dropping out of school. For most CBOs, the process of identifying vulnerable children involved largely school teachers. Mkombozi also had its board members visiting the homes of the children and verifying the economic status of the parents.

*By seeing. We know them very well because we live with them in our communities. If someone is rich or poor it is not hard to know; if they are living in the same village you are coming from* (Board Member, Mkombozi).

The observatory method is of course very useful when used by small CBOs like Mkombozi whose membership is resident in the same village as the clientele. However, as CBOs enlarge and move to serve many needy families in places they were not founded then the reliability of the observation as a method identifying the poor becomes questionable.

*To improve the identification of children from poor families, targeting, and use of scarce resources, the FF Initiative may need to streamline the eligibility criteria for relief by developing a vulnerability index usable by all CBOs to identify whom to give material help and not to give in the program area.*
Because of the fragmented reporting, a full list of material assistance given out and the total number of beneficiaries per CBO was not obtainable by the Evaluation Team. But one CBO - Mkombozi provided nine exercise books each to vulnerable children and 40 goats to families. OPE provided scholastic materials to 62 pupils.

ii) Provision of seed grants to poor families and entrepreneurial skills development.
This involved provision of income generating activities (IGAs) to poor families as well as capacity building in business management. Some of the IGAs provided to families included chicken, cotton, and goats. It was anticipated that once the family had a source of income, it would be able to support the girl child in school on a sustainable basis and deter early marriage. As the extract below indicates,

The project enabled poor parents to earn an income to support their children. The government will not provide food, uniform and exercise books. But if the parents have a harvest from farms and chicken, they could sell them and buy school materials and children could stay in school. (Board members, OPE).

However, few CBOs were engaged in the promotion of IGAs. These included OPE, PWWCO, YWL, Mkombozi, TVMC and TAI. Young Women Leaders (YWL) targeted single young mothers most of who were victims of child marriage and had moved out their marital unions. Single parenthood was a phenomena reported to be about 70% in Shinyanga Municipality. It is associated with abject poverty and risk for child pregnancies.

iii) Vocational training for children from poor families.
Some CBOs notably AGAPE, OPE, RAFIKI and YWL encouraged and supported some children from poor families to do vocational training. The total number of students supported with vocational training for the entire program was not obtained by the Evaluation Team. The reason for sending children from poor families to vocations schools was that earning an income after completing vocational training would reduce vulnerability and a desire for to marry early for survival purposes. YWL provided this support to young single parent mothers while Agape provided this support to their rescued girls. The vocational training was obtained from community level institutions.

iv) Formation of savings and credit groups in communities
Three CBOs – PWWCO, TVMC, and AGAPE were involved in the mobilization of community members and especially women to form savings and credit groups to access government loans. The CBOs also encourage savings. For example, TVMC – reported helping two groups of women to write their constitution, register and open a bank account. The two groups had saved a total amount of 560,000/= Tanzania Shillings7.

Statutorily, these are functions of the community development department of local governments. But funding capacity of government social development programs is quite limited. Thus many community members were reportedly not yet members of the economic groups in villages especially the rural villages. Many communities did not have the capacity to get the paper work together including a

7 This equaled US $245.3 by 31st July 2018. (www.oanda.com currency converter)
constitution, managing registrations and opening bank accounts. Without meeting these requirements, the savings and loan group could not obtain a government loan.

Many FF CBO partners had argued that they were not addressing the poverty problem because government was addressing it with loans.

5.4 Other observations made by the Evaluation Team on the preventive strategy in the communities

1. While the provision of factual information about the dangers and benefits of stopping child marriage helps to improve people’s knowledge, (and is a useful strategy at the start of the program), knowledge alone may not sustain behaviour change. Behavioural scientists have advised that the best way of addressing the “disparity” between knowledge gained and behaviour change is to identify and address all the determinants of behaviour including attitudes, beliefs, social norms, cultural values and socio-economic status issues[31]. Some of the determinants of child marriage were not adequately addressed. For example, the economic reasoning of the Sukuma that education investments in the girl child are more beneficial to the future husband and less to the biological family of the girl calls for specific messages and rationalisation. There were a lot of negative attitudes towards girls which need to be targeted with messages. It may also be useful for the Initiative to adapt some social marketing principles to effect social change because as is already known “the more social change campaign resembles a commercial product campaign the more successful it is likely to be”[31].

2. Each CBO was implementing a different poverty alleviation strategy using limited resources on a small population. This threatened the effectiveness, efficiency and uniformity of the desired social outcomes.

3. While relief is effective in the initial program implementation, its biggest disadvantage is its cost and limited coverage. Relief may not satisfy all the emergent needs of a client. Long stay on relief may create dependency and loss of dignity for the receivers. Thus, households need to be weaned off relief into income generating activities (IGAs) for long term sustainability. This requires CBOs to effectively monitor households’ progress to move out of poverty. There is also a need to develop a household vulnerability assessment tool to measure progress. CBOs need to develop a minimum uniform package for all vulnerable households and target children. This should be implemented by all CBOs for uniform outcomes.

4. All CBOs did many transformational things in the community; but these success stories were not systematically recorded and in many cases not recorded at all. There were minimal records on outcomes.

5. Although all CBOs used the monitoring tool developed by the FF, it was difficult to tease out the planned activities from the implemented and non-implemented activities. Some used the financial years when reporting while others used calendar years. Some CBOs used both at different time periods. There may be need to streamline the reporting styles of implemented activities as well as reporting periods.

6. CBOs were also poor at documenting outputs – how many people received what!
5.5 Preventive activities with children in schools

The FF partner CBOs undertook preventive activities with children in primary and secondary schools in their operational areas. These preventive services involved provision of information, education and communication (IEC) on three broad topical areas: a) child rights, b) dangers of child marriage and pregnancy and c) sexual and reproductive health and rights. All the CBOs addressed the first two topics while only 5 addressed sexual and reproductive health and rights (SRHR). The CBOs that addressed SRHR were: PWWCO, TAI, OPEC, YWCA, YWL, and AGAPE. The assumptions behind provision of IEC was that once children's knowledge was improved with the right information then they will be empowered to defend themselves and refuse the demands made by parents to marry and leave school prematurely. The following sections present findings relating to the issues stressed during the awareness creation about child marriages and pregnancies in schools, structure and organization of IEC in schools, the involvement of the school systems in the program, methods used to teach children and follow-up/monitoring school activities to end child marriage.

5.5.1 Issues school children were sensitized on and manuals used

The training given to children in schools addressed many issues including:- the meaning of a child, effects of child marriage and early pregnancies, risk factors for unwanted pregnancies, the psychosocial and economic impacts of unwanted pregnancies, how to protect themselves against unwanted pregnancies, and other harmful community family and school practices; child rights, child labour and risks. Some trainings also covered HIV/AIDS issues. Other issues covered were: - child responsibilities, parent and community responsibilities and the need for parents to obtain birth certificates for their children. Reproductive health training covered consequences of child marriage, complications during child birth such as death, of mother and baby, fistula etc. for persons who deliver when too young; risks for sexual abuse and unwanted pregnancies. Child marriage was discouraged.

The school children, patrons and matrons in schools confirmed that these issues were addressed by CBOs. For example, the evaluation team learnt from Buchambi Primary School that TAI helped them to teach children about self-awareness, self-identity, and rights of children, early marriage, and the menstrual periods of girls. Before when the school was working with Agape, they used to fight the parents' practice of discouraging their children to fail primary seven national examinations so that they could go and marry. It was explained that this was due to limited awareness about the importance of education in the communities and strong held customs and traditions promoting child marriage.

Girls used to obtain husbands from traditional dances called “chagulaga”. Girls used to line up and men moved around dancing showing their hands to the girls to be selected by the girls. In this dance if a man is chosen by a girl, the girl must marry the man whether the girl is in school or not. The parents would struggle hard to make sure that the girl drops out of school. The girl could not refuse because chagulaga is a kind of a dance honoured by people. If she refuses to marry she has still to run away from school. (Patron Buchambi Primary school).

A focus group discussion for Town Secondary School boys reported that YWCA club taught them reproductive health and issues of adolescence and puberty, and how a young man can live in the period of puberty; and how to “live in society when conditions do not allow”.

80
The content of the child rights were obtained from the Convention of the rights of the Child, the African Charter and the Tanzania Child protection Act 2009. Use was also made of the manuals used by the Community development department of child protection. The manual used to teach SRHR was that developed by the Ministry of Health.

There were a lot of variations in the way the IEC school programs were packaged and implemented by CBOs. While all emphasized the negative effects of child marriage, some CBOs emphasized child pregnancies and others child protection issues like child labour. CBOs like TVMC reported that pregnancy tests were done every three months in schools. Whoever, was found pregnant was the one reported to TVMC which proceeded to pursue the legal issues. This particular organization is a member of the Tanzania Network of Legal providers and Tanzania Law Society with legal capacity to pursue such cases. Other organizations like CHIDEP which did not have legal capacity referred such cases to Agape with a legal department.

Pregnancy was one risk factor for early marriage in some families because according to the new policy recently issued by the President, impregnated girls are not permitted to go back to a government sponsored school. On the other hand, according to the Sukuma tribe, pregnancy before marriage reduces the value of the girl making it difficult for her to marry. That is the very reason why the Sukuma people require their girls to marry early before they get pregnant.

While in schools, some CBOs concentrated their efforts on girls while a few targeted their interventions to both girls and boys.

5.5.2 Schools targeted by the Program

The program targeted both primary and secondary schools in the geographical areas where the CBOs operated. They covered a total of 54 secondary schools and 133 primary schools. The evaluation team could not obtain full information on the existing primary and secondary school in all the CBO operational wards. Therefore, a percent coverage of services could not be worked out for both primary and secondary schools for all CBOs. The figures of school coverage for CBOs which provided all the information indicate a great variation in coverage of FF preventive activities in primary and secondary schools. Coverage was highest in urban areas of Shinyanga where CBOs like WEADO covered 75% of the secondary schools in the 3 wards she operated and 89% of the primary schools. Some schools were served by several CBOs. For example, in Town Secondary School, Shinyanga Municipality, the school clubs were supported by YWCA, and AGAPE.

RAFIKI covered all the secondary school in the 3 wards she operated and 64% of the primary schools. Coverage of both types of schools - primary schools and secondary by big CBOs like ICS and OPE was between 5% and 23%. The table below shows the schools covered by the program.
Table 2: School coverage with preventive services to end child marriage by Firelight Foundation CBO Partners as by August 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>No. of secondary schools CBO works with</th>
<th>No. of secondary schools existing in ward(s)</th>
<th>No. of primary schools CBO works with</th>
<th>No. of primary schools existing in ward(s)</th>
<th>No. of school clubs CBO worked with</th>
<th>Average No. of members in school clubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OPE</td>
<td>5 (18%)</td>
<td>28 in 6 wards</td>
<td>27 (23%)</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWL</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICS</td>
<td>2 (5%)</td>
<td>43 in 26 wards</td>
<td>25 (13%)</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVMC</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAI</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAFIKI</td>
<td>3 (100%)</td>
<td>3 in 3 wards</td>
<td>9 (64%)</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGAPE</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
<td>123</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHIDEP</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MKOMBOZI</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWWCO</td>
<td>3 (50%)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEADO</td>
<td>3 (75%)</td>
<td>8 (89%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total schools reached</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>133 (39.6%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: primary data

It is apparent that CBO intervention activities are still limited to a few schools and more needs to be done in the coming phase to improve coverage.

5.5.3 The structures and approaches used to provide IEC to school children

Five models were used to provide IEC to school children. The first model which was used by all CBOs was that involving use of school clubs. The second model involved use of matrons and patrons of schools who were trained by the CBOs. The school patrons and matron were in turn required to train or supervise the school clubs. The third model involved the CBO staff themselves moving from class to class to teach children. A fourth model involved the use of government staff such as health workers or community development to do the direct teaching of children in classes or school clubs. The fifth model involved the use of hired experts such as paralegals to teach child rights. Some CBOs combined approaches such as use school club members and CBO staff to sensitize school children about the dangers of child marriages and pregnancies. Government official were largely used in situations of teaching SRHR and child rights.

There were two types of child clubs in Shinyanga— the school clubs and children’s councils. In the districts in which the evaluation team visited they were only school clubs and no children’s councils. Schools had several clubs including academic clubs (e.g. science clubs, social science clubs), debate clubs, TAX club, Prevention and Combating Corruption Bureau (PCCB), Mountain of Hope, other NGO clubs like AMREF etc. The clubs formed by FF partner CBOs were an addition to already
existing school clubs and they were called by the names of the CBO such as CHIDEP CLUB, TAI CLUB. The members to the CBO clubs in schools were identified by the teachers based on the ability of the pupil or student to express her/himself, being well behaved, confident and able to inspire peers. On average a club consisted of about 20 children (out of 1000 school population on some schools) who were trained and had responsibility to train peers and be models to them. The FF partners worked with a total of 220 school clubs.

5.5.4 Training duration and dosage in schools
The duration for training of school clubs or trainers of trainees such as patrons and matrons varied from CBO to CBO. Some school club members were trained for one day lasting 2 – 3 hours after which they were expected to start passing on this information to their peers. In some other schools, training was continuous. For example, PWWCO reported that staff spent 3 days in each school per month. Generally school club leaders complained that the time taken to train them was too short yet the knowledge given was very good and relevant to their lives.

Once trained, the school club leaders reported that they used two approaches to pass on this information to their peers. The first one was to pass information to individuals in accordance with the needs or problems of the pupil or student. This approach was passive because it depended on fellow pupils consulting the school club member. In response, the club members provided guidance and counseling to peers who had joined bad groups.

> Currently I educate individual children and not groups. I have not been able to reach all students in the school despite that the training is useful.

> We teach them that during menstrual period, they must be tidy and when menstruation starts while at school, they should report to the teacher for help (FGD girls Buchambi Primary school).

The second approach was the more proactive one where school club members moved from class to class to teach. In this model, all the club members moved into a class; but delivering the IEC was done by a member from that class while others listened. This last approach required the school to schedule the club activities on the school time table. Some schools had time tables for school clubs while others did not have. Schools which had timetables met on average once a week. Ngokolo girls reported that their club used to meet once a week but since the school changed to a 2 stream session – morning and evening, the clubs have no time to meet.

Some CBOs such as TAI trained school matrons and patrons and used them to train school clubs. The total number of patrons and matrons trained were considered to be very few for the task. Where this model was used, there was more zeal and activeness of the school clubs. In TAI schools, clubs met twice a week. The matrons and patrons used manuals provided by the CBO.

CBO staff were also directly engaged in teaching school clubs and all pupils and students in schools. Some CBO staff also directly monitored the activities of the school clubs while others did not. Some CBOs like YWL encouraged students to visit their offices whenever they needed any information or clarifications. This is commendable.
5.5.5 Monitoring and reporting of School Club activities
Just like the implementation of school club activities, CBOs used different models to monitor and follow up the implementation of the School club activities. In some schools, the trained matrons and patrons filled up monitoring forms provided by the CBO and took them to the nearest child protection committee in their area which in turn delivered the forms to the CBO. In other schools, some club leaders reported to guidance and counseling teachers or discipline masters in the school. Some of the teachers had been capacitated for the exercise while others had not. Those who had not been trained usually paid lip service to the reports made by the children as the extract below illustrates.

Teachers are preoccupied with other activities such that when you report to them these cases, they tell you to come later. Therefore, we would like to ask for a specific place to report cases concerned with child maltreatment, violation of child rights, and improper behaviours. I think for this CHIDEP club to grow, we should educate others of the presence of CHIDEP and its objectives and also custodians should be there to supervise what we are doing whether it is right or wrong. (Ngokolo S.S. Girls FGD).

Some club leaders worked with monitoring forms designed by CBOs while in other cases there were no reporting forms at all. Some CBO were rigorous and very active following up what school clubs did through weekly, monthly, and termly visits. School patrons and matrons and some untrained teachers were the supervisors of the CBO clubs.

I would like to request the CHIDEP Custodians to come and join us during the club time. They would come on any day we would have agreed together to conduct our club activities. So they participate with us during club time (Ngokolo girls FGD).

5.5.6 Outcomes from the school based IEC interventions
Pupils and students who were accessed IEC on child marriage and child rights reported benefiting from those sessions. They indicated that the messages helped them to protect themselves. Many were able to describe the consequences of child marriage and early pregnancies. For example, girls from Buchambi Primary School reported that:

When a little girl gets married, she will get pregnant. The little girl gets complications because of immature biological body which in turn may tear apart and eventually the girl dies. (FGD girls Buchambi Primary School, Kishapu district).

When girls were asked how they would respond to their parents who were trying to convince them to marry a rich man all the girls replied in the negative.

No, because I am under 18 years, it is not legal to be married.

Myself, I won’t accept to such a thing because my body is not fully matured …..

Also primary school boys indicated that if asked to marry they would refuse and the reasons they would give would be:
I am still young and she is big. I have not chosen her by myself. I am a pupil and still in school. I would say no and go to police.

These type of responses indicated that the children were really empowered with information which would enable them fight for their rights and protection. Children were sensitive to the problem of child marriage and its consequences. They were aware of the causes and the tactics used by parents to get their girls out of school to go and marry. Some of the reasons given by children for child marriages in their communities were: poverty; the desire for wealth; and because parents wanted grandchildren. The children also were made aware of the dangers of child marriage by the lived experiences of their sisters who had married early. Some information on the dangers of child marriage was obtained from their science teachers. The children mentioned the CBO names which taught them about good parenting practices, abstinence from marriage, and menstruation issues.

Even boys in primary schools who had been reached by the CBOs knew the consequences of child marriage. Some of the bad things arising from child marriage which were mentioned by the boys were contraction of HIV/AIDS and pregnancies at early age. The boys in Mwantini primary knew the people to report abuses. These included the head teacher, or deputy head teacher, and teachers in situations where the latter two were not available.

Senior boys in secondary schools were also sensitive to the problem of child marriage in their communities as the quotation below illustrates.

For me, I am living out there in the village; this issue is very big in my village. You find that very young girls have children; this makes them fail to study and make their dreams come true. Many the young girls who were seen with children were aged 16-17 years. (FGD boys, Town Secondary School – Shinyanga Municipality).

Forced marriage in Shinyanga is common … we normally see it in the streets. There are many young girls of our age who are now mothers. They delivered children when still young. And there are many girls especially in the villages who are already married staying with their husbands while they have not reached 18 years (FGD girls – Town secondary school, Shinyanga municipality).

In town, there are people with bad behaviours who influence girls and they get pregnant; they drop out of school and keep at home. In the rural areas, girls are forced to drop out of school to marry by parents who want cows and money to get out of poverty (FGD girls – Town secondary school, Shinyanga municipality).

Secondary school students were aware of the factors associated with child marriage. These included: poverty of parents and their inability to provide basic needs for their children; ignorance of the negative effect of child marriage; children not knowing their rights and the right time to get married; cultural values and norms. Child marriage and pregnancies were also associated with long distances girls walked to draw water from dams and rivers approximated to be about 10 km a return journey. This made them tired and at risk of being harmed. Lack of employment even for the educated discourage some children from continuing with education. Living in single parent families was also identified as a risk factor for child pregnancies and early marriage. This is because single parents do not have time for the children because of their many responsibilities. Some mothers are also not good
models for children. “White skinned” (brown/fair skin complexion) girls were believed to be more at risk of being married off early.

The boys’ focus discussion groups also indicated that there were some boys who married before 18 years and some of these got married to older women also called “sugar mummies”. These boys were attracted by the wealth of women.

*And we boys prefer wealth to poverty. So boys tend to have love affairs with sugar mummies in order to get wealth.* (FGD boys, Town Secondary School – Shinyanga Municipality)

The FGD of boys in the secondary school were aware of the constitutional provisions relating to the allowable age for marriage. The boys listed a number of reasons why boys married early: to obtain respect from the community; prestige; to control a woman because this is considered to be an achievement by some tribes. Effects of early marriages by boys included: diseases contracting HIV/AIDS, sexually transmitted diseases (STDs); failure to meet their dreams, and increased poverty.

### 5.6 Other observations by the Evaluation Team on the school sub-program

1. The school based IEC is a highly relevant strategy in fighting child marriage. However, its current design and non-uniform implementation threatens its effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability.
2. Too many structures are used in school based IEC programs; and yet none is satisfactorily and effectively used for the attainment of the desired social goals.
3. The program relegated the training of teachers. Children were trained before the teachers-the gate keepers and important action systems. This affected the levels of motivation, commitment, engagement and accountability by teachers and head teachers for the CBO school clubs. Where teachers were trained they were too few to be effective and to be relied on to sustain the cause of ending child marriage and early pregnancies in the nearest future.
4. The school club members and the few trained school patrons and matrons are undertaking more tasks including counseling on psychosocial problems of children and yet these skills were never obtained from the CBOs. This is likely to compromise the quality of services in schools. It means that in the future counseling skills need to be given.

*It would be useful to first undertake a training needs assessment and a baseline of the existing skills among teachers in primary and secondary before the subprogram is redesigned and streamlined.*

5. It was understood that reproductive health is covered as a topic or module in the secondary school curriculum. This brings to question why scarce resources were spent by CBOs teaching the same issues to secondary school students. There may be need again to first establish the gaps in the reproductive health issues covered in secondary school syllabus before redesigning the SRHR program to be provided to secondary school students.
6. The amount of time reportedly spent teaching school clubs (of about 2-3 hours) was not adequate. This was worsened by the fact that monitoring and support activities by CBOs were also minimal in schools. The dosage of teaching needs to be beefed up based on FF
determination of the optimal time required to help the school clubs members grow to the level of trainers. Practical training needs to be an integral part of the training the CBO incorporate in the training.

7. CBOs also need to respond to school club member’ request for certificates of attendance or participation in peer education to end child marriage in Shinyanga.

8. Structures for reporting child rights violations in homes and schools were fuzzy to school children. CBOs need to streamline these with the head teachers of the schools because the current chain of command is slow and sometimes ineffective to respond to reports of abuse of children in schools and in homes.

9. CBOs used varied follow-up /monitoring approaches of school level activities. These need to be streamlined retaining those that work best given existing resources.

10. The nature of problems addressed in the school based IEC sub-program and IEC messages given are too varied which is likely to affect the uniformity of impacts. SRHR is critical to the program and needs to be integrated in the Initiative and implemented by all CBOs in all schools. There may be need to develop a minimum package of IEC for primary and for secondary school children such that each child of the same age, and gender are at par with each other in expected knowledge levels, skills and overall empowerment.

11. While some CBOs provided IEC on SRHR starting with primary 3 others started with pupils in primary 4. These inconsistencies in practices may produce inequities and differential impacts in the targeted population served by the same program.

12. Some CBOs targeted IEC in schools to girls only while some targeted both gender. This needs to be streamlined by the program and ensure equity-equality by targeting both boys and girls in upcoming phases.

5.7 Response/ treatment of victims of child marriage
Response or treatment was another service given by the FF partner CBOs to victims of child marriage. It addressed the psychosocial needs of the victims and their families as well as social justice issues of the criminal cases of child marriage. The rescue services helped to restore the victim’s rights which had been violated back to normal. The program pulled girls off from their husbands back to their parents and back to school. Children on the streets were also pulled off the streets and returned to their parents and back to school. Child brides who had been arrayed for marriage were rescued and marriage ceremonies cancelled.

This sub-program was largely anchored on AGAPE which had a specific project outcome of tracking information on child marriages in Shinyanga. It also had a service delivery structure – a legal department to pursue child marriage crimes, a hostel to accommodate rescued girls from early marriages, a school for enabling the same girls to continue with their secondary education, and vocational training. All the other CBOs which came across planned child marriages referred the cases to AGAPE for social and legal management. Most of the cases managed were those that occurred in the operational time period of the FF initiative to end child marriage. However, CBOS like YWL and YWCA targeted survivors of child marriage – the single young mothers who had married but separated. Normally these found it difficult to settle at home because the fathers had eaten the dowry
of the son-in law and feared he would demand back his dowry. So most fathers did not accept the girls back in their homes. Seven girls who run away from marriage were resettled in vocational training schools by YWCA and given life skills in Agape Vocational training Centre.

This section presents finding relating to the tasks, processes and progress attained in the management of victims of child marriage as well as the practice challenges of the response sub-program.

5.7.1 The process of rescuing girls planned for marriage
The rescue process was triggered by largely two events – a planned marriage and a tested and confirmed pregnancy. The process of rescuing girls planned for marriage was started by the secret informers of Agape who resided in the same village as the family of the girls preparing the marriage. These reported through phoning to Agape who reported to police. The police then went to the village to arrest the girl, the parents of the girl, the groom and his parents and key people in the marital arrangement. Sometimes the CBOs used the village militia (the sungusungus) to do the arrests.

The process of identifying a planned child marriage was easy because of the nature of the Sukuma traditional marrying processes. The process of child marriage involves negotiations over bride price between parents of both the girl and the man or between the parents of the girl and the man himself. The mother of the girl is most times aware about the planned marriage but does not sit on the dowry negotiating table. That is the role of the fathers. The girl is stopped from studying. Cattle is brought into the home of the girl for payment of the dowry. Most girls marry after completing standard (primary) 7 at the age of 13, 14 and 15 years. When cattle is seen and marriage ceremony arrangements are in place then the whistle blower rings AGAPE officers who start on the process of arrest with the police.

In the case of a pregnancy, the community or school reports a pregnancy. The CBO gets a team of experts including police and social welfare officer to arrest the culprit and do social investigations respectively. The girl is taken to hospital for check-up. The girl is removed from her home to avoid distorting evidence. The girl is required to choose a place she feels safe to stay after court proceedings. Pregnancy is suspected by the teachers when the girl starts missing classes or truanting. Truancy is common in primary 5, 6 and 7. It was reported that some schools girls are clinically checked for pregnancy every 3 months. Once the police has registered the case, then it arrests the culprit, the man who made the girl pregnant. Prosecution and judicial processes proceed.

5.7.2 Resettlement and rehabilitation process
All rescued girls whether pregnant or not are housed at the hostel in Agape School of Knowledge based at Chibe. They are required to stay at this official accommodation to reduce on perpetrator’s interference with the court case. The duration of the girl’s stay at the hostel varies with the case but it is usually not less than 6 months. Meantime, as the legal case is being pursued the AGAPE staff try to reconcile and reunite the girl with her parents. The girl is also placed in either vocational training or secondary education at the AGAPE School of Knowledge.
5.7.3 Response to child marriage and social justice
This was the most poorly implemented because it depended on government justice, law, and order sector (JLOS) which CBOs did not have control over. The abused children and their families also were reported to interfere a lot in the pursuance of social justice for victims of child marriage. Very few cases of perpetrators in child marriage cases had their cases prosecuted, convicted and sentenced. Part of the problem was the parents and girls who connived with perpetrators to withhold witnessing against the case.

5.7.4 Reporting of sexual abuses and other child rights violations
One most important activity that preceded response and upon which response was built was reporting. The CBOs, social welfare departments or police cannot effectively help the children in a timely and effective manner unless someone reports an abuse or planned abuse to the child. Reporting may be “internal” or “external” to the systems (such as family, community or school) where an abuse has happened. While external reporting systems such as reporting to local leaders, the child protection committees, social welfare officers, and CBOs was relatively well developed by government, and most people including children knew where to report, internal reporting (within systems) was not well developed and discussed.

All FF CBO Partners emphasized the need for all people to be vigilant towards abused children in their neighbourhood. Government has also structures of leaders, police, and child protection committees, where abuses could be reported.

5.7.5 Challenges of the response/treatment program of child marriage victims
The major challenge mentioned with the response sub-program of FF Initiative is the corruption of the police and parents.

There are those who are sexually abused, however, the case may be taken to police but a few days the culprit bribes the officers and is let free. And once the police receives the money, they tell the culprit who reported him. So the people are afraid to report to police because is it not trustworthy and cannot assure you of your safety and anonymity” (FGD Women group Buchambi, Mondo ward).

The parents of the abused child will hate you and so we are afraid to report” (FGD Women group Buchambi, Mondo ward).

5.8 Some observations by the Evaluation Team on the Response sub-program
1. The response sub-program has an observable effect on the reduction of child marriage. However, it is characterised by grave ethical bottlenecks which threaten its effectiveness in the future.
2. While the psychosocial strategy of the response sub-program is satisfactorily well implemented the resettlement work needs more rethinking to reduce on expenditures on accommodated girls who have parents to care for them.
3. Police’s poor response to child abuse cases was alluded to by many communities visited during this evaluation. Police is an important action system that the FF initiative needed to have developed a strong alliance with shared values and practices on child protection through
training. It was reported that some police officers who sit on the village and ward child protection committees were trained by CBOs on their responsibilities towards child protection. The evaluation team feels that the number of police officers trained were too few to make an impact on the program. The Initiative needs to prioritise the training of a core mass of police officers in child protection issues and practice ethics.

4. The FF partners need to work with the social welfare and community development on ways of protecting the whistle blowers of child abuse cases. If members are to continue reporting child abuse cases including planned child marriages reporting needs to be made anonymous.

5. Although fear of being arrested and imprisoned for as many as 30 years (which is included in the Education Act) has created fear in the public leading to reduced child marriage, fear cannot sustain behavioural change as evidenced by other social programs like HIV/AIDS prevention and control activities in countries like Uganda. Reductions in HIV incidences was initially driven by fear of death instilled in people. Later people got used to the fear messages, got complacent, and HIV incidences went up again. CBOs need to introduce an approach of using community dialogues whereby community members themselves discuss the drivers of child marriage, (discover through guided discussions) the importance of gender equality and especially educating both boys and girls, and dangers of child marriage. They are then guided to make a reasoned decision. Managing community dialogues calls for training of CBO staff in this approach.

6. There is a likelihood of poor families faking child marriage so that they gain access to free vocational services, secondary education, and other benefits.

7. There are unintended effects of the Initiative creating another generation of single mothers and children without fathers and putative relatives since the fathers are locked up in jails for 30 years. The severe laws do not protect future children and families. This could be one area CBOs need to revisit and lobby for change.

---

*The response strategy is not working very well and needs to be improved; or more effort needs to be put into prevention efforts to end child marriage.*

---

5.9 Linkages with government child protection service delivery structures

Strengthening linkages between the FF CBO Partners and the government service delivery structures including leaderships at different levels of governance was one the outcome pursued by the FF Initiative to end child marriage. Both the preventive and response interventions to end child marriage and pregnancies were done in partnership with the existing government child protection structures. The government structures comprised of child protection committees at village and ward levels, departments of social welfare, community development, police, ward executives, and village chairmen. CBOs also worked with health workers from health units. The linkages took two forms which the Evaluation Team preferred to call “working with” and “working on” government child protection structures. Working with government structures involved sharing responsibilities in the implementation of the initiative from planning, programming and actual implementation. Working on government child protection structures involved their strengthening by the CBOs.
5.9.1 Working “with” government departments
CBOs were on the whole providing complementary services helping the government departments to fulfill their legal and policy mandates in child protection. The CBOs implemented government policies and programs thus complementing the efforts of government and filling gaps that would have been left unfilled. Although they were filling gaps, they still worked closely with government departments and child protection committees set up by government. The government child protection structures could best be perceived as action systems without which problem solving could not effectively take place.

The social welfare workers, community development, health workers helped to teach communities, families and children about child rights, and roles and responsibilities of duty bearers towards child protection. Social welfare officers were used to train and strengthen child protection committees at ward level to be able to undertake their responsibilities. The CBOs used government manuals and different experts to train community members and school children.

The Livestock Extension Staff taught poor families identified and supported by CBOs how to construct chicken shelter and how to care for the birds for income generation. Health workers were drawn from hospital to help teach school children SRHR. The CBOs used savings and credit groups mobilized and established by community development officers to teach skillful parenting. Community leaders in villages, wards and districts participated in the mobilization of communities for awareness creation of child rights and dangers of child marriage and pregnancies. The teachers, school matrons and patrons were used to support school clubs formed to sensitize children about child marriage and pregnancies. CBOs engaged government officials in their monitoring activities and vice versa. CBOs shared information with government departments on the progress made in fighting child marriage.

The police was called upon now and again to arrest perpetrators of child marriage. The village militia, the “sungusungus” were used to arrest errant girls at risk of being abused and to prohibit children engaging in activities such as traditional dances that put them at risk of sexual abuse, pregnancy, and child marriage. CBOs also worked with the faith based organisations to mobilise communities and parents for IEC.

I remember there were two girls who eloped with young men; one being taken to Hungumarwa in Kwimba district, Mwanza region, and another to Kishapu, Shinyanga region. Follow-ups were made by sungusungu and they were able to bring them back. Sungusungu also prohibits the night traditional dances to children under 18 years. When children attend these, sungusungu takes on the role of chasing them back to their homes (Board members, Mkombozj).

5.9.2 Working “on” or strengthening government child protection structures
The FF partner CBOs directly and indirectly strengthened the government child protection structures. They worked with already established child protection committees (CPCs); while in some places they worked with community development and social welfare departments to set them up.

The table below shows the number of CPCs each FF partner CBO worked with and strengthened.
Table 3: The number of Child Protection Committees CBOs worked with at village level as by August 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CBO</th>
<th>No. of CPC worked with at village level</th>
<th>No. of CPC the CBO helped to create</th>
<th>No. of the CPC Existing at the start of FF’s Initiate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OPE</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWL</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICS</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVMC</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAI</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAFIKI</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGAPE</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHIDEP</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MKOMBOZI</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWWCO</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEADO</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total CPCs</strong></td>
<td><strong>154</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>113</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The CBOs strengthened a total of 154 child protection committees. They helped to set up 30 CPCs. This increase in functional CPCs implies an improvement in the availability and accessibility of these structures to families and children for improved reporting and protection of children against abuses. This was a relevant and commendable strategy.

The FF partner CBOs lobbied local governments to allocate more resources to the social welfare departments to enable them reach out to provide technical support to CPCs at ward levels. The ward level child protection committees were in turn to reach out to the village CPCs to improve their functioning. The CBOs used government manuals and regulations during the training and strengthening of village child protection teams. This strategy helped to create a wider base of change agents involved in the fight against child marriage.

CPCs are very important government established structures that oversee child protection issues in their respective communities. The CPCs comprise of the politically elected village chairperson, the executive director who is an appointed government officer and other notable government officials such as the police, community militia, teachers in nearby schools. The committees are named after the name of the village or street in the urban areas.

The roles and responsibilities of the child protection committees were: - advocating for children’s rights and particularly ensuring that children attend and complete school. The CPCs participated in the sensitization of community members about child rights and the dangers of child marriage. They collaborated with the CBOs to identify service beneficiaries like single parent mothers and other vulnerable children who were living in abject poverty and hard conditions, and referred them to different organizations. They proposed some bye-laws which were approved by the ward counselors. One such bye-law was requiring that a person planning to marry produces a birth certificate such that
they do not lie about the ages of the girl. Child protection committees also received reports of child abuse cases and followed them up to relevant authorities like the police.

5.9.3 Common child protection cases managed by CPCs
Some of the common problems worked on by child protection committees were: cruelty against children such as burning a child’s body parts when she/he made a mistake. They received many reports where children were denied food; where the girls were defiled in in their homes and schools, and case of severe corporal punishment of children. Child marriage and pregnancies were also common as well as abandonment of families by fathers leaving child care and support purely to women. Because women depended purely on men for their survival, when they were abandoned, they also abandoned their children. Social problems commonly experienced by boys involved dropping out of school due to parents requiring them to engage in production – agriculture, livestock keeping, working in diamond mining sites and small businesses. The parents were very economical as they preferred to use family labour to herd animals rather sending children to school. However, this is likely to be changed by government through its new policy requiring farmers to reduce the number of cattle kept by each household. This is likely to release children to get back to school.

Otherwise, boys do not have a lot of problems except where they are denied food or where they are badly beaten” (5 child protection committee met at Didia council offices).

Reports of child abuse were commonly reported by neighbors to the family of the abused child. They reported the case to the village chairperson. In turn the chairperson reported the case to the child protection committee. The child protection committee took the case to the nearest police. The police referred the case to the police gender desk of a bigger police station for arrest, subsequent prosecution, and court proceedings.

When it was discovered that the child had been defiled, the first step was to go police to obtain Police form number 3 (PF3) which the victim took to hospital for verification of defilement. The filled form was taken back to the police for filing the case and prosecution. However, this process was many times intercepted by corruption practices involving the bribed police and the rich culprits. Sometimes it is the parents who are bribed and they fail to turn up to witness in courts of law leading to dismissal of the case.

5.9.4 Reported achievements from working with and on government child protection structures
The involvement of government structures in CBO activities increased the effectiveness of the CBOs interventions and sustainability as the CBOs used trained staff and approved training manuals. Likewise, the transactions should have helped local government staff to improve their practices competence for better management and control of child marriage in the future when FF support to CBOs ceases.

There were increased community reporting of child abuse cases to government authorities and the child protection committees. Community members have developed new attitudes and a sense of responsibility where everyone sees oneself as having a responsibility to protect a child whether theirs
or somebody else’s child. Likewise, teachers were reporting cases of children they suspected not to be feeling well or behaving right.

There was reduced physical abuse to children. Child marriage was also reported to be decreasing although there were still some people who were still resistant to change. CPCs attributed these changes to the education they obtained from several NGOs such as Agape, ICS and Save the Children Fund. The achievement was also attributed to the empowerment of children obtained from school clubs.

5.9.5 Some observation by the Evaluation Team

1. There were limited numbers of government officials trained in child protection issues and processes. For example, the teachers and police were not well targeted for training for more effective participation in the program and overall service delivery. The next phase needs to target training more on the most critical government departments.

2. Faith based organizations and traditional leaders were minimally used. These need to be involved more in the program in the coming phase.

3. Impacts of the relationships between CBOs and government were not monitored and documented by the Initiative.

5.10 Advocacy

5.10.1 Lobbying work done

The CBOs also engaged in advocacy and lobbying work to improve policies and laws at local government and national levels concerning child protection. For example, they lobbied local government to increase the budget for the social welfare department to enable them take services to the grassroots. The CBOs wanted the social welfare departments to take a more proactive role to train, mentor and support the child protection committees and effectively attend to child protection cases.

This arose out of the argument that CBOs like OPE was being granted 52 million to do child protection activities in 6 wards yet the social welfare officers who had to implement similar activities in 25 wards were given only 3m/=.

Following this lobbying, the local government increased funding for social welfare departments from 3 million TZ shilling to 25 million TZ shillings in 2017/2018.

Other areas where CBOs did advocacy work were: - a) requiring district councils to receive and discuss child abuse cases during their meetings; b) increased reporting of child abuse cases to ward and district officers including reporting of old cases; c) development of tools to monitor implemented activities.

At national level the CBOs participated in litigation process requiring government to nullify the marriage act which required girls to marry at 15 years with consent of the parent contrary to the constitutional provisions of 18 years. The NGOs won the case in court although government appealed to higher courts of law.

Other achievements were:- bye- laws were made at ward level to protect children against sexual abuses; against seduction of girls by old men; prohibiting sexual relationships between girls and boys in schools and district councils accepted to develop tools to monitor implemented child protection activities.
5.10.2 Some observations by the Evaluation Team

1. There are many other areas calling for advocacy and lobbying. The FF partner CBO needs to come up with a framework to identify these areas so that advocacy becomes a complete sub-program systematically designed and implemented by the partners.

2. This is one activity which was implemented and CBOs were not skilled how to effectively do it. If it is to become a sub-program then FF needs to support capacity building in this practice area.

5.11 Community participation in the FF initiative and experiences

People were knowledgeable of the CBOs that served their communities. They knew the CBOs by name. However, they did not know FF as a sponsor of the activities. The community members and also children confirmed the roles played by FF partner CBOs in fighting child marriage. Community members including children participated in the program as service consumers, service providers, and sources of information for the community dialogues and for this evaluation, thus operationalizing the FF values of community ownership and community driven approach.

5.11.1 Community members as service consumers

Community members attended community awareness campaigns organized by the FF Partner CBOs to end child marriage as service consumers. Parents attended skillful parenting trainings in their savings and credit groups. School going children were accessed information on child rights, dangers of child marriage and SRHR.

The participation of men in community awareness campaigns was, however, minimal compared to that of women. Likewise the participation of boys was limited compared to that of girls in schools. The exclusion of boys was partly because they were considered less vulnerable to early marriages and school dropping out. It could not be established how much of the information obtained by women in the absence of the men reached the fathers. Nonetheless, the CBOs are, commended for the innovative ways devised to reach some men in their coffee joints and for using radios to reach out entire communities. Few CBOs targeted out of school youth and single mothers. The out of school is another group not well targeted by the Initiative. It was also not clear how well their needs were addressed.

If the needs of the out of school youths and other excluded population groups are to be addressed by all CBOs in the future, there may be need to first ascertain their needs, strengths, opportunities and challenges.

Many of the populations groups which participated in the awareness creation activities of the FF Initiative were satisfied with the knowledge and skills obtained. Parents were particularly satisfied with the skillful parenting training obtained. Members of the women’s FGDs conducted by the Evaluation Team indicated that parents who attended the trainings were able to talk to their children about risky situations and places where they could easily be defiled. They told their children not develop rapport with strangers, nor accept gifts from them. They cautioned their children against going to secluded places and entering houses of strangers. Trained women were able to talk to children
about sexuality issues something which had been considered taboo before they were trained. This information helped children to protect themselves.

We treat our children with love lest they never tell us what happens to them. We have also come to learn that a neighbour’s child is also your child (FGD Women…YWCA).

Before, we considered each grown up girl as ready for marriage and pride price. My son has grown up - he should marry a girl to help in domestic chores. Training has changed our old thinking and practices (aged female participant FGD Mawaza village, Mawaza Ward).

Men who had ever attended awareness creation by the CBOs appreciated the knowledge given and it changed the way they related with girl children.

Previously the girl child could not ask her father to buy her panties or pads but now fathers are able to buy these because they are cloth like other cloth in shops. (Men FGD Mondo ward).

Men’s discussion groups indicated that men were slowly changing their attitudes towards girl education. The argument that education of the girl child was more beneficial to the husband of the girl and less to the girl’s biological was fading away. Men, however, noted that the long duration of schooling, and high unemployment rates make many fathers question the value of education. Men suggested that many more men could be reached through public meetings called by the village leaders.

5.10.2 Community members as service providers
Some members of the community notably the community facilitators, leaders of the school clubs, and whistle blowers in AGAPE’s response sub-program participated in the FF initiative as service providers. They were able to offer services after undergoing some training. Some of these volunteers were trained for satisfactorily adequate time periods, while others like members of the school clubs were provided inadequate training and follow ups. The community facilitators were given certificates but others like the school club participants and leaders were not given. Actually the school club participants requested the CBOs to provide them with certificates.

There is need to determine the optimal time essential for training the school clubs. There is also need to determine methods of reaching out to all children in a school to ensure that all children are empowered and are benefitting from the program.

5.10.3 Community members as information providers
As information providers, community members provided information for the community dialogues whereby they identified child needs and problems that the Initiative needed to address; and how to address them. The community dialogues were used to design the interventions and especially in the identification of children’s spaces which the Initiative targeted. This was commendable.

During this evaluation, men and women provided their own assessments of the child marriage status before and after CBO and government interventions. A discussion group of men reported that child marriage was reducing; and that in urban areas child marriage had reduced to zero. They associated the reduction to a number of factors including:- a) the commitment and dedication put in by the
government in terms of policies and laws; b) enforcement of existing laws including the arrest and imprisonment of culprits for long periods; c) the awareness creation about the dangers of child marriage done by CBOs particularly in urban areas; d) the improved distribution of secondary schools (built in each ward) which reduced the walking distances of students and risks.

Child marriage was reported by community members to have reduced particularly in the urban areas and not the rural areas. One major indicator of child marriage reduction was the increased school enrolments and completion by girls and boys in ward level government schools.

CHIDEP is doing well but it would be better if it could increase its coverage to even remote and rural areas where child marriage is greatest. (Men’s FGD Ngokolo).

Some FGDs of women and men who, however, believed that child marriage had not significantly reduced across Shinyanga Region. Two reasons were provided for this perception: - a) Child marriages were still practiced secretly because of fear to be arrested; b) Children used to marry soon after completing standard (primary) seven but now the parents married the girls off after senior two and three. In other words, the ages of child marriage have been extended slightly from standard 7 to junior secondary.

Child marriage and pregnancies for Kishapu is still in existence; many of them. But people like to lie and not say the truth; they tend to say let us cover the issue for a while but child pregnancies and marriages are there and extremely” (FGD with men Mondo ward).

The teachers are bad. They interfere by bringing in AGAPE to arrest us. They are jealous of us; the child is fifteen years old and has to get married (Men FGD Mondo ward, Kishapu district).

It was indicated that as people got arrested under the rescue program of Agape, the people also changed tactics of managing the child marriage ceremonies. The parents were now staging older girls to act as the brides and yet a younger underage girl had already been sent to the husband to be. The major reason for this persistence in rural areas was poverty. Parents blamed teachers for interfering with the planned marriages.

If the FF CBO partners are to extend the initiative to rural areas, they need to intensively implement or support poverty alleviation programs.

Men explained why they choose to marry off the girls when they were still children. The major reason was to reduce on the dependency of many people on the household head. If the girl got pregnant and the man who made her pregnant ran away, the girl and the baby would depend on the biological father for upkeep. If she were allowed to stay in schools for long, and she got pregnant that constituted economic loss to the father who would have invested a lot of money in her education. The economic reasoning espoused from the perspective of the fathers selfishly overlooked the costs to the girls resulting from premature termination of her education. The reasoning also shows existence of pessimistic mind sets and lifestyles which need to be addressed in the next phase.
When men were asked about their current and potential roles to fight child marriage, they listed these responsibilities: i) cautioning children not to marry early, ii) better communication in homes with wife and children; iii) creating alternative sources of income other than depending on the sale of their daughters into early marriage. However, men found a lot of challenges engaging in viable production to obtain incomes especially in agriculture because of absence of inputs like tractors. The government was reported to be addressing issues of poverty through loans and men were reported to be members of the savings and credit groups.

The community population groups explained why some parents did not cooperate with CBOs to pursue social justice for the girl following rescue from a planned marriage.

_They tend to think that if they went ahead with the case they may not be able to get anything from it; because, after all, they will still remain with the pregnancy to care for. The problem for lack of cooperation was the limited knowledge about these issues.”_ (Men’s FGD Ngokolo).

### 5.10.3 Community participation and the reporting of child rights violations

Community members participated in the Initiative by reporting cases of child abuse and planned early marriages. This was made possible by the increased awareness creation about the dangers of child marriage and child rights. However, women FGDs indicated that they found it difficult reporting sexual abuses committed against children in homes. Women were many times the first to know about a sexual abuse of the girl but they feared to report because the daughter would get ashamed and disgraced in the community. Balancing emotions of women such as fear of shame, with the social benefits of reporting was not effectively addressed in the IEC done by CBOs. The story in the box below brings out the huddles of reporting sexual abuse in homes.

**Box: Extract indicating common responses to child defilement in homes by mothers**

_A member of a street governance committee shared with the evaluator a case which had been reported to their offices involving a family where a nephew continually defiled a young girl and the girl kept silent. One time the mother checked on the girl at night and found she was being defiled. The mother waited for several days to obtain an apology from the boy (the nephew). When she saw that he was not apologetic she then reported him to the street governance leaders. Members in the group agreed that the mother did not act right because they knew the procedures and effects of delayed reporting. Other mothers, however, argued that “we mothers are of the same character”. We can witness the sexual abuse to a child and tell the mother of the child to report the case. Instead of cooperating to report, the mother of the victim can start to see you as a betrayer. We do not want to publicize the sexual abuses of our children for fear of shame and disgrace._

The extract above has several implications for the next phase of the FF Initiative to end child marriage:

- IEC messages need to be designed to more effectively guide “internal” reporting of sexual abuse cases in homes and in schools by women and children.
- Issues of ignorance, fear, and silence by victims of sexual violence (women and children) in homes needs to be addressed.
• There should be intervention strategies for prevention and response - particularly counselling to the victims and survivors of sexual abuse in homes and schools.

• The role and importance of social justice in the lives of individual children and women needs also needs to be addressed in the next phase.

According to the FF Program Officer, the Initiative had planned to adopt a technology where sexually abused people could use mobile messages to report incidents. They entered into an agreement with a company based in Uganda called ETCM to develop the application but the company got bankrupt and closed down before execution of the exercise. The FF Officer planned to work with another company called SESEMA which worked with government and UNICEF.

5.10.4 Challenges to effective community participation in the FF Initiative to end child marriage

1. Corrupt nature of the police. This discouraged reporting and ability of girls to obtain justices in cases of sexual abuse and other child rights violations. Despite this challenge, some cases are still reported to police, successfully go through courts of law and are sentenced.

   For example, after receiving the training from YWCA, we received a case that some months back, a boy had been sodomised by a cattle keeper of the family in the grazing area. The case was reported to police and courts and was convicted, sentenced and is now in prison. Previously, the parents would have not taken any action because the family would argue that it has nobody to take care of the cattle. They would value cattle over their family; over their own child! The abuser would be deducted his wages by a half and be stays on the job!! (Women FGD under YWCA)

2. Reporting of child abuse cases was problematic because it created enmity between the reporter and perpetrators of child marriage resident in the same community

3. Mothers are not knowledgeable about SRHR issues to tell a child less than 10 years.

4. Mothers did not know the sexuality issues to sensitize boys on.

5. Despite the training provided by CBOs, children were still beaten by some teachers in Kishapu.

   When you make follow up of a child who had been severely beaten by teachers, the teachers hate you exempting the pupil from entering class just because the child’s parents complained about the severe punishments given to her child (FGD women Mondo ward).

6. Child pregnancies were still a problem in rural areas of Kishapu district. When a girl got pregnant she sometimes got married and at other times failed.

   Men were making girls pregnant and running away and girls kept the names of the men secret such that the problem could not be solved. (FGD women Mondo ward).

7. Continued powerlessness of women to say no to child marriage when proposed by fathers. Mothers were powerless to reverse the decisions of their husbands.

   If you try to stop the arranged child marriage by the husband, he would remind you about the dowry he gave your parents when he was marrying you and that the cows given to marry the mother were an investment to be recovered by the daughter’s dowry. (FGD women Mondo ward).
8. Denial of food to children by step parents and giving children hard work to do. Abused children could not report these abuses. Most times it were neighbours who reported the observed abuses to the leaders and village chairman. The major challenge with neighbours reporting is this yielded hatred.

5.10.5 Monitoring of service delivery activities
The service delivery sub-program was likewise not systematically monitored by the CBOs. Although they wrote monthly and quarterly reports to the lead partners and finally to FF using a uniform reporting and monitoring framework developed by FF, they did not report on behavioral outcomes they pursued in communities. There was minimal follow of families and communities to check on adoption of accepted parenting practices. No operational research was done for the interventions. This latter issue is of course complicated by limited capacity of the CBOs to do research. There may be need for FF to identify problems calling for operational research and commissioning it for more evidence based programming and implementation.

5.10.6 Some observations done by the evaluation team
1. Pursuance of social justice is still a big challenge in this initiative. The initiative may need to develop manuals on the role and importance of social justice to individual girls and the affected family.
2. Reporting of defilement cases occurring in homes and also schools was not effectively handled as some mothers preferred an apology from an abusive relative to prompt reporting for the girl to obtain medical treatment such as an HIV prophylaxis. The FF partners need to strengthen “internal” reporting systems of sexual abuse.
3. There is still a lot of gender inequality in homes and powerlessness of women unable to influence decisions that affect them and their children.
4. Reporting of child abuses was threatened by the created enmity between neighbours.
CHAPTER SIX

OVERALL ACHIEVEMENTS, CHALLENGES, AND UNMET NEEDS

6.1 Introduction

This chapter presents findings relating to the overall achievements, challenges and unmet child protection needs and problems. The achievements presented in this chapter are those relating to the designed program objectives and theory. The report also presents the indicators of achievements useful for designing monitoring framework of program outcomes in the next phase.

6.2 Overall Achievements

6.2.1 Reduced child marriage and pregnancies

Child marriage was reported to have reduced in Shinyanga Region from 59% to 34%[32] and Shinyanga was no longer the leading region in child marriages. Significant reductions happened more in the urban areas than in the rural areas. Some of the indicators that child marriage had reduced included:

a) the members of the child protection committees no longer see infants abandoned by mothers;
b) children who pass standard seven continue to secondary school;
c) the rate of teenage pregnancies is decreasing;
d) reduction of defilements of girls which used to occur during traditional dances, at water wells, bushes and on the way to school and homes;
e) increased numbers of girls going to school;
f) Number of girls who had left school for marriage or other reasons returning to school.

Reductions were attributed to many factors including governments’ commitment to fight the problem through enactment and enforcement of existing laws and policies, establishment of child protection structures such as CPCs and the gender desk at police stations, and construction of secondary schools in every ward. The FF initiative to end child marriage, and the interventions of many other NGOs such as Save the Children Fund also contributed enormously to the reduction of child marriage in the region. Improved housing structures were reported to have reduced on defilements. There were many cases where child marriage was averted due to parents getting alternative sources of income.

On the part of FF, the achievements were attributed to the multifaceted approach which targeted the child, the family and the community and strengthening of child protection systems. The many FF CBO partners aggressively mobilized communities, creating awareness of the masses about children’s rights and the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies.

6.2.2 Increased sensitivity to child marriage problems and child abuse

Communities and children were more sensitive to the problem of child marriage and child abuses. Indicators were:

a) Children know about the child protection committees and where to report problems;
b) Neighbors were able to report child abuse cases to relevant authorities.
c) There was increased interest in reproductive health issues evidenced by the influx of students who visited some CBOs for more information or clarifications;

d) An increased habit of youths reading SRHR books.

e) Girls report to their matrons when refused to go to school.

f) The enforcement of the Child Protection Act, followed by arrests of those who marry girls below 18 years have awakened the community to the law.

6.2.3 Improved organizational development of the FF CBO partners

There was significant improvement in the capacity of CBOs following their capacity building. CBOs moved from the level of CBO to NGO level. TAI acquired the status of a non-governmental organization. TAI and RAFIKI managed to attract more funding and were obtaining grants directly from FF. Many CBOs such as OPE focused their programs and were implementable and they easily monitored their activities. The initiative has been able to build the confidence of the CBO staff such that they can stand and make presentations of their activities during quarterly meetings and in international conferences. The CBOs were able to use the acquired organizational competences to help community groups such as savings and credit groups to organize themselves, write constitutions, register, save etc. There was increased professionalization of the CBOs.

6.2.4 All CBOs implemented most of their planned activities

The plans and implemented activities of the Initiative were in line with the program theory. Most CBOs implemented their activities on record time except where funding delayed. This was evident in the ability of the CBOs to obtain their monthly / quarterly funding following submission of satisfactory activity reports.

6.2.5 Increased and more effective community participation in program activities

The more community members were exposed to the CBO training and especially to skillful parenting, the more they liked the sessions and the more they attended. Parents who had been trained were reported to have changed their discriminatory practices where they preferred to educate boys to girls. Fathers were adopting practices of family budgets and organizing family meetings to discuss budgets. More involvement of family members in economic decisions of the families was reported. Increased expression of children’s views in families was also becoming common. The practice of “chagulaga” (choose whom you want) reduced. There were reduced child harassments in families. Teachers followed up children who missed school for extended periods like a month and they made the parents to bring them back.

We are proud that the community which was once too rigid to change has now changed. As we move on, the community adopts slowly. And now child harassment issues are reducing because the community is getting educated. The community now fears to harass children because now they know that children have a place to submit their cries. We as Mkombozi feel good when we see the community handling children properly. (Board Mkombozi).

Trained parents communicated more effectively with their children and made adjustments to protect them against risky situations that exposed them to sexual abuse such as collecting firewood in the
evening, fetching water from a far off water sources because they had been alerted to the risky situations in the communities that led to children’s sexual abuses.

6.2.6 There were concrete observable outputs from the implementation of the Initiative
There were observable outputs from the initiative efficiently accounting for the grants. For example, 25 youths who had been supported by RAFIKI graduated from vocational schools and were self-supporting and self-reliant. YWL reached a total of 2000 school children since 2017 with SRHR information. CBOs created over 20 child protection committees and strengthened them over 150 of them to do child protection work. Capacities of government officials were built to be sensitive to child labor and child abuse problems. Children understood their rights and were able to demand for those rights.

It was reported that girls were aware of sexually transmitted diseases; what causes early pregnancies and its consequences. The girls know how to protect themselves. Girls have confidence in themselves and talk freely about themselves; have decision making abilities, take up personal hygiene and care for themselves better. Girls are keeping in school and some students who used to misbehave have changed. Girls who were rescued from early marriage husbands and returned home, school, or vocational training had their social development enhanced. Most female children can at least finish their primary and secondary school education without getting pregnant in some communities.

6.2.7 FF CBO Partners have been able to influence policies and laws through advocacy work
The advocacy work done by CBOs made some impact on existing resource allocation policies for child protection policies in local governments, and inclusion of child protection issues in district council activity agendas. The increase in funding for social welfare services in local government helped to improve child protection service delivery. In a concerted effort with other social activists, FF partner CBOs were able to influence the nullification of the marriage act which allowed girls to marry at 15 years with the consent of the parent contrary to the constitutional provisions.

6.3 Best practices and lessons learnt
- The program theory was well conceived and helped to guide planning and programming by the CBOs. FF’s decision to work with various social systems – the child, the family, the community, and government child protection service structures was also best practice because it addressed all possible sources of child marriage problems.
- Universal organizational development of all the CBOs at the same time, and the individualized approach used to develop and support CBOs was also best practice.
- Training of community facilitators identified from the operational communities is a best practice because it reduced on the threat of CBO staff attrition, ensuring the sustainability of service delivery now and in the future.
- Alignment of the Initiative activities with government policies, programs and strategies ensured sustainability of services to communities. Government should be able to continue to monitor the strengthened child protection committees. The child protection committees shall continue to identify abused children and report them to the department of social welfare; “so the FF investment will go into the future” (FF Program Officer).
Integration of intervention strategies including skillful parenting, life skills, economic strengthening and SRH, advocacy helped a lot in bringing about quick transformation of attitudes, values and behaviors of parents and communities to reduce child marriage.

Use of various methods such as radios, public rallies, coffee joints, saving and credit groups helped in reaching many people with information on the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies and was a best practice.

The combination of intervention strategies – preventive and rescue was a best practice because they complemented each other.

The preventive strategy of the Initiative had less side effects compared to the rescue strategy implying that the next phase may need to emphasize more the former.

Where a program has two arms like this Initiative had – the capacity building and service delivery sub-programs, both needed to be exposed to the same implementation processes and especially the baselines to ease monitoring and impact assessments.

Films were powerful and may be more cost effective in educating and transforming attitudes and practices of masses on social issues like child marriage and pregnancies because they attract and are attended by people of all ages, gender and social economic status.

6.4 Implementation Challenges
This section presents the implementation challenges.

1. Reporting challenges
   a) Hatred of children by parents when the children report abuses in home and failed planned child marriage. The parents threatened to kill the children or bewitch them if they continued to report them to teachers. They even threatened to harm the teachers— (Matron and patron at Mwantini primary school).
   b) Defilement cases involving relatives in homes remain unreported.
   c) Forgery of birth certificates of girls by parents to enable a young girls marry.

2. Challenges relating to the laws
   a) The Marriage Act no. 5 of 1971 especially sect. 13 and 17 which allows the girl at 14 to be married under the consent of the court while 15-17 year olds are allowed to get married under the consent of parents which provisions protect and condone the decisions of the parents. (Program officer AGAPE).
   b) While impregnation of girls under age 14 is taken seriously; but those above are not. They are considered grown-ups. To get litigation done requires obtaining a legal order from the Regional Commissioner.
   c) The government reporting systems of defilement and rape cases was reported to be faulty because it required the victim to first report to the hospital. When a case happened on the weekend, there was loss of evidence because hospitals do not work on weekends.

3. Size of villages and transportation problems
a) Villages are very big. “You can spend a whole day with a land cruiser but you cannot move around a particular village”. A ward has about 6 villages and a village may have 4 sub-locations. Even when CBOs are allocated wards or villages they cannot cover the entire ward or village they purport to be working in. This leaves out many locations within the operational locations uncovered. This becomes problematic because when FF is allocating wards and villages it does not take into consideration the massiveness of the locations. The result is the likelihood of this affecting the impact of the program.

b) Transportation to reach the operational villages was a big problem especially to smaller CBOs such as Mkombozi and PWWCO. These CBO do not have vehicles of their own but use motorcycles also called boda boda for transport to reach distant villages. These are costly. For example a distance of 20km to Idodoma, costs between 5000/= and 10,000/= Tanzanian shilling one way. Some boda boda cyclists abandon them in the field because they cannot wait for them to complete their work. Returning becomes very difficult. The roads become impassable when it rains. Sometimes CBO staff walked 15 kilometers to reach another village.

4. Community participation challenges
   a) Resistance in 4 out of the 6 wards OPE operates in. The resistant wards are Maganzo, Bubiki, Mbinyu, nd Songwa. The transforming wards are Seke Bugoro and Busongwa.
   b) Poor attendance and late arrivals to trainings especially at the beginnings. But over time there were improvements.
   c) Parents’ and guardians’ continued exposure of girls to risky situations such as sending them to markets and shops at night which puts them at risk of sexual abuses and unwanted pregnancies.
   d) Some board members in some CBOs refuse to attend meetings regularly because of failure to meet their demands to be paid.
   e) Tendency for victims and culprits of child marriage and pregnancy cases settling cases outside the court yet the CBO would have started on the police proceedings. Girls deny being pregnant to let the culprit free. Sometimes the girls inform the boy to escape; parents leave the burden of the proceedings to the CBO by failing to appear in courts of law as required; some parents hide their pregnant girls or may shift the home completely. If the case involves a rich and poor family, the rich person buys off the poor and the poor parents shift the girl far. Where a pregnancy involves incest, girls always try to cover up the relative on whom they depend for survival.
   f) Limited time given by economic groups and village community banks to CBO activities – skillful parenting training.
   g) Difficulty to fit CBO school club activities in school timetables.
   h) CBO staff being called derogatory names – “men and women of child marriage” because of CBOs’ efforts to fight child marriage which is perceived as a source of income for some parents.

5. Inadequate and delayed financial resources
a) There are many vulnerable families demanding support with scholastic materials but the CBOs have limited funds. For example, one CBO is able to support 76 children from 2 schools who are given 9 exercise books each, school uniforms etc.

b) The problem of child marriage is enormous in the operational areas and the demand for CBO services is great; but coverage was limited by funding.

c) The delay to provide grants to CBOs in 2017 by 6 months FF reduced on the implementation time making CBOs to implement activities in very limited time which was stressful.

d) Lack of resources to support child protection committees e.g. bicycles, stationary to write reports on.

e) Transportation problem for child protection committees because the areas they serve are wide. Also they need loud speakers for community mobilization. They need stationery such as papers and pen to record child abuse cases and follow up work.

6. Corrupt government officials and politicians
   a) Government officials being corrupt and covering up abuse cases. They fail to follow up cases with the police and lie that they did yet they did not. Police was reported to be corrupt not effectively pursuing reported cases of child marriage, pregnancies and other forms of abuse.
   b) Tendency of politicians at the ward and village level especially those in the opposition parties to frustrate the work of the CBO in communities.
   c) Politicizing CBO work. For example, when you go to some villages or hamlets, leaders of those places will struggle to make sure people recruited as leaders in our initiative were from their political party (Mkombozi board)
   d) Non-availability and minimal participation of village government officials in some communities.

7. Professionalization of CBOs following capacity building and resourcing

Capacity building and resourcing of CBOs created an unintended effect of professionalization and growth leading to loss of the spirit of volunteerism and informality they had at the start.

_They were doing whatever they were doing because of a good heart. But when a huge grant came in, then the members started hating each other. Pressure that was put on the elderly members of the CBOs to produce proposals and reports could be too demanding on them. Everything was done so quickly – identification of CBOs, expression of interest and submitting proposals to CBOs, grant awarding, capacity building, and no time was spent to prepare their mind sets towards the processes._ (FF Program Officer).

8. Lifestyles of people

Some of the families worked with, including the gold miners in Kahama and animal keepers were nomadic who kept moving with children to newly open up mines or grass and water respectively. This nomadic life interrupted child schooling and monitoring the achievements so far attained by the CBOs.
6.5 Emerging child protection needs
This section presents findings relating to emerging child protection needs pointing to some of the problems the FF and her partners could handle in the next phase. This section also presents findings on existing opportunities to handle such problems. The emerging needs were partly felt and expressed needs of the people, needs emerging from the processes of implementing the first phase of initiative; while others were half way met needs. The emerging needs are classified into five groups: a) Emerging Child Protection Challenges and Existing Opportunities at Community Level; b) Emerging issues in capacity building; c) Emerging issues in Direct and indirect service provision; d) Emerging issues in community grant making; e) organizational and management issues such as coverage, scalability of services; reporting, documentation issues, monitoring, organizational learning, Firelight management style.

6.5.1 Emerging Child Protection Challenges and existing opportunities
This section presents emerging child protection challenges, their location, and what is being done about them. It covers issues of child marriage and pregnancy, child labour, poverty and education system needs and problems.

6.5.1.1 Child marriage and pregnancy
Child marriage is still a problem in the rural areas of the region; while teenage pregnancy is more prevalent in the urban areas. Child pregnancies in urban areas were associated more with poor parenting styles and poverty of single parents and grandparents.

Existing opportunities are that CBOs have been trained and have the skills to deliver the necessary services to the rural areas. What they lack are finances to reach the rural locations. Use of contraceptives by youths who are sexually active is permissible to government. Sexually active young people are encouraged to use contraceptives particularly condoms to avoid contracting HIV. According to the quotation below, some children in form one and two were reported to be using contraceptives.

I came across six students from form (senior) one and three who told me that, “madam we use family planning pills and diaphragm”. Most of them are using condoms. Children who are sexually active are advised to use condoms to avoid contracting HIV. And these are available in pharmacies. Family planning and reproductive health are covered as a subjects under a biology and civic courses in a course covered in form 2. The teachers also indicated that most biology teacher text books three and four contain the topic reproductive health (Secondary school matron, Shinyanga Municipality).

Many of the girls in urban areas may be still getting pregnant despite the existing opportunities because of poverty and awareness about family planning services. The Initiative may need to explore the sexuality practices of young people and the causes of unwanted pregnancies in urban areas and address them.

6.5.1.2 Child Labour
Child labour was also reported to be a big child protection problem. Children were forced to work by parents, guardians, school teachers and peers. Sometimes children chose to work because of
poverty and a desire for money. Lack of vision and life goals could also be a cause of child labour. Children worked in family gardens, gold and diamond mines, grazed animals and did exploitative domestic work. A lot of manual work was also given to children in the teachers’ gardens which frustrated children from continuing with studying. Child labour is a pathway to child marriage because by policy if a child has been out of school for 3 months he/she is terminated which makes one vulnerable to child marriage.

Existing opportunities are that the Child Protection Act and the Education Act are supportive of children’s education and indicate the punishments to culprits. The government had also to establish secondary schools in wards taking services nearer the children. The role of the CBOs would be to enforce existing laws while addressing hindrances to school attendance at child and family levels.

6.5.1.3 Poor quality education - a risk factor for early marriage

While education is the best alternative choice to early marriage, its quality is not attractive enough for children to keep in school. Child labour, one of the pathways to child marriage was reportedly perpetuated by poor quality education. Schools were reported to be overcrowded with 300 pupils being taught by one teacher. This constrained teaching and learning leading to demotivation; cognitive, social and emotional withdraw of children and subsequent dropping out of class. Some students were reported to complete primary education without ability to read and write their names. This discouraged parents from keeping their children in school. This was happening in the context where most parents in the region were illiterate because education was introduced in Shinyanga quite recently.

Classrooms in some schools lacked desks and amenities to attract children to keep in school. Some schools lacked latrines, rooms and water for girls to manage their hygiene during menstruation. Improving school infrastructure by engaging communities in school development, have been curtailed by the negative government policy which deters parents from contributing either chairs or desks to government schools. Some schools were still far and children walked long distances.

Some children walk 12 kilometers return journey to (FGD boys Town secondary school)

It was out of this concern that some CPCs were requesting AGAPE to construct their girls a hostel in a secondary school to reduce on walking distances which put girls at risk of sexual abuses and pregnancies.

The infrastructural deficiencies are aggravated by poor attitudes and behaviours of parents, teachers and school inspectors. Some parents bribed head teachers not to enroll their children in school “There are some places where a parent will bribe a teacher by offering a cow so that his child does not get enrolled into school” (Board Member TAI). Parents and communities were powerless to influence the performance of schools and teachers.

If schooling is the alternative to child marriage and child labour, then this option needs to be made more attractive to children. However, parents and local leaders are extremely powerless and not organized to enter into dialogue with
6.5.1.4 Poverty
Poverty was reported to be a big problem particularly in single headed and grand parenting families. Single parent families constituted 67% in urban areas of Shinyanga Municipality. The existence of poverty means that these families cannot meet the needs of children such as bicycles for girls who stay far from schools. Girls who complete primary 7 cannot continue to secondary because of lack of money to buy scholastic materials such as books, pens, and uniforms. Red Cross which used to help poor children with these materials closed in 2017. Keeping out of school is a pathway to child marriage and early pregnancies.

One good opportunity is the government program to provide credit to people who have formed into economic groups. Community development departments are responsible for mobilizing people to form social groups which can then access government loans. All people were not yet members of these savings and credit groups and that is why AGAPE and PWWCO were mobilizing people for this purpose. The entire Initiative could contribute this effort.

6.5.1.5 Sexual abuse of children
There were reported sexual abuses for both girls and boys in homes and schools. Sodomy of young boys by bigger boys was common when they went to graze animals. Normally, when boys were sodomized they kept quiet but developed psychosocial problems. School teachers reported observing mouth fungi among some girls and also boys implying that they also engaged in oral sex with people who had sexually transmitted diseases. Actually other students suffered from other sexually transmitted infections. The initiative had already started working on this.

Some of the culprits were bodabodas and daladalas (bicycle transporters) were used by sex abusers to transport children to culprits. They also engaged in sodomy and physical abuse of children. Sexual abuse was also done by teachers and children themselves. There is also a new problem for girls – witchdoctors advise their clients that to get rich they need to have sex with a virgin girl. These superstitions are abusive of girls. There is, therefore a need to start talking about safety of girls starting early in their lives. There is a need to develop age and gender appropriate SRH messages for different children.

One opportunity is that the Region has already got other NGOs like Tanzania Red Cross working in the areas of SRHR and has been training a few FF partner CBOs in SRHR. The Initiative could build on this and develop a training manual for prevention and treatment of abused women and children. This is an area that the FF partner CBOs need to study and define before they start interventions.

6.5.1.6 Gender based violence
Communities reported the existence of violence in homes and also in schools. Nationally, GBV stands at 78% for married women aged 15-45 years. GBV leads to marital breakdowns and abandonment of
children. GBV was reported to happen around harvest time when men had money. They completely neglect their families leaving the burden of care of children to women alone. Conflicts and fights of parents made some children feel insecure and were mentioned as reasons for failure to attend school. Therefore, GBV may be a pathway for child marriage.

Physical violence in schools took the form of severe beatings of pupils and students. This was contrary to existing policy. Severe beatings of students led to loss of self-confidence and loss of interest in schooling. These problems were reported to community leaders but they never did anything about them. Parents were equally powerless and not organized to enter into dialogue with schools leadership to solve these problems. Teachers connived with children to permit children to go to work in diamond mines and sharing the earned money with teachers.

One important opportunity relating to GBV is that there is already a policy – the National Action Plan to end Violence against Children and Women which spells out how to address the problem. The policy also indicates that implementing agencies need to handle the violence against children and that of women together.

6.5.1.7 Marital breakdowns and abandonment of children
There were increasing breakdowns and separations of marital relationships and families respectively. This problem was associated with early marriages. It resulted in the creation of single headed households a phenomenon which was also associated with child marriage. Many girls who married early obtained inadequate preparations for marital obligations and found themselves unable to cope with adult roles. Normally the young mothers abandoned the children leaving them with the fathers who could also not properly take care of them thus creating another generation of children who are at risk of getting married when they are children. This was reported to be true regardless of the age of the man marrying the young girl.

Single parent homes are characterized by poverty and inability to support their children. Single mothers have limited time to stay with their children, and sometime they are bad models as some engage in prostitution. These environments affect the children negatively leading to early pregnancies. At the same time children do not have life skills to cope with the bad environments. These factors combine to create misbehaviors which leads to school suspensions, school drop-out and child marriage.

A few FF partner CBOs were targeting single mothers. They have already developed the expertise of working with such families and children. The Initiative will build on this experience and the expertise of other NGOs which are have long been working with children from poor single headed families.

6.5.1.8 Other child rights abuses
Children were denied food by step parents and also biological parents when the children made mistakes. Both boys and girls were given heavy in farming and animal keeping families, and corporal punishments. Children were not given an opportunity to express themselves on what they needed or what they wanted to do. Children were still not permitted to express themselves and participate in decision making during problem analysis and solution at family level. Some children were
discriminated against and they did not like it. Children with disability are still hidden in the homes - isolated and discriminated. Children were also abusing drugs to the detriment of their mental and social health.

When children were asked about spaces they feel insecure, they consistently mentioned the bushes existing in their communities. The bushes contained snakes, bees, hyena, and scorpions. They encountered bushes when they went to graze animals and on the way to school.

Some of these problems were effectively being handled by the child protection committees. Nonetheless, CBOs indicated that some CBOs forget the child rights taught them such that they need constant reminders. The CBOs need to be given competences in drug control management and rehabilitation of drug abusers.

6.5.1.9 Unemployment of youths and need for vocational training
Unemployment of young people who are already educated discourages parents from investing in the education. There is need for Vocational skills development for young people to fight the problem of poverty and unemployment. Save the Children Fund was reported to have provided some training covering all the 17 wards of Shinyanga Municipality but could not cover all the children in need of vocational training.

6.5.1.10 Water
Water scarcity is a big problem in the semi-arid areas of Kishapu especially in the areas occupied by the Taturu ethnic groups. In these areas, people and animals share the same water sources. Children take a long time fetching water instead of being in classes. Provision of safe water would reduce the chances of children drinking diseased and keeping out of class.

6.5.2 Emerging issues in capacity building
Capacity building gaps were noted in the following areas:
- Advocacy and lobbying and budget monitoring. FF program manager indicated that the CBOs were soon receiving training from HAKI ELIMU of Tanzania.
- Networking and engagement especially at national level.
- Research – because advocacy cannot be effectively done unless one knows research.
- Documentation of successfully stories. A lot is being done on the ground but the CBOs do not have skills to document them.
- Gender issues of inequality and discrimination

6.5.3 Emerging issues in Direct and indirect service provision
The emerging issues in the direct and service delivery service delivery include:

i. Causes of child marriage not satisfactorily addressed;
ii. The training issues inadequately addressed;
iii. The population groups not satisfactorily reached and served;
iv. Geographical areas not reached;
6.5.3.1 Causes of child marriage not satisfactorily addressed

The following causes of child marriage were reported not to have been adequately addressed:

i. People’s poor mind sets - The strategies used by the Initiative created fear rather than sustained changes in their mind sets.

ii. Addressing cultural norms and traditions of the people.

iii. Poverty

iv. Lack of entrepreneurial skills

v. Communication in families

vi. Internal reporting of sexual abuses by children in homes and schools

vii. Inadequate knowledge of SRHR by children of different ages and gender as well as parents. For example, mothers reported they found it difficult discussing issues of SRHR with boys.

6.5.3.2 Population groups not satisfactorily reached by the Initiative

i. Out of school youths yet these are the most at risk of marrying and getting pregnant early.

ii. Boys – had been left out of school activities. They need to be brought to the same understanding of sexuality issues and development of self-esteem as the girls.

iii. Men minimally participated in the initiative

iv. Middle class socio-economic population groups were not reached with skillful parenting

v. Religious leaders – these need to be provided with skillful parenting so that they can pass this information over to their congregations

vi. Traditional leaders

*Traditional leaders and child marriages move together… They carry out marriages that are not known to government and the religious institutions. They have their own reign. When these “re-known” or “notable elders” (as they are called) as well as the sungusungu (local army/people’s militia) come out to speak something, the whole community listens and respects. These need to be convinced about the badness of child marriage and pregnancies and they became disciples for anti-child marriages (PWWCO BOARD MEMBERS).*

vii. There were still many untrained women groups – these could not access government loans.

viii. Social actions systems like the teachers, police, and social welfare officers

ix. Child protection committees at ward and village levels. “The challenge is that these child protection committees do not master their responsibilities; they do not work as we expect them to work. So more capacity building is needed” (Board member RAFIGIK)

6.5.3.3 Issues not satisfactorily addressed during the awareness creation in communities

i. Capacity building of girls to raise their voices their problems.

ii. SRHR for different ages and gender targeting children in primary and secondary as well as parents.

iii. Gender equality and relations
iv. Train child protection committees at ward and village levels. “The challenge is that these child protection committees do not master their responsibilities; they do not work as we expect them to work. So more capacity building is needed” (Board member RAFIKI)

v. Life skills

vi. Awareness creation and skillful parenting in villages and wards not reached by the Initiative

vii. Corruption

viii. The need for social justice to abused children

6.5.3.4 Service delivery structures – the use of government staff
While the use of government staff to offer certain services to CBO clientele ensured quality; it was also problematic in the sense that it withdrew staff from already understaffed departments. Even if the departments had not been understaffed, withdraw of staff meant denial of the same human resources to the public. The Initiative may need to lobby government to recruit more staff who are able to participate in preventive activities.

6.5.3.5 Poor school infrastructures
There are no toilets, no special rooms for girls to use when they are in their menstrual periods, no water, and it is a national wide problem. These problems exist in both primary and secondary leading to school absenteeism. Some girls still walk long distances to secondary schools which calls for hostels.

6.5.3.6 Corruption by the public and police during the management of victims of child marriage
Police was reported to be corrupt during the management of rescue cases. They seek bribes or are given bribes by parents of the girls asking them not to intervene in their ceremonies. Perpetrators especially from the rich families bribe the police to let the case go.

6.5.3.7 Development of communication technology and systems to enhance reporting of child abuse cases
TAI had an idea of developing telephone/computer applications where messages on parenting were sent to families to discuss when they got time. This could enhance use by men and parents of different social economic statuses.

6.5.4 Program Processes
Emerging needs in program processes include:

i. A need to invest in advocacy activities to streamline the marriage act;

ii. A need to lobby for improved funding of public departments concerned with promoting child protection and general welfare.

iii. A need to conduct a baseline study for each intervention under the service delivery arm

iv. A need to preparing manuals for SRHR and social justice issues

v. A need to develop monitoring tools for service delivery outcomes

vi. A need to undertake a training needs assessment for teachers and police
vii. A need to develop a life skills training manual for secondary skills

6.5.5 Organizational and management issues

6.5.5.1 Villages and wards not yet reached with services by the CBOs

Many villages and wards had not yet been reached with services. These need to be mapped out and included in the program. There is also need to improve the principles used in the deployment of CBOs to operational areas. Some NGOs are small made to offer comprehensive services some of which they may not have not have the capacity. The practice of moving to new villages and wards each year does not create impacts. The need to reach each ward and village is best captured in the quotation below.

*For example, there is a ward called Mwamalasa where the Taturu ethnic group resides. There children who do not go to school but are sent to graze cattle. You find that the parent decided to bribe the Ward Executive Director and the teacher to make sure that the child they do not follow the child when he/she drops out of school because they have to herd animals. These children do not clothe but you find them grazing when naked (Board OPE)*

The current practice of individual CBOs addressing all intervention strategies in a small isolated locations may be costly and less impactful compared to several CBOS working together in the same village/ward or district, with each addressing and being accountable for one or two intervention strategies. This could call for more coordination and integrated planning and management of the Initiative by all the CBOs. Each CBO builds on the efforts of the other in accordance with their comparative advantage and interests. This allows also the government implementation staff to plan and programme better the use of their time because they are not pulled here and there by different CBOS working on the same Initiative.

There is also need to scale out the program to other regions of Tanzania such as Tabora with child marriage rate of 48%.

6.5.5.2 Other management issues

i. CBOs need transport, more staff, and more money.

ii. Need for a full time lawyer and a Monitoring and evaluation officer.

iii. The school club leaders asked for certificate for members leaving after form 4 and those shifting to other schools. The students also want be given identifiers such as T-shirts, badges, certificates and identity cards for easy identification.
CHAPTER SEVEN
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Evaluation Conclusions

7.1.1 Strengths of the program
1. The designed activities were on the whole implemented in accordance with the program theory of change.
2. The preparatory work to guide the design of the capacity building arm of the initiative was well done with the assessment of the organisations development features and abilities to do child protection. The service delivery arm involved undertaking community dialogues to determine sources of children problems and the systems the program had to work with.
3. CBOs implemented most of the activities they planned to undertake at the community family and individual child levels in schools.
4. Capacity building of CBOs was very well done leading to growth and development of the CBOs.
5. Community awareness about the dangers of child marriage and pregnancies attempted to address one important cause of child marriage – social cultural norms and traditions.
6. The communities and parents who attended training sessions and especially skillful parenting appreciated the knowledge and skills given by the CBOs and many tried to apply the learning to their relationships with children and spouses.
7. The CBOs worked well with government departments each cross fertilizing each other.
8. The response strategy to child protection was well justified and was reported to create fear and reduction of child marriages.
9. Child marriage is reported to be decreasing although it is taking on new dimensions.
10. Child marriage was significantly reduced in urban areas but not rural.
11. Urban areas are more affected by child pregnancies.
12. Monitoring and reporting, documentation was taking place using FF monitoring and reporting framework.

7.1.2 Areas not well done
1. Nearly all the CBOs with the exception of AGAPE and TAI did not operationalize the Program outcome of the knowledge development, learning and sharing.
2. No baselines were done for the service delivery sub-program.
3. Poverty as a causative factor of child marriage was not adequately addressed.
4. There are still deficiencies in monitoring of service delivery outcomes by CBOs.
5. The FF partner CBOs handled small geographical locations, undertaking holistic tasks from preventive to treatment of victims of child marriage; working with different client size systems of communities, families, individual children, and government child protection systems. Given the vastness of villages, CBOs spread too much leaving many villages and households in the wards unreached. The smallness of the geographical areas covered and tendency to do all interventions threatened the efficiency and effectiveness of the project.

115
6. The capacity building done for child protection systems and other actions systems was inadequate. More categories and numbers of government workers including the police, teachers, social welfare officers and child protection committees needed more skilling in child protection values and professional practices.

7. While the rescue strategy is important to the initiative it has many flows that threatens the wellbeing of the future of the very mothers and their children whom it purports to protect.

8. The social justice aspects of the response sub-program was too weak and befallen with many challenges.

9. Lack of standardised service packages threatens the attainment of comparable outputs and outcomes.

10. Boys and men did not fully participate in the initiative despite that they are the decision makers in households and who force their daughters to marry and who also marry the girls.

7.2 Evaluation Recommendations

1. The FF needs to operationalize the outcome relating to knowledge development, learning and sharing and design intervention activities for CBOs to implement in the next phase.

   v. FF and partner CBOs must undertake a baseline for the service delivery arm before the next phase to inform the design of future activities

   vi. Standardize tools for monitoring program activities

   vii. Coordinate sharing amongst CBOs

   viii. Do a training needs assessment among teachers in both primary and secondary as well as the police and social welfare officers on competences relating to child protection practice issues and values.

2. Design a coordinated program with standardized packages for different population groups implemented by a consortium of CBOs based on their strengths.

3. Capacity building needs to continue but consciously addressing identified gaps.

4. Granting and sub-granting conditions need to be standardized and streamlined

5. Consolidate current efforts of partners and scale up effective approaches to address root causes of child abuse and neglect.

6. Integrate gender based violence into child protection as required by the new national plan of action.

7. Give priority to training actions systems of teachers, police, social-welfare officers for enhanced participation in the program.

8. Scale up interventions into unserved geographical locations and population groups.

9. Develop interventions to address causal factors of child marriage especially poverty and other behavioral determinants of child marriage that were inadequately addressed in the first phase.
10. Revisit and refine the rescue strategy of managing survivors of child marriage addressing its weaknesses while upholding its strengths.
References

3. Ministry of Health, C.D., Gender, Elderly and Children (MoHCDGEC) [Tanzania Mainland], Ministry of Health (MoH) [Zanzibar], National Bureau of Statistics (NBS), Office of the Chief Government Statistician (OOGS), and ICF., Tanzania Demographic and Health Survey and Malaria Indicator Survey, C.D. Ministry of Health, Gender, Elderly and Children, Editor. 2016, United Republic of Tanzania: Dar es Salaam, Tanzania, and Rockville, Maryland, USA.
28. zanele@firelightfoundation.org, Community Action for Child Rights. 2013, Oak Foundation: Tanzania.
APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: Project Theory of Change for Firelight Foundation Initiative

Desired Impact

- Community based structures are strengthened to protect children's rights including protection from child marriage, sexual exploitation and abuse

Core Outcomes

- Capacity of CBOs developed to respond to child marriages
- Families create a protective environment for actualization of children's rights
- Strengthened linkages with local and government structures

Assumptions

- CBOs utilize FF funding as seed funding and seek other funding
- Dosage is adequate to strengthen vulnerable HHs and HHs utilize services
- Communities will be protective of whistleblowers

Intermediate Outcomes

- Increased CBO funding, improved CBO capacity in programming, improved capacity to mobilize communities
- Children aware of their rights, more children accessing education and health services
- Increased reporting of cases of cases, reduction on incidences of child abuse

Outputs

- Registered CBOs, policies in place
- Families trained on child rights, children sensitized on their rights, vulnerable HHs identified and supported
- Families sensitized by community structures and cases handled

Activities

- Training on resource mobilization, organizational Mgt, onsite support
- Community engagement, community sensitization, rescue and response, skillful parenting and scholastic
- Training of community linkage facilitators and child protection committees

Triggers

- Uncoordinated efforts by CBOS, inability to attract external funding
- Poor access to education and health, Parents not aware of child rights
- Weak community structures to prevent and respond to child abuse

Weakness

- Poor documentation and uncoordinated learning
- Information translated into knowledge, CBOs utilize knowledge for advocacy and learning
- A robust knowledge management and sharing system established, best models

Strengthened linkages with local and government structures
**APPENDIX B: Planned and implemented capacity building activities by the Lead Partners (as from 2015 to 2018)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>INVESTING IN CHILDREN AND THEIR SOCIETIES (ICS)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned capacity building for 2015</td>
<td>Implemented capacity building activities for 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Strategic planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- CBO management and constitutional development and review</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Performance management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Development and implementation of child protection policy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Financial management and policy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Monitoring, evaluation, and learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Fundraising and communication branding</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Networking alliance building</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Project design, planning and management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Child protection systems approach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actual capacity building activities implemented by ICS in 2016</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Repeated the organisational capacity assessments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Strategic planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Program management monitoring, evaluation and learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Child protection policy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Continuous monitoring and support of individual CBOs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- How to strengthen the board, annual planning and reporting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Resource mobilization (i.e. how to follow-up grant applications, different techniques of resource mobilization, (e.g. money versus volunteers)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- How to network with key people, how to market oneself</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Community mapping</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Not retrievable from availed reports

Planned capacity building activities by ICS for 2016

i) Capacity assessment of 3 CBOs

ii) Development of organisational strategic plan
  - Review thematic areas of focus and support CBOs to do strategic planning
  - Train 3 board members from each CBO on strategic planning processes of their organisation

iii) Setting up organisational management systems
  - Train on leadership and support 3 CBOs to set up their board, organisational structure, and define roles and responsibilities clearly
  - Review CBO policy and procedures (HR, Finance and control)
- Support CBOs to develop and set their financial management and control systems
- Follow-up coaching on the application of management systems

iii) Programming and planning
- Workshop with 3 CBOs on program development and project planning
- Support for CBOs to develop annual planning and reporting tools

vi) Understanding current national parenting and child protection frameworks
- Train 3 staff and board members on child protection systems and safeguarding
- Workshop with 11 CBOs on national plan of action to address violence against children, and women
- Train and certify staff and community facilitators on structured skilful parenting program

v) Networking, advocacy and alliance building
- Train on networking and engagement
- Train on social accountability and monitoring
- Exposure visits and facilitate CBOs to engage in advocacy and lobbying initiatives at local and national levels
- Facilitate partner quarterly meetings

iv) Monitoring, documentation and learning
- Workshop with CBOs on documentation of best practices, program results, and lessons learnt
- Documentation of CBOs best practices
- CBOs monitoring, coordination and follow-ups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned capacity building activities for 2017/2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not retrievable from availed reports by ICS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actual capacity building activities implemented by ICS in 2017/2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Trained staff on the new National Plan of Action (2017/18) (ICS please indicate number of people you trained)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Trainings and follow-ups on different topical issues using the newly released guideline on child rights, child protection and case management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Skilful parenting using ICS tool kit</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Support the 4 additional CBOs to develop their own child protection policies  
5. Sensitize Ministry of health and community development about CBO work  
6. Community mobilisers (33) trained and certified on how to mobilise and organise parents into peer groups for parenting skilling, -how to organise community dialogue sessions and how to report back

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGAPE</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Planned capacity building activities by AGAPE for 2016/17</strong></td>
<td><strong>Actual implemented capacity building activities by AGAPE for the Year 2016/2017</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not identifiable from the availed reports</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Project management, Governance,</td>
<td>1. Project management, Governance,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Financial policy and management.</td>
<td>2. Financial policy and management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Human resource policy development; networking with other CBOs.</td>
<td>5. Human resource policy development; networking with other CBOs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Mentoring - coaching CBOs on how to report activities,</td>
<td>6. Mentoring - coaching CBOs on how to report activities,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. How to make activities have tangible impact on the community, and</td>
<td>7. How to make activities have tangible impact on the community, and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. How to work with school clubs;</td>
<td>9. How to work with school clubs;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Annual plans and quarterly reporting</td>
<td>10. Annual plans and quarterly reporting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX C: Modules of the ICS Skilful Parenting Program

The Skilful Parenting Program consisted of 7 Modules:

1. **Family relations**: A dialogue about definition and importance of family in African Society. How (extended)family relations and the relationship between parents/spouses has influence on child development. Highlighting strengths, values and skills at family level,

2. **Roles and responsibilities** of a skillful parent: information about child development stages, children needs and parenting styles, followed by discussing the roles and responsibilities of a skillful parent. Including specific information about the importance of fathers on remaining available, responsive and involved in the parenting process.


4. **Values and discipline**: Information about the importance of positive family values in the parenting process, the differences between discipline and punishment and age specific problem solving. Discipline- how to improve positive behaviour in children and manage challenging behaviour in children.

5. **Communication**: Information about characteristics of a good conversation and 4 c’s of communication in the family (communication, caring, commitment, and common values). How to communicate with children and barriers and solutions to effective communication amongst spouses, between parent and their children.

6. **Child protection**: Information about the different types of abuse and neglect (including child labour), causes of child abuse and neglect. Effects of child abuse and neglect. And myths and misconceptions about child abuse and neglect. Followed about preventing and responding to child abuse and neglect including risk factors at home, school and community. How to reduce risk factors and early signs of abuse/neglect. How to talk to children about abuse and which actions should be taken and by whom. Building resilience and help your children and affected family to cope with abuse.

7. **Family budgeting**: Informing parents (and children) on the importance of family budgeting, the debt burden and how to prioritize and plan expenses. Training and supporting parents on reducing and preventing debt burden. Training and informing parents and children the importance of saving and difficulties of saving, including managing risks and emergencies. Specific attention to communication within the family about money and raising financially responsible children.